RESOLUTION OF ADOPTION

City of Bay City Master Plan
City of Bay City Planning Commission

WHEREAS, the City of Bay City Planning Commission has the responsibility and is empowered by Public Act 33 of 2008, as amended, to make and adopt a Master Plan for the physical development of the City and to amend the Plan as needed, and

WHEREAS, the City of Bay City City Council created the Planning Commission for the proposes stated in Public Act 33 of 2008, as amended, and

WHEREAS, The City of Bay City has retained professional planning consultants to assist the Planning Commission with the technical studies necessary to make a new Master Plan for the City of Bay City, and

WHEREAS, the City of Bay City Planning Commission held a public hearing on its proposed new Master Plan for the City on June 28th, 2017 at the Bay City City Hall, and

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission finds the new Master Plan necessary for the continued development and the appropriate redevelopment of the physical areas of the City,

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, the City of Bay City Planning Commission hereby adopts this Master Plan for the City of Bay City, along with the text, maps, figures, charts, graphs and other descriptive materials contained in the Plan, and

BE IT FURTHER ORDERED, copies of the Master Plan shall be certified to the Bay City City Commission, Bay City DDA, EMCOG, Columbus Avenue and Midland Street Management Boards, Bay County Planning, Bay County Commission, adjacent communities and registered public utility and railroad companies.

Motion by: Chris Girard  
Supported by: Gerald Green

AYES: Seven
NAYS: None
ABSENT: None


Lori Dufresne, President
City of Bay City Planning Commission
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Planning Commission
Lori Dufresne, President
Mary Ewald Sayles, Vice President
William Branigan, Secretary
Gerald Green
Richard Milster
Robert Shea
Chris Girard

City Commission
Kathleen Newsham, Mayor
Larry Elliott, President
Kerice Basmadjian, Vice President
Andrew Niedzinski
Lynn Stamiris
David Terrasi
Brentt Brunner
Jim Irving
John Davidson
Ed Clements

City Manager
Dana Muscott

Planning and Community Development
Steve King, Community Development Director
Terry Moultane, Planning & Zoning Manager

Consultants
Carlisle/Wortman Associates, Inc.

Assistance provided by:
Carlisle/Wortman Associates, Inc.
# Table of Contents

## Introduction

---

## Chapter 1: Community Identity

- **Overview** .......................................................... 1-2
- **Community Perceptions** ........................................ 1-3
- **Community Involvement** ......................................... 1-4
- **Community Partners** ............................................. 1-4
- **Existing Studies and Initiative** .............................. 1-4
- **Public Engagement** ................................................ 1-4
- **Unique/Shared Experience and History** ................... 1-5
- **Celebrate History and Culture** ............................... 1-6
- **Historic Districts** .................................................. 1-6
- **Assets as Community Promotion** ........................... 1-7
- **Communications** .................................................. 1-8
- **Gateways** ............................................................. 1-9
- **Community Identity Strategy** ................................. 1-11

## Chapter 2: Land Use

- **Overview** .......................................................... 2-2
- **Redevelopment Ready** ........................................... 2-2
- **Land Use Pattern** .................................................. 2-3
- **The Riverfront** ..................................................... 2-4
- **Downtown** ........................................................... 2-5
# Table of Contents

## Chapter 3: Housing & Neighborhoods
- **Overview** .................................................................................................................. 3-2
- **Neighborhood History** ................................................................................................. 3-3
- **Housing Stock** ............................................................................................................... 3-4
- **Target Investment Areas** ............................................................................................. 3-6
- **Neighborhood Housing Stock** ..................................................................................... 3-7
- **Rightsizing the Housing Stock** .................................................................................... 3-8
- **Increasing Diversity in Housing Type** ......................................................................... 3-10
- **Accessory Dwelling Units** ............................................................................................ 3-11
- **Neighborhood Pride and Empowerment** .................................................................. 3-12
- **Housing an Aging Population** ..................................................................................... 3-13
- **Housing and Neighborhood Strategies** ....................................................................... 3-15

## Chapter 4: Connections
- **Overview** ..................................................................................................................... 4-1
- **Roadways** ...................................................................................................................... 4-2
- **Bridges** .......................................................................................................................... 4-5
- **Public Transportation** ................................................................................................... 4-6
- **Pedestrian and Bicycle Facilities** ................................................................................ 4-7
- **The Importance of Pedestrian Orientation** ................................................................ 4-8
- **Seniors** .......................................................................................................................... 4-8
- **Pedestrian Oriented Design** .......................................................................................... 4-8
Sidewalks ................................................................. 4-10
Non-Motorized Pathways ........................................ 4-11
Active Transportation ............................................ 4-12
Complete Streets .................................................. 4-13
Contextually Appropriate Complete Streets .......... 4-14
Neighborhood Streets .......................................... 4-15
Connectors ............................................................. 4-16
Urban Mixed Streets .............................................. 4-17
Suburban Commercial Corridors ......................... 4-18
Connection Strategies ........................................... 4-19

Chapter 5: Resiliency .............................................. 5-1
Overview ............................................................... 5-2
Linkages and Modularity ........................................ 5-4
The Adaptive Cycle ................................................ 5-4
What is “Coastal Resiliency”? .............................. 5-6
Slow Variables ....................................................... 5-7
Migration ................................................................. 5-8
Environmental ....................................................... 5-10
Energy ................................................................. 5-14
Economy and Job Creation ................................... 5-15
Resiliency Strategy ................................................ 5-17

Chapter 6: Economic Development ....................... 6-1
Overview ............................................................... 6-2
Where People are Employed ............................... 6-5
Where Dollars are Spent ........................................ 6-7
Recognizing Changing Economy ......................... 6-9
Chapter 7: Recreation & Entertainment

Overview ................................................................. 7-2
Recreation Activities ............................................... 7-3
Resiliency, Recreation and Entertainment .................. 7-4
Bay City Recreation Amenities ................................. 7-5
Events, Fairs and Festivals ....................................... 7-6
Cultural, Shopping and Dining ................................. 7-7
Park Facilities .......................................................... 7-8
Active-Use Park and Sport Facilities ......................... 7-9
Passive-Use Park Facilities ....................................... 7-9
Trails ........................................................................ 7-10
The Importance of Recreation ................................. 7-12
Economy and Business ............................................. 7-13
Ecology and Health .................................................. 7-14
Recreation Partnerships ........................................... 7-18
Recreation and Entertainment Strategy ...................... 7-21
Appendix C: Open House Results

- Station 1: Community Identity ................................................................. C-2
- Station 2: Housing and Neighborhoods .................................................. C-3
- Station 3: Connections ........................................................................... C-4
- Station 4: Environmental Resiliency ......................................................... C-8
- Station 5: Economic Development .......................................................... C-10
- Station 6: Recreation and Entertainment .................................................. C-16

Appendix D: Maps

- Historic Districts ...................................................................................... D-3
- Downtown Vacant Properties ................................................................... D-5
- Future Land Use ....................................................................................... D-7
- Neighborhoods ....................................................................................... D-9
- Target Investment Focus Areas ................................................................. D-11
- Road Classification .................................................................................. D-13
- Non-Motorized ....................................................................................... D-15
- Corridor Plan .......................................................................................... D-17
- Potential Flood Impact Areas .................................................................. D-19
- Trail Recreation & Entertainment Facilities ............................................. D-21
- Recreation & Entertainment Facilities ...................................................... D-23
- Regional Recreation & Trail Facilities ..................................................... D-25
Introduction

Bay City is a unique city with many great assets. Among its greatest are its people and their strong sense of community and loyalty. Though the community has lost population and experienced economic setbacks over the last 50 years, there are strong neighborhoods and dedicated residents and community officials who are committed to the prosperity of the City. Strong partnerships exist between Bay City, Bay County, the Chamber of Commerce, and other community partners including private industry. While there are challenges, Bay City is positioned to become the type of community which is attractive to residents, entrepreneurs, and employers who will help to reposition the community as the strong city that it once was and perhaps one of the most desirable places to locate in the state.

For the region, Bay City represents one of the most vibrant areas with opportunities for recreation, entertainment and the potential for sustained economic growth. The City’s juxtaposition on the Saginaw River provides not only natural beauty, but recreation opportunities and a unique and recognizable physical environment that helps to differentiate it from other areas in the region and the state. The historic buildings in the downtown and traditional neighborhoods provide the building blocks for a highly desirable investment environment for existing and potential residents, as well as small business entrepreneurs who are seeking an urban environment that is consistent with the existing building and housing stock.

However, the community faces challenges in order to realize its potential and secure its position as a prosperous and resilient community both now and into the future. While the Master Plan is a comprehensive document, there are four overarching challenges that have been identified through this planning process, and as such are a principle focus of the strategies identified in this 5 year Master Plan.

The four key opportunities on which the city must focus are:

1. The stabilization of the housing market,
2. Economic development and job creation,
3. The development of a strong sense of place, and
4. Resiliency.

These opportunities have unique individual challenges and specific solutions that must be targeted towards each. At the same time, these topics are inherently interconnected such that successful progress on each front will be required to support the success of each of the other opportunities.

This document is designed to clearly identify the specific issues surrounding these main topics, identify community assets and challenges related to each, and layout a strategic plan through which Bay City will move forward to realize the goals of the community.
Overarching Themes of this Plan

**Stabilization of the Housing Market**
- Focus on strategies identified in the 2016 Housing Study to retain and attract stable home owners.
- Right size housing stock through strategic community policy and investment.
- Diversify housing stock.
- Promote neighborhood beautification through enforcement, empowerment, and an emphasis on community pride.

**Development of a strong sense of place within Bay City**
- Enhance and protect elements of quality place and design throughout the City.
- Promote community assets such as the Saginaw River, parks, historic buildings, downtown, uptown, midtown, and traditional neighborhood design.
- Enhance and promote positive perceptions of Bay City through continued communications efforts aimed internally and externally using community marketing and branding.

**Economic Development and Job Creation**
- Retain and expand existing businesses through investment and support.
- Utilize strategic community investment to create an attractive investment environment.
- Develop a high quality workforce through training and attraction of talent.
- Retain and attract businesses through quality of place and the promotion of community assets.

**Resiliency**
- Introduce variety and redundancy into systems to help reduce the impact of negative events and allow the system to return to its original state. Redundancies can and should be incorporated into virtually any system, including the following:
  - Transportation – alternative methods of transportation, such as non-motorized and mass transit
  - Infrastructure – stormwater, sanitary sewer, energy, and communication systems
  - Housing – variety of housing types and densities
  - Economic development – diversity of business types
  - Land use – mixed use development
How The Plan is Organized
Bay City has not suffered from a lack of planning. The City has been diligent in keeping the Master Plan up to date and periodically conducting other planning studies related to either functional or geographic areas of the City.

While this Master Plan considers the work that has been done, it is designed and organized in an unconventional manner. The traditional approach to master planning is to focus on background data and process rather than the subject matter. An approach that is more effective for a community such as Bay City is a thematic or topical based approach. This plan is more strategic in nature and focuses on:

- Community Identity
- Land Use
- Housing and Neighborhoods
- Connections
- Resiliency
- Recreation and Entertainment
- Economic Development
- Infrastructure

The Plan is also designed to enhance its usability, not only for decision makers, but also to community leaders, residents, and investors. While the document may be used as a whole, each chapter will represent a theme that can be used as a stand-alone policy and informational document.

What is this Master Plan’s true function?
The Plan serves many functions and is to be used in a variety of ways including, but not limited to, the following:

The Master Plan is a general statement of the City’s goals and policies and provides a single, comprehensive view for the community’s future.

The Master Plan will serve as an aid in daily decision-making. The goals and policies outlined in the Master Plan guide city staff, the Planning Commission, and City Commission in their deliberations on zoning, economic development, transportation improvements, capital investment, and other matters relating to land use and development. This will provide a stable, long-term basis for decision-making.

The Master Plan attempts to coordinate public improvements and private development. For example, public investments such as road improvements should be located in areas identified in the Master Plan as having the greatest benefit to the City and its residents.

The Master Plan serves as an educational tool and gives citizens, property owners, developers, and adjacent communities a clear indication of the city’s direction for the future.

The Master Plan provides the statutory foundation upon which zoning decisions are based. The Michigan Zoning Enabling Act (P.A. 110 of 2006, as amended) requires that the zoning ordinance be based on a plan.
Chapter 1
Community Identity
Overview
Community identity is a critical component of Bay City’s transformation. Community identity relates to how the city is perceived both internally and externally. Perceptions about community identity occurs at varying scales.

On a local level, identity relates to how resident view the city, their connection to the community, their connection to history, and often times shared experiences or understanding. On a local level, this may vary depending on resident’s location within the city, their socioeconomic status, their age, their tenure, and how much they are engaged with local or civic activities.

On a regional level, community identity relates to the way people in the Saginaw Bay Region view Bay City. Attitudes toward the city from neighbors will play an important role is the city’s ability to prosper. It is important to understand whether people view the city as a warm and welcoming place or someplace that is to be avoided. Whether either of these perceptions are founded does not matter as Perception will dictate people’s behavior. These perceptions will determine if Bay City is the place people will go for entertainment, shopping, or employment, but most importantly, whether people will consider Bay City as a potential place to locate their home or business.

These regional perception issues are the same on a statewide level, though they can be viewed a little more broadly. On a state level the question may first be, whether or not people are generally aware of Bay City, where it’s located and what kind of community it is. If there is general knowledge, how then do people perceive the community. Is it safe? Are there things to do there? Is there any reason why one would visit?
Community Perceptions

Perceptions about the community start locally. It is of utmost importance that existing residents and business owners in Bay City feel a sense of pride in the community. What is exhibited visually in a community is critical to community perception. There is a three-pronged approach to enhancing the appearance of the community: one is through design/development regulation; the second is through public or private investment; and the third is through maintenance by property owners.

Tools for Improving Perceptions

1. Update design standards for various areas to ensure development is consistent with the existing or intended character of the area. Any new construction should enhance the character of an area. For example, in the Downtown area, design standards must require certain massing, building articulation, and engagement on the ground floor that is consistent with the historic design of the area. New housing in a residential neighborhood should complement the architectural style of the existing homes.

2. Maintain community infrastructure such as roads, sidewalks, street lighting, parks, etc. especially in the most visible areas. Promote community art in public spaces and require/install quality landscape enhancements especially street trees in the public right-of-way. Street trees are an important community beautification element in a residential areas, commercial corridors, as well as the urban core mixed use area.

3. Develop strategies to empower local businesses and homeowners to invest capital and effort into rehab and beautification projects. Identify prime areas where rehab and beautification projects could have the most positive effect on changing attitudes or perceptions and focus efforts on those areas.
Community Involvement

Bay City’s residents have a strong sense of community and loyalty to the city. Even those residents that live in the surrounding region identify with Bay City either because they grew up in town, or Bay City was the regional center where they would go for employment, shopping, or entertainment.

There is a clear sense of commitment and ownership exhibited by members of the Bay City community. Many dedicated community members serve or have served on a variety of commissions, boards, or committees including both elected and appointed governmental positions as well as civic non-profit organizations. The sheer number of commissions, boards, or committees that exist within the city is a testament to the dedication and willingness to provide leadership to the community. In addition, there are private industries who have shown commitment to the city by investing in the community through direct donations, or through the allocation of time from business leaders to participate in community initiatives.

It is evident that there are a great number of people who are interested in the success of the city. One of Bay City’s challenges is to harness commitment and build consensus among the loyal community members who are willing to dedicate their time and resources to such endeavors. The key will be to ensure that there is continuity between efforts, that efforts are not unnecessarily redundant, and that groups are not working against each other. The city has the opportunity to provide leadership, structure, and support across various entities. Working with groups to ensure that there is consistency between goals and strategies will be important. As noted, these groups tend to be working towards the betterment of the city.

Community Partners

Through the Master Plan, the city and partner organizations can generally agree on a shared vision for the future of the community. Many specific goals or particular initiatives may be more in line with one particular entity or organization’s individual mission. In which case, the city must have the foresight to allow that entity or organization to carry out such an initiative while providing leadership and guidance. For example, the CDC’s Citizens District Council may be the best entity to champion neighborhood beautification projects with coordination and support from the city staff, while a business association or individual company might be willing to provide financial support to a multi-modal infrastructure project that will enhance transportation options for employees or consumers.

In other cases, there may be opportunities to help refine or expand the work a particular group does, or even consolidate a number of groups into one. The Downtown Development Authority and the Downtown Management Board, for instance, have some apparent overlaps, while the Midland Street and Columbus Street commercial mixed use areas have management boards. The City should evaluate the structure of such entities to determine where there are redundancies, or inequities and determine if there are better ways to provide support to organizations. There are also broad benefits to these organizations working together.

Existing Studies and Initiative

There are a number of existing studies and documents that have been produced in recent years that identified strategies and proposed projects which are constant with those strategies identified throughout this document. Many of these have led to positive initiatives which have momentum between various partner organizations. One of the strongest examples is the County Road Map to the Future developed in 2014. This document has been the framework for many community partner initiatives and has provided direction and support for many of the strategies in this Master Plan.

The housing study done in 2016 was another of the most influential documents to the strategies in this plan. While the “Road Map” provides more of an overview relating to many topics, the housing study provides more specificity about the needs of the housing market. Both, as well as other background documents have contributed to creating a comprehensive master plan which provides policies and strategies to guide the city.

The city has the opportunity to provide leadership, structure, and support across various entities.
Public Engagement

During the master planning process, there were a number of opportunities for engagement with community members and other stakeholders. Levels of participation demonstrated the city's commitment to planning for the city.

**Stakeholder Meetings:** In the initial stages of the planning process, a series of “stakeholder interviews” were held. Groups of various individuals were invited to speak to the steering committee because they had particular knowledge of, or involvement in, activities related to one or more of the key master plan topics. Through a series of 8 meetings over two days, with over 25 individuals, the initial “Big Ideas” for this plan were developed. The “Big Ideas” document that was presented to the Planning Commission is located in Appendix A.

**Community Engagement Open House:** As part of the public input process, the city hosted a public engagement opportunity designed to receive feedback from the public. The format for the event was an open house with stations that focus on each of the identified Master Plan topics. Each station had activities and were facilitated by planning commissioners and other volunteers. The open house was well attended with more than 70 participants throughout the evening. The feedback received helped to further refine the direction for the plan. The results of the input were summarized and are included in Appendix C.

**Online Comment Map:** Throughout the master planning process, an online comment tool was available on the project website for anyone to provide comments about the various key topics used to frame this document. The tool allowed users to place comments on a map that others could see and respond to. Comments from this tool were used to help identify particular community issues. All the comments are provided in the Appendix B.
Unique/Shared Experience and History
Bay City has historic roots. The city was first established in 1837 and incorporated in 1865. While the community grew, it was originally known as lower Saginaw, but quickly established its own identity as the population and wealth of the community increased. Because of the deep waters of the Saginaw River and the proximity to Saginaw Bay, economic growth was rapid. This was due to development of a number of industries which relied on the river, including lumbering, milling, and shipbuilding.

Bay City has a strong connection to its history. When talking to community members, it is clear that there are common understandings about the community's past including industries that helped to build the city along the way and even the recollection of recognized names of various neighborhoods that grew around certain cultures or industries. Community members also seem to have shared recollection about various past events and commonly shared attitude about a variety of issues. For better or for worse, community members seem to hold onto these general understandings, which in some ways helps to bind the community. As situations improve, any negative perceptions that might persist can collectively change as well.

Additionally, there are certain experiences that are unique to a community like Bay City. Being “stopped by a boat” is a common and forgivable reason for being late to an appointment or meeting. Racing to the next bridge before it opens to let a boat pass is an example of a shared experience that is relatively unique to locals in the area.

Celebrate History and Culture
It is important to maintain a connection to Bay City’s historic roots. The City's history is clearly part of what makes the community unique and should be celebrated.

It is evident that these roots are important to the community. This is exemplified in a number of ways. Perhaps most prominent, is the preservation and restoration of City Hall which was built in 1897. Most recently, after a fire in 2010, the City elected to restore the building which received an award for the work from the Michigan Historic Preservation Network. This is after a decision not to tear the building down in 1977 based on support from the community. This beautiful turn of the century architectural gem stands as a testament to the City’s commitment to its heritage.

Next door to City Hall is the Bay County Historical Society and the Historical Museum of Bay County. The mission of the Bay County Historical Society is to preserve the history of Bay County and to develop facilities and programs dedicated to the enhancement, enrichment and enjoyment of our community.

It is important that the city support and maintain opportunities that provide connections to its culture and heritage. These are aspects of the community that make it truly unique and set it apart from other communities in the region and the state.
Historic Districts

In Bay City, there are three historic districts including the Downtown Historic District and the Midland Street Historic District, which both include commercial buildings only, and the Center Avenue Historic District. Previously, the Center Avenue Historic District encompassed primarily historic residential structures along the corridor. In 2011, the Avenue district was expanded to incorporate more structures in downtown that were not within the existing Downtown district. The boundaries were expanded to mimic the boundaries of the National Register of Historic Places listing. The district now includes more than 900 structures.

The preservation of historic buildings maintains a visual connection to the city’s culture and heritage. The preserved historic architecture enhances the unique character of the City. Further, it is these historic structures that provide the backbone for the built environment of the urban core areas. Studies show that structures within historic preservation districts more readily maintain or increase in their value. Extensive studies of both the Midland Street and Center Avenue districts were performed in 2011.

Maritimes History

The USS Edison, a Forrest Sherman-class destroyer of the United States Navy, is docked on the western shore of the Saginaw River just downstream of the Independence bridge and is used as the Saginaw Valley Naval Ship Museum. The ship serves as a testament to the City’s ship building industry, which, in addition to building ships that traversed the great lakes also provided ships to the US Navy for decades.

In addition to the museum, the City regularly hosts the Tall Ships Celebration which provides an opportunity for residents and visitors to experience historic maritime culture through an exciting community event. This event allows the community to showcase some of its greatest cultural attributes.
Assets as Community Promotion
Bay City has a number of community assets which are discussed throughout this document. These assets are the basic tools of placemaking the City can use to help shape perceptions about the City. Such perceptions are critical to the retention and attraction of residents and businesses. It is vitally important that Bay City’s assets are highlighted and communicated to a variety of audiences. As people hear the message about the qualities Bay City has to offer, it will either help to solidify positive perceptions about the community, reverse negative perceptions, or create a positive awareness where none existed before. The message should be promoted locally, within the region, and statewide. Presenting the message in a variety of different formats will ensure it reaches all audiences.

Marketing and Branding
Developing a strong marketing campaign for the City is essential to a successful renaissance for the City. The City must ensure there are consistent messages and themes between all entities. First and foremost, all organizations promoting either part or all of the City should be in agreement on a consistent and coordinated message.

Using consistent color schemes in promotional materials, consistent community icons, and communicating the same words or phrases are all important. The message must identify and promote/celebrate positive aspects of the community such as the river, historic buildings, history and culture, parks, nearby recreation opportunities, traditional neighborhood design, festivals, and the development/redevelopment opportunities presented in the urban core areas including downtown, uptown, Midland Street, and Columbus Avenue. The specific content may vary depending on the audience, but should be coordinated in order to have the same general message and theme.

Communications
There are multiple entities who are already engaged in the promotion of the City, including the City Government, the DDA, the DMB, the Chamber, Bay Futures, and various other non-profits. These groups should work together to make sure resources are efficiently being allocated in a strategic manner. Efforts by different entities should not be duplicated. Efforts by different entities should never be competing. In order for the message of the City to be clearly communicated there must be oversight. The City must determine who has the best capacity to manage the message and to work with all the entities engaged in such efforts to ensure consistency.

In general the message that is being presented to various commissions, boards, and committees must be the same message that is being communicated to the public at large both locally, regionally, and statewide. Communications from the Bay City or other entities that are acting on behalf of the City to promote the community must be consistent. It is of critical importance for the City to tell its story instead of letting it be told by someone else. The City has the ability to manage communications though a designated communication liaison.

Communications may come in a variety of different forms, including emails, fliers, multiple websites, even radio or television spots. After developing a clear marketing material, target audiences must be identified, and determinations must be made about the most effective way to present the City’s message. The key to this approach is cooperation and coordination between all entities engaged in promotion of the City.

Community assets generally include:

- The historic urban core areas such as Downtown and Midland Street whose vibrancies will continue to grow.
- The developing Uptown area.
- Traditional neighborhood design.
- Existing and developing non-motorized trail systems.
- Numerous parks and recreation opportunities.
- The Saginaw River which is a focal point of the city.
- Regional institutions such as hospitals or county facilities.
Gateways

Bay City shares common borders with Essexville and the townships of Bangor, Frankenlust, Hampton, Merritt, Monitor, and Portsmouth. How is the city set apart from the surrounding areas? Is it possible to stumble across the border between one of the neighboring townships and the City without noticing? In order to ensure that people feel being in Bay City is a unique experience, the City should strive to demonstrate a distinct change between one side of the road and the other.

Entryway features such as welcomes signs are a simple solution. In some places these signs have been installed. These signs can be enhanced to be stronger gateway features with strategic placement, landscaping and even consideration for the massing of the sign or entryway feature. Iconic community symbols should be used consistently. The City has incorporated a mast like structure into existing getaway signs as well as internal wayfinding signs. Consistency in design and colors for any new signs will be important to provide continuity. Such gateway signs should be in a prominent place and clearly designate when you are entering the City of Bay City.

Thomas Street may be the most utilized entryway to the community. At this location there are three signs that could be considered gateway signs. The sign on the left side of the road is the sign that most exemplifies the concept described here. A closer view of this sign is shown here to the left. However, the sign is not within the City boundaries, and is somewhat lost in the clutter of other signs. Ideally, this sign would be located where the green highway sign is located in order to be most effective.

Gateway signs would be appropriate at all entryways into the city. This could include roadways, pathways and blueways. Not all signs would need to be at the same scale. Smaller signs that still incorporate the same design elements could be installed at gateways from nonmotorized paths and less utilized roadways. Based on the type of gateway, the city could determine appropriate scale and location for each gateway sign.
Community Identity Strategy

The strategies related to Community Identity have been derived from the planning process including public input, the evaluation of community and regional perceptions, and best practices. Primarily these strategies are based on the Community Identity policies identified in this chapter.

1. Promote buy-in of public policies – The City must vet the policies identified in this document with public policy makers in local and regional agencies involved with Bay City, and partner organizations. Part of this effort is to demonstrate how community policies manifest in the achievement of the Communities vision and goals in order to promote buy-in amongst the public and decision makers.

2. Provide Leadership - The City should play a leadership role with all groups who are engaged in the betterment or promotion of the City as a means to maintain continuity between the various efforts and initiatives. While the City does not have to lead each effort, the City is in the best position to provide coordination and oversight.

The City must evaluate the work of various agencies and organizations in order to guide efforts to ensure that the work being done is consistent with community goals, is not redundant or contradictory, and help to promote the best organization for each task.

3. Promote Unique Community Assets – The City must support efforts that are aimed at the promotion and protection of elements that make the community unique such as the river or historic and cultural elements. Efforts should include such strategies that preserve the riverfront, protect historic districts, or support the Historical Society.

4. Develop a Marketing and Branding Campaign – Bay City must identify the community assets they would like to use to promote various aspects of the City and ensure that messaging is consistent throughout all city departments, commissions, and committees. The City’s message must use consistent language as well as design. The designation of a communications liaison to coordinate this effort internally and with all outside groups will be critical.

5. Maintain Effective Communication – Provide multiple communication techniques to ensure that information is available to community members locally, as well as to larger regional and statewide audiences. Communications must be able to go both ways. Citizens must have ample ways to communicate concerns, ideas, or to participate in the public process.
Chapter 2
Land Use
Overview

The land use patterns in Bay City are clearly established. The basic structural layout of the City is the product of the Saginaw River, the age of the City, and the time in which it grew. The City is centered around the river which was the source of prosperity for the region. Shipyards and other industrial uses relied on the river as a source of transportation for raw material and products located immediately along the river bank. So too did the centers of commerce; the downtowns for both Bay City and West Bay City. Residential neighborhoods within walking distances surrounded these land uses.

As the City grew, this pattern continued with neighborhoods expanding farther from the center of town, albeit remaining fairly compact. In the mid-20th century, suburban style commercial land uses developed around the periphery utilizing available land and providing services for the developing townships surrounding the City.

Redevelopment Ready

This chapter identifies area that are prime targets for redevelopment. Through the implementation of strategies identified throughout this document related to strategic community investment in placemaking, workforce enhancement, or economic gardening, as well as strategies in this chapter relating to development code updates, the City will be primed for new private development opportunities.

The existing development patterns within the City’s core is a positive community attribute that should be maintained.

Traditional neighborhood design is conducive to promoting walkability between different areas in the City.

The City recognizes the river as a community asset that is not only visually attractive to residents, businesses owners, and visitors, it can provide functionality for recreation as well as stormwater treatment and storage. It is important to protect the land around the river for such public good.

Urban core areas such as Downtown, Midland Street, and mixed use corridors create the framework for the City.

Structures that have quality design and substantial long-lasting building materials have a more sustainable future.

Bay City supports infill projects that are consistent in character and scale to the existing built environment.

Innovative development codes and design regulations will help to provide development and redevelopment opportunities within different land use areas while protecting the existing and intended character of the City.

Land Use Policies

The existing development patterns within the City’s core is a positive community attribute that should be maintained.

Traditional neighborhood design is conducive to promoting walkability between different areas in the City.

The City recognizes the river as a community asset that is not only visually attractive to residents, businesses owners, and visitors, it can provide functionality for recreation as well as stormwater treatment and storage. It is important to protect the land around the river for such public good.

Urban core areas such as Downtown, Midland Street, and mixed use corridors create the framework for the City.

Structures that have quality design and substantial long-lasting building materials have a more sustainable future.

Bay City supports infill projects that are consistent in character and scale to the existing built environment.

Innovative development codes and design regulations will help to provide development and redevelopment opportunities within different land use areas while protecting the existing and intended character of the City.
Land Use Pattern

There are many positive attributes to the layout of land uses within the City boundaries. The City’s compact design and age of development have led to traditional style neighborhoods, a walkable grid pattern of streets, and the proximity of residential neighborhood to local commercial and recreational opportunities. These are desirable attributes as urban living is experiencing a renaissance in the United States. These represent land use patterns that other communities are attempting to replicate.

Bay City is basically built out in terms of developed land within the city limits. New development will happen in the form of infill and redevelopment. While the general pattern is set, the City has started taking steps to allow for, and encourage, the redevelopment of some areas. This is especially true of the industrial uses along the river. This has been an important effort to realize the community benefits to having residential, commercial, and recreational uses along the banks.

The City recognizes the river as a community asset that can attract residents and new businesses. Additionally, the City is recognizing that the urban core areas and traditional neighborhoods are, or could be, attractive community assets which provide unique urban experiences that are not available in all other communities in the region.

In order to capitalize on these community assets, the City does not need a wholesale change to the land use pattern, with the exception of the reclamation of the waterfront from industrial uses, but more of a refinement of land use regulations and a focus of investment into areas where redevelopment will benefit the community. For these efforts there are three main areas of focus; the riverfront, urban centers and urban mixed use corridors, and traditional residential neighborhoods surrounding these areas.
**The Riverfront**

There are a number of great examples of efforts that have been made by the City and private investors to redevelop the area around the river for uses other than industrial facilities which historically dominated the riverfront. Generally, much of the industrial use along the river has been phased out of the City. Much work has been done by the City to maintain or reestablish open space along the river. This is important to not only allow for public access to the river banks for recreation and enjoyment by all, but also provides an important buffer in severe weather events.

Open space along the river, especially in flood plains, can eliminate property damage during flooding conditions. Additionally, open space used as park land or as natural preserve area can allow space for stormwater facilities to be used for storage and purification before runoff enters the river. As new developments occur along the river it will be important to maintain public access in proximity to the banks as well as preserve open space to mitigate impacts during severe weather events and to prove space for stormwater facilities.

Of the private development and redevelopment that has happened along the river, not all have maintained public access along the river banks. This must be built into development requirements in the future. The Uptown development is a prime example of a public/private endeavor that has produced economically viable land use, as well as public access to the river. While there was a PUD established for this development, the kinds of development standards that were required for this development could be applied to other land along the river front.

The preservation of public space along the river in front of the Uptown development is a great example.

Open Green space along the river includes a pathway.

A public plaza along the river is the center piece of Uptown.

While the Boathouse condominiums are a beautiful example of adaptive reuse, there is no public access along the river.
Downtown

Long term stability in areas in or around downtown and similar urban nodes like Midland Street, or even neighborhood commercial corridors, is synonymous with long lasting high quality buildings. Multiple story mixed use buildings provide for diversity in land use. With flexible space and use regulations the City can rely on the market to produce a mixture of uses that are mutually supportive.

Developments rely more on form than use, when combined with quality design and substantial long-lasting building materials, such as brick or stone, have a more sustainable future. These structures can be repurposed as markets change. These structures tend to produce higher sustained taxable values, which in turn help to support the City’s ability to maintain high quality infrastructure and services in those areas. Many newer single-use commercial structures are not easily adaptable as they are typically designed for one specific proprietary use. If the original tenant vacates the structure, such structures often become obsolete and remain vacant or poorly reused.

The developable land in or around these areas, especially the downtown, is far too valuable to allow single story suburban style development. Communities spend decades trying to reverse such development in favor of buildings that maximize the use of urban space and support the character of such spaces. Multi-story buildings that are architecturally designed as part of the urban core can provide for an atmosphere that is exciting and intriguing. If the design is done correctly, with consideration for accessibility and integration with the streets, especially the pedestrian realm, such buildings will encourage walkability and activity on the street in these areas.
**Opportunity Sites**

There are a number of lots, block or vacant buildings in or around the urban core areas that are prime for infill development or adaptive reuse of buildings. These “opportunity sites” exist in the form of vacant land, surface parking lots or existing empty buildings that could be redeveloped. The development or redevelopment of this land will increase the taxable value of land within the City and help support an active and vibrant environment in the most visible areas of the community. These sites range in size from the largest at roughly 6 acres along the river front, which could support a substantial development, to a 40,000 square foot infill lot in the middle of a downtown block that could support a single building. Additionally, there are a number of buildings that are vacant or under-utilized.

The City’s ability to create an investment environment in these areas will help to market these sites. Successful development of opportunity sites or rehabilitation of existing buildings will be important examples in projecting the viability of such projects to investors.

The City must promote these opportunities by supporting investors and developers with interest in quality projects, marketing the opportunity sites, streamlining the review and approval process, and showing commitment to such areas by investing in infrastructure that would support such projects. Additionally, Bay City must ensure that the appropriate development regulations are in place to ensure any new development assumes the appropriate form necessary to complement the existing structures and desired character in the urban core areas.

The map on this page uses downtown as an example, though there are many similar opportunity site in the other urban core areas that would be appropriate to promote in the same fashion.
Form-Based Codes

Form-based codes focus on physical form as the organizing element of regulation. Building types and dimensions, building and parking location, and the relationship of building façades to the public realm are all elements of physical form that are considered when crafting a Form-based code. Under conventional zoning, land use is regulated by districts often segregating uses that may otherwise be compatible. Use regulations in the form-based code recognize that building forms can accommodate a variety of uses. Therefore, uses are organized by broader use groups, which are groupings or categorization of compatible uses which exhibit similar characteristics. Because the district is more permissive and buildings are designed and located in such a way to accommodate more uses, these developments tend to be more sustainable as they are more easily adapted to new uses in the future.

Form-based regulations that relate to the context, in which they are applied, are based on three main factors: street type, site type, and building form. Site context is derived from existing and desired characteristics of the area where these regulations are applied. Areas are distinguished from one another by their size and configuration, street patterns, location, and intensity of use. Site context requires a customized approach to each project. Building form addresses the manner in which buildings and structures relate to their lots, to other buildings, and to the street. Building form standards control height, placement, building configuration, parking location, and other design factors. In conventional districts, building form and placement is dictated by minimum setback and height requirements. Form-based codes require greater analysis of the size, shape and dimensions of each property at the time a code is adopted.

In conventional districts, application of design standards is reactive rather than proactive. A great deal is left to chance during the review process. Most of the design standards are intended to offset a nuisance, rather than achieve a visual improvement. With conventional codes, there is a lack of consistency between sites, since each site is reviewed individually over different periods of time. Form-based codes devote greater attention to design detail. As with building form and placement, form-based codes tend to be more detailed as to the nature and location of design improvements. Form-based codes do not dictate specific architectural styles, but rather specify desired outcomes as a result of building and site design. For example, if the City is looking for certain on-site improvements that would enhance the pedestrian atmosphere, those would be reflected in the design standards. In addition to building location, most form based codes require some degree of ground floor transparency or “activation” to make the pedestrian atmosphere more engaging.

Existing vacant lot or “opportunity site” downtown

Redevelopment using a form based code
Residential Neighborhoods

In addition to right sizing the stock of homes in the City as discussed in the 2016 housing study, certain neighborhoods would benefit from housing diversity allowing for additional choices within traditional neighborhoods. This goes beyond modernized single family homes with larger kitchens and additional bathrooms. Integrating townhomes, duplexes, fourplexes, and even low-rise apartments in appropriate locations in traditional single-family neighborhoods can increase the viability of existing neighborhoods.

In the past, residents have expressed concerns about adding denser housing types, such as attached single family, two-family, or multiple family residential within the existing single family residential neighborhoods. However, such housing may be considered appropriate in traditional single family neighborhoods if such housing is built at the right scale, using appropriate architectural styles and can be integrated in to the neighborhood framework. This may not be appropriate citywide, but in the near downtown neighborhoods, those neighborhoods surrounding Midland Street, or adjacent to urban neighborhood commercial corridors a mix of housing types would be advantageous.

Housing issues are discussed more extensively in the following chapter on Housing and Neighborhoods.
Future Land Use
The future land use plan builds upon the existing land use patterns in the City. This plan does not represent wholesale changes of land use areas. It also does not deviate much from the future land use plan in the previous master plan or from the existing zoning for that matter. Primarily, this plan is much more focused on the reclamation of open space along the river and the refinement of use regulations in urban core areas and mixed use corridors. The success of this future land use plan relies heavily on subsequent updates to the use and development regulations in the City’s Zoning Ordinance.

Riverfront
While there are additional areas along the river that are depicted in the Future Land Use Plan as park and open space, the key strategy to protect the riverfront will be to update the zoning Ordinance to require the preservation of land along the river within any private development. This land must be either maintained as natural open space, developed as public parks or plaza, or designed as innovative stormwater features.

Residential neighborhoods
A mixed density overlay is proposed for areas that are in close proximity to walkable destinations or could be served by a more robust multi-modal transportation system. The language in the Zoning Ordinance must be carefully designed to ensure that any infill of multi-unit developments into existing single family neighborhoods is done with a design and at a scale that is consistent with the existing or intended character of the neighborhood.

Urban from Mixed Use
This designation is intended for existing urban core nodes and corridors. This area will require a zoning tool, such as form-based code, that preserves and enhances the character of these areas by requiring design and massing standards that match the traditional historic design of an urban mixed use area.
### Zoning Plan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Future land Use Category</th>
<th>Use Description</th>
<th>Density / Scale</th>
<th>Key Characteristics</th>
<th>Zoning Category</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Single Family Residential</td>
<td><strong>Primary:</strong> Single-family detached homes. <strong>Secondary:</strong> Accessory dwelling units, parks, greenways, recreation, community gardens, schools, places of worship, and other complementary uses.</td>
<td>5 housing units per acre. Small buildings. Low density.</td>
<td>Includes neighborhoods (of all ages) that are comprised predominantly of single-family detached homes. A well-defined pattern of blocks and direct pedestrian and bicycle connections provides residents with direct access to nearby services and amenities.</td>
<td>R-1, Single Family</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed Density Overlay</td>
<td><strong>Primary:</strong> Single-family detached homes bungalow courts, townhomes, duplexes, quadplexes, and midrise apartments. <strong>Secondary:</strong> Accessory dwelling units, parks, greenways, recreation, community gardens, schools, places of worship, and other complementary uses.</td>
<td>5-20 housing units per acre. Small to medium buildings. Low to medium density.</td>
<td>Provide a mix of one and two family housing options within close proximity to services and amenities. Serves as additional housing choice in the single family neighborhood to provide additional density near urban core areas. Developed at the scale and design style consistent with the single family neighborhood.</td>
<td>New Overlay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiple Family Residential</td>
<td><strong>Primary:</strong> Multifamily apartments or condominiums. <strong>Secondary:</strong> Townhomes or duplexes, retail, restaurants, public facilities, senior services, parks, recreation facilities, community gardens, schools, and places of worship.</td>
<td>21 or more housing units per acre. Medium to large buildings. Medium to high density.</td>
<td>Mix of higher density housing types located in areas that are proximate to retail, health and human services, schools, parks, employment, and public transit. Offers a transition between Mixed Density Overlay and higher density corridors.</td>
<td>RM-1, Medium Density Residential</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufactured Housing</td>
<td>Manufactured housing</td>
<td>8 units per acre. Small buildings. Low density</td>
<td>Single-family housing laid out in a structured arrangement.</td>
<td>RMH, Mobile Home</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neighborhood Commercial</td>
<td><strong>Primary:</strong> Retail, commercial, business and professional uses intended to serve the residents of surrounding neighborhoods. <strong>Secondary:</strong> Townhomes, small scale multi-family apartment or condominiums, restaurants, specialty stores, professional offices, health services, public facilities, as well as plazas, squares, pocket parks, and other community gathering spaces.</td>
<td>2.5 stories. Small to medium buildings. Low to medium density.</td>
<td>Offer a mix of supporting services and small-scale commercial/retail uses for surrounding residential neighborhoods. Multiple Family Residential uses are typically of a smaller scale and lower density than those found in Commercial and as part of Urban Form Mixed Use, particularly where they abut a single family neighborhood.</td>
<td>C-1, Neighborhood Business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commercial</td>
<td><strong>Primary:</strong> Large format retail, restaurant, and similar entertainment uses that attract visitors from around the City and region. <strong>Secondary:</strong> Office, public facilities (primary or satellite facilities), medical and other supporting non-residential and employment uses, high density apartments and condominiums, as well as plazas, squares, pocket parks, community gardens, and other gathering spaces.</td>
<td>3 stories. Medium to large buildings. Medium to high density.</td>
<td>Serve the commercial and retail needs of the City and region, while also providing high density housing and employment options in close proximity to transit and other services. Targeted infill and/or redevelopment in existing Regional Centers is encouraged to reduce surface parking, promote a broader mix of uses, create gathering places for people, and accommodate higher density, pedestrian, and transit supportive uses over time. While Commercial areas may be largely auto-oriented today, future development should be designed to support existing/future transit.</td>
<td>C-2-A, General Business</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Zoning Plan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Future land Use Category</th>
<th>Use</th>
<th>Density / Scale</th>
<th>Key Characteristics</th>
<th>Zoning Category</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Urban Form Mixed Use</strong></td>
<td><strong>Primary:</strong> A mix of commercial, retail, professional offices, medium to high density residential, and service oriented uses. <strong>Secondary:</strong> Civic and government uses, as well as plazas, squares, pocket parks, community gardens, and other gathering spaces.</td>
<td>Maximum 4 or 5 stories. Medium to large buildings. High density.</td>
<td>The unique and historic character of downtown is protected through the preservation, rehabilitation, or adaptive reuse of historic structures. Higher-density pedestrian and transit-oriented development is encouraged to promote ongoing revitalization efforts and to expand housing options over time. Well-served by transit (existing/planned) making it easily accessible from other parts of the City and region.</td>
<td>New Form Based Code</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Institutional</strong></td>
<td>Schools, government offices, fair grounds, community centers, libraries, hospitals, and cemeteries. Also includes facilities needed for essential public services such as electrical substations, water and wastewater facilities, and other similar uses.</td>
<td>Varies by type of facility.</td>
<td>Typically provided by public entities such as the City, counties, or special districts, but can also include quasi-public or private entities.</td>
<td>New Institutional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Light Industrial / Research</strong></td>
<td>Light manufacturing, assembly, processing distribution uses, and research facilities with no external off-site impacts</td>
<td>Height 35 feet maximum. Small to medium buildings. Low to medium density.</td>
<td>Relatively low intensity land uses usually consisting of clean office or low intensity production facilities.</td>
<td>M-1, Light Industrial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>General Industrial</strong></td>
<td>Manufacturing and assembly operations, material production and processing, and other industrial uses that produce noise, dust, vibration and other impacts that are typically incompatible with less intense land uses.</td>
<td>Height 75 feet maximum. Medium to large buildings. Medium to high density.</td>
<td>Heavy use of manufacturing and production.</td>
<td>M-2, General Industrial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Marina</strong></td>
<td>Water oriented and recreational and boating facilities and accessory retail and service uses.</td>
<td>2 Stories maximum. Small buildings. Low density.</td>
<td>Promoting recreation on the waterfront and preserving natural features.</td>
<td>WF, Waterfront</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Special Waterfront District</strong></td>
<td>A mix of the following: Water oriented and recreational and boating facilities and accessory retail and service uses. Multiple family housing, retail, restaurants, parks, open space</td>
<td>3 Stories. Small to medium buildings. Medium to high density.</td>
<td>Focus on integrating the waterfront with mixed use developments. Planned unit development zoning will probably be the preferred regulatory tool to permit development of the district in accordance with an overall development plan for the entire district.</td>
<td>PUD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Parks &amp; Open Space</strong></td>
<td>Parks, open space, greenways, natural areas, golf courses, and agriculture lands preserved through conservation easements or other mechanisms.</td>
<td>Varies.</td>
<td>Provides for the active and passive recreational needs of the community and protects the scenic and environmental quality of sensitive natural areas. Generally owned by public agencies (city, county, state, or federal).</td>
<td>Park/Open space (publicly or privately owned)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Land Use Strategy

The strategies related to Land Use have been derived from the planning process including public input, the evaluation of existing land use patterns, community vision, available and plan transportation facilities, and best practices. Primarily these strategies are based on the Community Identity policies identified in this chapter.

1. Maintain existing development pattern - The existing street grid and block pattern are the foundation upon which future development and redevelopment should be built. This pattern should be maintained and expand upon.

2. Uphold community policies and regulations - Remain diligent in adhering to the Future Land Use Plan and the Zoning Map. Decision makers and administrators must uphold the City’s land use policies and development regulations.

3. Protect the riverfront – Maintain existing zoning districts along the river that protect open space and public access to the river. Develop stronger language for new development that requires the protection and preservation of open space that is accessible to the public. Such space could also be used for innovative stormwater facilities but should still maintain a public pathway at a minimum.

4. Protect the historic urban core areas – Ensure that historic districts are protecting existing significant historic structures. Districts may need to be evaluated to ensure they are the right size to be effective. Apply zoning regulations that require new infill development that is consistent in massing and design to the existing structures in the urban core areas.

5. Promote the development of opportunity sites downtown and other infill areas – Create an investment environment that is attractive to developers and entrepreneurs by investing public dollars in infrastructure that supports the downtown. This could include transportation improvements, utility upgrades, and street scape beautification. The City can take an active role in marketing such sites or work with the DDA or other partner organizations to do so.

6. Update Zoning Codes – Develop a form based code for the urban core areas that will ensure new development in critical areas is consistent with the existing or intended character of the area. Develop regulations for an overlay district in single family neighborhoods that allow for the integration of multi-unit structures which are consistent with the style and scale of the neighborhood.
Overview

Housing and Neighborhoods relate to the home in which you live, the land, houses, and other buildings around your home, and the people with whom you engage in that area. A neighborhood includes the block where your house or apartment is located, the park down the street, the local school, the place where you work, the stores where you shop, or places where you and other members of the community gather to worship or socialize.

Neighborhoods exist at different scales throughout Bay City depending on the context in which housing is located. Some neighborhoods exist in denser urban areas where housing is accommodated in apartments or condominiums in multifamily buildings, flats on the upper stories of mixed use buildings, and townhomes. These denser neighborhoods are primarily in areas in or around downtown, the Midland Street area, and the developing uptown area.

However, the predominant neighborhood type in Bay City is the traditional single-family neighborhood. The bulk of the City’s development is single-family neighborhoods which are by and large very similar to each other in design composition. In fact, much of the stock of housing in the City was developed during the same era where the housing market produced a relatively homogeneous housing type. This resulted in substantial portions of the housing stock being very similar in terms of age and amenities. There are, however, some neighborhoods such as the Center Avenue Historic district that have unique and particularly desirable, well-maintained historic houses.

Housing Policies

Stabilizing the City’s failing housing market is imperative to City’s recovery based on the 2016 Housing Study.

Bay City’s housing stock is a key component to the attractiveness of the City and the ability to attract and retain a diverse community.

Bay City must have quality neighborhoods that are attractive to existing or potential residents.

Intervention in the housing market by the City and its partners must be strategic based on extensive need and scarce resources.

Investments of resources including time and capital must be targeted geographical towards the areas that will have the most overall community impact.

The City must work in partnership with organizations that can help to further the City’s initiatives.

Empowerment of residents and engendering neighborhood pride is critical to neighborhood stabilization.
Neighborhood History

In Bay City neighborhoods were traditionally centered around one or more community element. Typically a neighborhood is a recognized geograp-hic area that is bound by a physical delineation such as a major road, a body of water, or a distinct change in land use. It is commonly understood that Bay City has a strong neighborhood structure that is based on historic identities. Neighborhoods and their identities were developed around the settlement of ethnic groups and the industries in which the residents made their livelihoods such as lumber mill workers, fishermen, dock workers, or ship builders. As with most turn of the century industrial towns, residents tended to congregate in areas where, in addition to being close to the places they worked, their neighbors spoke the same language, and shared religious and social customs. The resulting neighborhoods exhibit traditional neighborhood design with a grid pattern of walkable streets, with neighborhood scale amenities such as parks, schools, and neighborhood commercial nodes.

In addition, due to the size and layout of Bay City, these individual neighborhoods are all in relatively close proximity and have or could have access to other amenities that exist at a city-wide scale, such as open space around the Saginaw River, the historic downtown, and the developing uptown. Access to these amenities and the traditional neighborhood design are all desirable attributes according to national housing market trends. The fact that these neighborhoods have remained generally intact is an asset to the City.
Housing Stock

While the existing traditional neighborhood design in Bay City is a positive community attribute, the bulk of the existing housing stock does not necessarily exhibit the qualities in housing that consumers in the current housing market desire. This has contributed to the oversupply of total units in the Bay City housing market. Coupled with the decline in population and loss of industry, there are many struggling neighborhoods throughout the City. The concepts discussed in this chapter introduce policies and strategies that can be employed to help improve neighborhoods and stabilize the housing market throughout the City.

In addition to efforts to create an investment environment identified in the economic development chapter, it is imperative that Bay City has quality neighborhoods that are attractive to existing or potential residents who have the ability to choose where to buy a home, settle, and potentially raise a family. In some areas of the City, increased poverty has led to property neglect. Disinvestment in neighborhoods by their residents can have a compounding effect. As a neighborhood deteriorates, homeowners feel less pride in the neighborhood or their home and therefore choose not to invest limited resources in property upkeep. Existing residents and potential new residents who have the financial resources to choose their location will not invest in a neighborhood in which they have no confidence of increasing equity.

Those homeowners who have the ability to choose where they locate tend to have household incomes at or above the area median income, have quality education, and tend to be financially stable. Attracting or retaining these homeowners must be the cornerstone of the city’s neighborhood revitalization efforts as these homeowners are the key to stabilizing neighborhoods.

Stable households will add value to a neighborhood by maintaining their property, investing in home improvements, and ideally place their children in the local school system. Property maintenance and investment in home improvements give signs to other homeowners or would-be buyers that the neighborhood is strong. This helps to encourage others to invest in the neighborhood. In addition, quality schools are one of the biggest determinants of a quality neighborhood. Children from educated families have a tendency to thrive in schools which can in turn increase the quality of the schools when critical numbers of these students are in attendance at a particular school.

The cumulative effect of these elements are what perpetuate the desirability of neighborhoods. Ultimately, desirable neighborhoods have increased property values. This will help to support the tax base needed to provide ongoing community infrastructure and services necessary to promote the quality of the community both at a local neighborhood scale and citywide.
DESIRABLE NEIGHBORHOOD FEATURES

Quality housing stock
Neighborhood maintenance
Quality schools
Feeling of Safety
Parks or other open space
Street trees
Pedestrian scale lighting
Walkable streets
Multiple forms of access
  Quality roads
  Bike lanes/paths
  Public transit
Access to:
  Schools
  Jobs
  Retail opportunities
  Recreation opportunities
Since the 1960s, Bay City has had a difficult time attracting new households and especially those target homeowners previously described. Over 10% of Bay City’s housing units today are vacant. Fully 26% of Bay City’s owner-occupied units were valued below $50,000 in 2014 and only 6% of the City’s stock was valued at or above $150,000. Real wages of the City’s residents have shrunk by an estimated 40-45% since 1960 and the value of Bay City’s entire housing market has shrunk by an estimated 38%.

**Target Investment Areas**

In order to stabilize home values and retain and attract target homeowners, the City and its partners must take strategic and sustained actions designed to both stimulate demand and shrink the supply of obsolete housing in the City. In order to maximize its efforts, the City should focus revitalization efforts on homes and streets that are highly visible and encountering signs of trouble or stress, but are not so troubled that they are not recoverable. Efforts should begin with the I-25 corridor that constitutes the most prominent gateway into Bay City running through the center of the City and the neighborhoods immediately surrounding it.

It will be important to promote and garner buy-in to this strategy with partners various community partners who are involved in the housing market. Critical partners might include local banks and mortgage lenders, the realtor community, the Housing Authority, and nonprofits whose missions are focused on housing such as Habitat for Humanity. These various groups have the power to help influence this strategy and must be part of the solutions.
Neighborhood Housing Stock

Since its founding, Bay City has gone through several historical phases that shape today’s housing stock and neighborhoods. Many of the City’s housing units, around 45%, were built before World War II, including a number of homes that are architecturally significant and cornerstones for revitalization. But there are many others that are obsolete, deteriorated, and are not desirable in today’s market.

Bay City reached its peak population of the 20th Century in 1960 when it was home to 53,604 people and approximately 20,000 households. Today the City has just over 30,000 residents and its median home values are low – $70,355 in 2014, compared to $105,367 in the region. Bay City also has an overabundance of older housing, with the majority of homes near the downtown and city center being constructed before 1930. Citywide, one-third (34%) of Bay City’s single-family homes have two or fewer bedrooms and another one-third (31%) have three bedrooms but only one bathroom.

It is important for the City to begin planning today for the next 20 years and beyond. Bay City’s housing market is aging quickly and buyers have been looking elsewhere in the region; this is now a 60-year trend.

By making strategic investments now to shrink Bay City’s supply of unsought properties and by stimulating demand in strategic areas, Bay City can bring greater stability and create long-term value in its housing market.

2016 Bay City Housing Analysis

To address the distinction in the City’s older housing stock and respond to the demographic patterns of recent decades, Bay City must take strategic efforts to retool the housing stock in response to the demands of the market. Shrinking the supply of housing for which there is little demand in Bay City will involve strategic acquisition and demolition of homes by a local entity, such as the Bay County Land Bank.

Growing demand in Bay City can be accomplished through actions aimed at enhancing neighborhood quality. Examples could include issuing grants to homeowners to invest in properties, growing resident capacity to invest in their blocks and neighborhoods, and diversifying the housing options in and near downtown, as well as other targeted geographies within single-family neighborhoods that are critical to the City’s long-term viability.

Source: Census and 2014 ACS 5-Year Estimate

[Graph showing population trends from 1960 to 2014]
Rightsizing the Housing Stock

As identified in the 2016 housing study, there is a recognized need to right size and provide diversity in the Bay City’s housing stock. Rightsizing the housing stock means that many of the actual housing units need to be removed from the City. Fortunately, or unfortunately, there are a considerable amount of housing units within the City that due to abandonment or years of deferred maintenance must be condemned and demolished. The City has already begun a program to condemn and remove such structures. The housing study suggests there are hundreds of marginal or obsolete residential structures that should be acquired and removed in order to bring the supply in line with the demand to create a healthy market. Currently, the City has a capacity to remove roughly 10 houses per year.

In addition to attempting to increase the number of teardowns that could occur in a year, it is important that these be done strategically. For example, if the City can remove 10 blighted properties per year but removes one from each neighborhood throughout the City this will have no noticeable effect. Property values of adjacent homes will not be effected by the removal of one blighted home if there are still two more dilapidated homes on the same block which are in need of removal. However, if the City can identify a block that will be left in better shape by removing three adjacent derelict houses, the City should concentrate their limited removal funds on that block. Further, this should be done in target areas that have been identified as having the most transformative effect on that City overall if the neighborhoods are stabilized and improved.

The graphics above were developed for the 2016 housing study which suggested that with limited resources and great need, in order to work towards eventual city wide housing market stability, it will be important to concentrate resources on recoverable middle. The study suggests this can be accomplished by first stabilizing areas in good condition and investing in areas that are risk. The strategy focuses efforts in those neighborhoods that are in good or pretty good shape especially in highly visible areas.
There are a number of options for the disposition of vacant lots that are created as the result of a teardown. At a minimum these lots must be held and maintained free of weeds and the accumulation of debris until the market supports their redevelopment. If the resulting vacant lots are separated, lots could be sold to neighboring homeowners to incorporate into larger yards. If there are a critical number of adjacent vacant lots, they could be maintained as a small neighborhood park or green space. Adjacent vacant lots also present the opportunity to combine lots together to be used for the development of new housing types within the traditional single-family neighborhood such as townhomes/brownstones or duplexes that are designed to fit the existing scale and character of the neighborhood.
Increasing Diversity in Housing Type

In today’s housing market, different housing types are needed to support changing demographics. Market demands for certain target groups such as young professionals and empty nesters, as well as the increasing elderly population are recognized as being very similar. All of these demographics are seeking a more compact attached type of housing product in the form of row houses, townhomes, duplexes, fourplexes, or low rise apartments within established neighborhoods which exhibit a full array of amenities, such as walkability, parks or other recreation opportunities, and proximity to areas with commercial and entertainment opportunities. Proximity to jobs that are walkable, bikeable, or easily accessed by convenient transit are also important to young professionals and empty nesters who are still in the workforce.

This housing type is being referred to as the “missing middle”. Missing middle is a range of multi-unit or clustered housing types compatible in scale with single-family homes that help meet the growing demand for walkable urban living. Such housing is intended to be incorporated into a traditional single-family neighbored through infill projects in such a way as to be seamlessly integrated in to the character of the neighborhood. Design regulations for such housing types should be created to ensure that new construction is consistent with the neighborhood both in scale and architectural quality. Based on the need to stimulate the housing market the City should make efforts to ensure that any new developments of this type are marketed towards target homeowners and not subsidized or provided at below market rates.

Housing Type is the spectrum of dwelling unit configurations ranging from single-family homes and mid-rise buildings. Studies reveal a mismatch between current US housing stock and shifting demographics, as well as a growing demand for walkable urban living. Missing Middle housing types, such as duplexes, fourplexes, Townhomes/Row Houses, garden apartments, flats, and live-work spaces, either as a transition from higher-intensity uses or integrated into existing single-family neighborhoods.
Bay City participated in a Target Market Analysis which identifies a number of target markets, or demographic groups called “life style clusters”, that might potentially move to Bay City if the appropriate housing stock was available. This included 16 target markets that are most likely to choose attached units among new housing formats in the downtowns and urban places.

Generally, the study identified the potential for these groups to absorb up 848 new moderate to upscale housing units, across a spectrum of unit types, each year. This assumes the availability of particular housing type that is considered desirous by the various lifestyle clusters. The full report provides specifics about each market type, the specific housing type they would be seeking, and specific numbers for each year.

It must be recognized, however, that based on the 2016 housing study, it was identified that by and large the availability of a diverse housing stock does not currently exist within the City.

Accessory Dwelling Units

Another technique to provide housing options with traditional single-family neighborhoods that will accommodate changing demographics is the creation of code that allows for accessory dwelling units (ADUs). This is a growing trend in communities, especially in light of our aging population. ADUs allow for independent living in close proximity to a family support system, as these units are usually created in response to the need to house an elderly family member.

Recognizing that the unit may not always be occupied by a family member regulations are put in place to ensure compatibility with the existing neighborhood. Accessory dwelling units are a separate housekeeping unit on the same lot as a single family dwelling. Such units can be attached or detached, but are designed to be compatible in scale and design to the character of the existing single family neighborhood. Design criteria can require that the building materials and architectural style are the same as the principle structure. Regulations often require that the principle home be owner occupied to ensure that the land is cared for with the same attention as other single family homes in the district. The ADU must be clearly secondary to the principle use as a single family residents.
Neighborhood Pride and Empowerment

Part of housing market stabilization goes beyond the housing stock and involves making neighborhoods as a whole desirable. This means that the neighborhoods must exhibit general neighborhood-wide pride in ownership. Individual properties must be well maintained. As described in the housing report, there are cumulative negative effects when multiple property owners defer maintenance to their homes and property. Conversely there can be a cumulative positive effect when the majority of land owners are keeping up their property.

The City can develop strategies to help foster neighborhood pride and confidence in homeowners that can make a neighborhood a more attractive investment opportunity and ultimately lead to investment of time and/or money on property maintenance and improvements. There are two Strategies that will help to foster elements of desirable neighborhoods including public investment and property maintenance.

While enforcement efforts are sometimes necessary, education and empowerment are often more effective ways to facilitate property maintenance. Many times, while property owners may need some encouragement to keep their properties up it is really a matter of having the knowledge tools and resources.

There are a number of non-profit organizations and groups that are working to accomplish these objectives as a priamry or anlary function of their mission. Thes community partner orgainzation can be assests in the effort to enhance neighborhoods.

There are a number of ways the City could help to empower neighborhoods to perpetuate neighborhood cleanup and maintenance. These efforts could be organized through the Community District Councils (CDC) as they are an established entity with direct connections to the individual neighborhoods. In terms of communications, the CDC’s could be the conduit to provide information to homeowners about what is expected in terms of property maintenance and well as information about new or existing programs or resources. For example the distribution of literature about available resources such as the Housing Rehabilitation program administered by Bay County or other programs offered locally or through the State in an effort that could be done at minimal cost once communication channels are established. The CDC’s could also be utilized to develop or administer more active initiatives geared towards community capacity building.

Possibilities could include an outreach program aimed at understanding neighborhood specific needs; Organizing neighborhood cleanup days with specific planned activities; Establishing a “Share Shed” that contains a verity of tools can provide access to equipment for members of the neighborhood. Sheds are located in a common neighborhood location like a park or a school. A neighborhood network could also be created for homeowners to solicit help with projects in exchange for help with projects. There are existing social media platforms designed with neighborhoods in mind that could be used to facilitate such cooperation. A particular preferred platform could be promoted by the CDC. Another technique could be to create a competitive neighborhood cleanup grant program. Neighborhoods would put together project proposals. Another way empower neighborhood efforts is for the City to provide materials and neighbors provide the labor. An example is a street tree planting programs where the City provided the trees and the fill material and the residents in the neighborhoods plant the trees. While the City must still support the cost of the material, the labor it done by the community, and the activity can promote capacity and community building within the individual neighborhoods.

Property Maintenance:

- Empowerment
- Education
- Partnerships with non-profits
- Neighborhood improvement grants
- Enforcement

Public Investment:

- Infrastructure
- Complete streets
- Complete sidewalks
- Quality parks
- Lighting
- Street trees
Housing an Aging Population

The next generation of older adults one with a new perspective on aging; one that includes being physically active, staying close to family and friends, moving into a new second career, pursuing education, or accomplishing a lifelong dream. Given the expected shift in the Bay City’s population, this Plan must address how the housing needs of active seniors will be met. It is important to note that population age shifts and the resulting housing demands are largely cyclical, though not necessarily consistent, from cycle to cycle. Many of the concepts described here also provide options both for a younger population as well as persons with disabilities in Bay City.

Where the previous generation of older Americans may have aspired to live in a resort-style destination community, today’s seniors are staying active longer than ever before.

Today’s Seniors
How they are Different

• Living longer
• Highly educated
• Diverse
• Wealthy but with debt
• Remaining in workforce
• Technologically savvy
• More single living arrangements
• Physically active

To that end, there is an overwhelming desire of the “over 65” population to age in place. Given the complications, limitations, and expense in retrofitting existing homes to meet the needs of an aging tenant, many homes no longer remain practical as the homeowner ages.

“Universal Design” and “Visitability” are first steps towards making a community and its housing more inclusive, and one which can empower a homeowner to age in place. Universal Design is a broad concept which involves design products and spaces so they can be used by the widest range of possible users. Coined in the 1980s, the term “visitability” is used to describe a few basic, affordable design options which broaden the equity in housing accessibility without necessarily stressing full accessibility for persons with disabilities, or older adults: These design elements are far more important to the functionality and safety of a home than many traditional full-accessibility standards, such as lower mirrors and sinks, etc. These features are critical to even permit the entry of a disabled or aging person into the structure. The elements include:

• At least one no-step entrance;
• All doors and hallways wide enough to navigate through with a walker or wheelchair; and,
• A bathroom on the first floor big enough to get into in a wheelchair, and close the door.

While Aging in Place is the preference of the vast majority of seniors, there can be limitations in fulfilling every need. Active seniors are looking for a rich social environment, walkable neighborhoods and access to needed services, as well as living in a comfortable home. A full environment for active seniors can be created by addressing the housing, well being and social engagement needs on a more complete basis. Therefore, promoting an Aging in Places strategy will more fully address the full complement of the needs of an aging population.
In any new development or redevelopment, designers can gain a wider market by thinking about access and visitability at the concept phase. The visitability movement argues all new homes should be made visitable, which allows for them to be more easily converted to full-accessibility for an aging resident or to a resident with disabilities, and to provide for increased mobility for all persons, and therefore increased social equity.
Housing & Neighborhood Strategies

Housing related goals have been derived from the 2016 housing study, the planning process including public input, the evaluation of existing and planned housing stock, planning efforts, and best practices. Primarily these strategies are based on the Housing Policies identified in this chapter.

1. Empower homeowners and neighborhood groups - Stabilize Bay City’s failing housing market by ensuring homes are properly maintained. Educate residents about requirements, techniques, and resources. Create a dedicated revolving loan fund, provide exterior home improvement subsidies, and help neighborhoods develop clean-up days and other competitive activities. Provide street trees at-cost or at no cost for property owners to install, and install street trees in City road ROWs.

2. Work with partner organizations - Identify organizations who support City goals and who have the capacity to improve individual properties. Provide leadership and possibly direct financial support to improve the effectiveness of partner organization programs.

3. Enforce existing codes - Improve the attractiveness of Bay City neighborhoods by enforcing existing standards. Work with property owners to ensure code requirements are understood, issue citations when necessary, and follow up on citations. Initiate a targeted sidewalk maintenance program and issue notices to property owners to fix or replace damage sidewalk flags.

4. Invest time and capital resources in a targeted fashion - Work in the identified target areas where investment will have the highest overall community impact.

5. Strengthen the City’s housing market - Right size the housing stock through demolition and rehabilitation programs while maintaining existing vacant homes in a secure and safe manner. The Bay County Land Bank is a key partner in this effort. Vacant lots can be re-purposed as value added side lots, pocket parks or green infrastructure.

6. Update zoning codes - Allow for the integration of townhomes, duplexes, fourplexes, and ADUs in single family neighborhoods, and promote adaptive reuse of existing facilities.
Chapter 4
Connections
Overview
Connections relate predominantly to transportation facilities in the City which are needed to connect residents, commuters, and visitors to jobs, schools, services, retail, and recreation and entertainment opportunities. Transportation facilities that provide these connections include sidewalks, non-motorized trails, local roadways, State highways, waterways, public transportation facilities, the airport, bridges, and parking accommodations for motorized and non-motorized vehicles.

Transportation systems represent one of the most important components in the city, not only because they provide access to the various components of the city, but because they convey messages about the quality of life in the community.

The street scene is one of the first things one will see upon entering Bay City. The quality of maintenance and the various components of the roadway including vehicle lanes, bike lanes, sidewalks, trees, and lighting all provide information about the city’s commitment to quality transportation systems and residents quality of life.

Connection Policies

Quality road design is critical to demonstrating a strong commitment to functionality, safety, and community aesthetics.

A transportation system offering options will support business attraction and provide for a more robust and resilient economy.

Complete streets are critical to the connectivity and functionality of all areas in the community.

Bay City supports the creation or enhancement of multi-modal amenities which provide strong functional connections throughout the city.

Street design must be contextually appropriate for the surrounding land use.

The City’s transportation system must provide access and accessibility for all.

Enhanced mobility will provide for more housing choice.

Enhanced regional connection are important to the success of Bay City.
There are many areas within Bay City with unique identities and features, such as individual neighborhoods, parks, commercial areas, downtown, uptown, the river front, or industrial districts. Though characteristics of these areas may differ, they are all what make up the city.

Each area of the city should have clear and meaningful connections between one another. These connections may manifest in different ways and there may be multiple connections between them. For example, connections may be formed by neighborhood streets, major multi-modal corridors, pathways through parks, bike routes, or bridges over the river. The river itself may be the connector. The river has historically been used as a connection to the Bay and to other communities upstream.

Physical connections are not simply a way to get from here to there. A community’s transportation system can have a tremendous effect on the economic development, viability of neighborhoods, health of the community, and generally quality of life. Promoting effective multi-modal transportation systems will enhance Bay City on multiple fronts and can facilitate economic prosperity, growth, and better physical health of residents.

Obviously, transportation should be safe and convenient. No matter what mode of transportation people choose; whether using a car, taking the bus, walking, riding a bike, or some combination, facilities should be complete, well maintained, and include the best techniques for safety and efficiency. This is especially true for pedestrians and bicycles. It is not to say that vehicular safety should be neglected, but safety and convenience for motor vehicles has long been the major focus in transportation planning and pedestrian and bicycle facilities have not always received the attention that they need. Good physical design and walkability is positively correlated with property values, income, employment, and new business starts.

At the Master Plan Open house many residents expressed interest in more connectivity with the east and west side of the city, especially on foot and bike. This includes restoring the connection between Downtown and the Midland Street district. The suggestions included building pedestrian-only bridges, adding pedestrian pathways to existing bridges, or providing a short ferry route across the river.

“Pedestrian and bike convenience and safety must receive the same level of attention as do considerations for motorized vehicles.”

- Resident at Public Open House
Roadways
The 11.21 square miles within the borders of Bay City are connected by a network of roads comprised of approximately 450 lane miles of local roads under the jurisdiction of the City Street Department, and four state highways, approximately 12.95 miles, under the jurisdiction of the Michigan Department of Transportation (MDOT).

Three state highways are the major corridors into and out of the city. M-13 generally runs north/south through town. M-84 enters the city from the southwest from an interchange with interstate highway I-75. M-25, the primary route into the city from I-75, splits into Thomas and Jenny (one-way in each direction). It eventually comes back together on veterans Memorial Bridge before make its way through downtown, ultimately becoming the gateway to the City for communities to the east.

The roadways within the City are laid out in a traditional grid pattern which is a positive attribute for connectivity. Local neighborhood streets are connected to other areas of town via major and minor collectors and arterials. Despite the presence of the river, which bisects the City, the grid pattern remains mostly intact, with a few collectors along the river following the angle of the river.
Bridges

Bay City is home to four bascule draw bridges which include Independence, Liberty, Veterans Memorial and Lafayette. The City owns, operates, and maintains the Independence Bridge and Liberty Bridge. MDOT owns, operates, and maintains the Veterans Memorial Bridge and the Lafayette Bridge. Huron and Eastern Railway Company owns and operates a train trestle that crosses the river just downstream of the Liberty Bridge. Additionally, there is a pedestrian bridge from Middle Ground Island to the west shore which is part of the non-motorized trail system.

While many cite the bridges as an obstacle and potential liability, especially related to the city’s capital obligations, they are also elements which contribute to the essential fabric and uniqueness of the city.

The prospect of improved vehicular access across the river is unlikely. However, improving non-motorized connectivity or even the development of other opportunities such as a water taxi service should be a focus of further concentration.
Public Transportation

Public transportation is provided in Bay City by Bay Metropolitan Transit Service (Metro). Metro provides 10 regular routes that provide service throughout the Bay City region including a route that provides service to Delta College and routes to surrounding communities as far away as Standish. Eight out of ten routes run Monday through Saturday. The other two, which provide service to Midland and Standish, are weekday routes only. In addition, Metro provides dial-a-ride services geared towards seniors and people with disabilities.

It is the mission of The Bay Metropolitan Transportation Authority to:

"...provide high quality public transportation service to the residents of Bay County. This means operating a system which is economical and efficient; a system safe for both employees and the public. It also means providing transportation service which is reliable and predictable; service which is responsive to community needs and respectful of the property and rights of all individuals.

While it is our goal to serve all county residents, the needs of seniors and the disabled will be assigned a special priority."

The fact that Bay City is served by a public transit system can have a number of long-term benefits in terms of economic development, attraction of a younger entrepreneurial workforce, and expansion of housing choice.

The traditional argument has been that schools and neighborhoods drive housing choice, which remains true to one segment of the market. There is a growing body of research, however, which shows that urban form and transportation will also be a key factor in the housing market, especially as it relates to both millennials and empty nesters.
Pedestrian and Bicycle facilities

By and large, all roadways within the city have sidewalks, including all four bridges. Sidewalks vary in size, design, and condition though the city and there are areas where the sidewalk network is not connected. Although all roadway right-of-ways legally permit the use of bicycles within the road travel ways, there are currently no roadways within the city that have installed formal bike lanes or sharrows.

There are a number of paved pathways, primarily within park areas, that are designed for non-motorized use. The Riverwalk/Railtrail pathway provides connectivity between downtown, neighboring townships on the west side of town, and the park land along the west side of the river. The trail system has a direct connection to Bay City State Recreation Area in Bangor Township northwest of town.
The Importance of Pedestrian Orientation
Providing multiple safe and convenient options makes the city accessible for all residents no matter their age, abilities, or transportation preference. Whether a resident is unable to drive because they are too young, too old, have some disability, or choose not to, making other options available to provide mobility and access throughout the city expands individual choice.

Ensuring that all areas are accessible broadens housing options for those who may be looking to move to or within the city. Cities with complete pedestrian facilities enhance the attractiveness of the community to visitors, existing and potential residents, as well as business owners who recognize this as a community asset.

In fact, it has been demonstrated that walkable bikeable communities, and those with safe and convenient transit options, are attractive to young talent and empty nesters with disposable income.

Seniors are a growing population within our society. As we age our long range mobility needs decrease, but need for access to goods and services and other opportunities such as recreation and entertainment become more acute. Whether older adults can drive or are restricted to walking, their range tends to be limited. Therefore, proximity to local opportunities and amenities is very important. Sidewalks and pathways are a critical component of access, recreation, and mobility for seniors. Senior developments should be located in areas that have well designed and complete pedestrian facilities with a focus on accessibility.

Pedestrian Oriented Design is a design approach which links urban design to such qualities as sense of comfort, sense of safety, and level of interest to create quality walking environments that consider the perceptions and sensitivities of pedestrian users. This design approach is focused on the pedestrian experience of space and place. The conceptual framework behind pedestrian oriented design is that physical features influence the quality of the walking environment both directly and indirectly.

Design features include appropriate sidewalk widths, a buffer or transition to the street that could include grass, street trees or other plantings, pedestrian scale lighting, and close proximity of buildings that create a “street wall”. Buildings near the street must be designed to provide accessible entrances oriented towards the street, visual interest in architecture, and transparent windows which allow views into commercial establishments.
While pedestrian design is important to incorporate throughout the city, there are certain contexts in which facilities and treatments may be different from other areas. General elements such as lighting, street trees, sidewalk maintenance, accessible design, and safe crossings are needed in all areas. The application of each may differ, however, based on the environment. For example, a neighborhood street should have sidewalks and safe street crossings, but a four way stop and striped cross walk is sufficient for slow speed, low volume neighborhood traffic.

On the other hand, in busier areas of town such as downtown, Midland Street, or along major transportation routes with high volumes of vehicular traffic, stoplights with automatic pedestrian signals make crossing safer and more convenient. Automatic pedestrian signals also send the subliminal message to pedestrians that they are as important as vehicular traffic. Even requiring pedestrians to activate a crosswalk by pressing a button makes a crossing less convenient and less safe. When drivers know that a pedestrian signal will occur every time, their driving behavior will naturally be adjusted. In fact, in some urban areas, the pedestrian signal is activated moments before the vehicular signal is activated in order to allow for pedestrians to enter the street first, thereby establishing the right-of-way.
Sidewalks are typically 5 to 6 foot wide paved surfaces within neighborhoods or along the frontage of suburban commercial developments. Sidewalks in urban core areas are typically 15 feet to 20 feet wide to allow for greater volumes of pedestrians on the street as well as other urban elements and activities. In urban areas the sidewalk is located in an area known as the pedestrian realm. The pedestrian realm should be designed to include a variety of activities and pedestrian amenities that make the roadway safe, attractive and functional in the urban core area. These activities and amenities include the use of the sidewalk as a throughway for walkers, but could also include space for benches, planters, outdoor eating, street art, sidewalk displays, bike racks, waste receptacles, and more. Sidewalk designs in urban areas require a larger space to accommodate additional features, as well as the requisite greenbelt or buffer zone that can be used for street trees, lighting, etc.
Non-motorized pathways are typically a 10 foot wide paved surface that accommodate walking, running, biking, and personal mobility devices. Pathways provide both recreation opportunities as well as an alternate mode of transportation. Pathways can provide connections between residential areas and parks and open space, as well as access to local commercial areas.

Bay City's pathway network has been planned around the areas of recreational opportunities, such as parks, the river, and usable open space, along with other destinations such as commercial and entertainment developments. Completing the network will allow this system to be a viable transportation opportunity and not just a leisure use amenity.

![Image of a pathway network map and a pathway sign]

City of Bay City Bay County

Source: ESRI, Bay County, SEMCOG 10-10-16
**Active Transportation** refers to any form of human-powered transportation including walking, cycling, using a wheelchair, in-line skating or skateboarding. There are many ways to engage in active transportation, whether it is walking to the bus stop, or cycling to school/work.

Active transportation can cost-effectively address multiple societal challenges. Communities that prioritize active transportation tend to be healthier by enabling residents to be more physically active in their daily routines and by having cleaner air to breathe. Active transportation systems also foster economic health by creating dynamic, connected communities with a high quality of life that catalyzes small business development, increases property values, sparks tourism and encourages corporate investment that attracts a talented, highly educated workforce.

Additionally, motorists can benefit from less road congestion. When there are transportation options, families are better able to manage the costs of transportation.

Many people are choosing active transportation options when possible. This is especially true for younger workers. Often times when choosing a location, they will factor in the ability to walk, bike, or use public transportation as their primary mode to commute to and from work or as an option. Communities who promote active transportation will be more attractive to both young labor force, as well as industries who recognize these priorities in the workforce they would like to attract.

**Benefits from Active Transportation:**

**Health** – Active transportation provides an opportunity to be physically active on a regular basis.

**Social** – Active transportation is accessible to all residents and increases opportunities for social interactions.

**Transportation** – Active transportation reduces road congestion.

**Environmental** – Active transportation is environmentally-friendly and can contribute to reductions in greenhouse gas emissions.

**Economic** – Active transportation saves money on gas and parking.
**Complete Streets** provide a number of benefits including, but not limited to: Improved safety for all users, including pedestrians, bicyclists, transit riders and drivers; Improved human health by encouraging walking and bicycling; Decreased car traffic, reducing dependence on gasoline and petroleum products, and improved air quality; Provides more transportation options; and fosters livable communities and improved quality of life.

**Complete Streets** are roadways that are planned, designed, and constructed to provide appropriate access to all legal uses in a manner that promotes safe and efficient movement of people and goods whether by car, truck, transit, assistive devices, foot or bicycle. In recent years there has been a shift in focus from roadways that are designed primarily to convey vehicular traffic, to a focus on designing roadways that accommodate all users, both motorized and non-motorized. In 2010, legislation was passed in Michigan that requires those who have jurisdiction over roads to consider complete streets principles in their planning and implementation of transportation projects.

In order to provide connections to all areas of the city for people of all abilities and desired forms of transportation, our roadways must be designed to support multiple modes of transportation. It is important to note, however, that not one specific treatment is appropriate for all roadways. Treatments should vary based on adjacent uses and the amount of traffic on a road, as well as the desired character of the area.

The design for and inclusion of all elements comprising a complete street within the city should be based on the specific context of the existing and planned land uses adjacent to that street. Designs should be based on the most appropriate treatments identified on the Corridor Plan and/or other current adopted transportation plans, considering the overall goals and any specific improvements identified in those plans.

Street design must include facilities that accommodate the needs of all legal users of the facility and provide for access and operation of emergency vehicles. Vehicular access points to private properties should be limited to the extent possible, while providing reasonable access to sites with frontage on a public right-of-way. Designs should adhere to applicable current standards published by the American Association of State Highway Transportation Organizations (AASHTO), the Michigan Manual on Uniform Traffic Control Devices (MMUTCD), the Michigan Department of Transportation (MDOT), and the Americans with Disabilities Act Accessibility Guidelines (ADAAG).
**Contextually Appropriate Complete Streets**

There are a number of different street types identified in Bay City. These include neighborhood streets, urban mixed use streets, connectors, and suburban commercial corridors. The components to create a complete street which provides for all necessary modes of transportation will depend on surrounding land uses.

While there are four general categories identified, the treatments may vary depending on the specific context and the existing conditions. Existing conditions that may play a role include the right-of-way width, the setback of the existing buildings, the presence or lack of sidewalks, on street parking, street trees, or the location of existing underground utilities.

The following pages provide general descriptions of the ideal treatment for each category.
**Neighborhood Streets** are low volume, low speed roadways that should accommodate both motorized vehicles as well as bicycles and pedestrians. Lanes should be narrow to promote lower speeds. The roadways should also accommodate on street parking. Roadways should be lined with green buffers that can include street trees and other potential landscaping that might be installed and maintained by adjacent homeowners. 5 to 6 foot sidewalks between the green buffer and front yards or stoops should be maintained to provide a feeling of safety and to accommodate accessibility for local pedestrian traffic.

**Typical dimensions**
- Vehicle lanes: 11 feet
- Bike lanes: N/A
- Parking: 9 feet
- Vegetation buffer: 8-10 feet
- Sidewalks: 5 feet
Connectors comprise the thoroughfares within the city that provide linkage between the various different areas such as urban mixed use areas, residential neighborhoods, recreation areas, and suburban commercial corridors. These roads should be designed to carry higher volume of traffic at higher speeds while still accommodating non-motorized facilities and providing a sense of safety for pedestrians and bicyclists. Vehicle lanes must accommodate bus traffic. Connectors should include sidewalks, bike lanes, and roadway. Generally, on-street parking does not occur in these areas.

Typical dimensions
- Vehicle lanes: 11 feet
- Bike lanes: 5 feet
- Parking: 9 feet
- Vegetation buffer: 8-10 feet
- Sidewalks: 5 feet
Urban Mixed Streets should be designed to encourage strong interaction between all users of the street and surrounding built environment. Increased vehicular and pedestrian volumes require lower speeds to promote safety. Small building setbacks and increased activity in the pedestrian realm help to lower speeds. On street parking and street plantings create a buffer between traffic and pedestrians. Bike lanes lie between the roadway and parking.

Typical Dimensions
Road: 11 feet
Bike lanes: 5 feet
Parking: 9 feet
Pedestrian Realm: 15 - 20 feet
Suburban Commercial Corridors were developed around large scale commercial uses. These roadway are high speed and high volume, predominantly designed for motorized vehicles. Due to fast moving traffic, bike lanes are not present in the cross section. Non-motorized pathways would follow the roads with a large vegetation buffer separating pathways from the road. Additionally, attempts to minimize curb cuts would help to make these roadways safer for pedestrians and vehicles.

Typical Dimensions
Road: 11 feet
Bike lanes: N/A
Parking: N/A
Vegetation buffer: 8-10 feet
Sidewalk/Pathway: 10 feet
Connection Strategies

Strategies related to connection have been derived from the planning process including public input, the evaluation of transportation, planning, and land use issues in the city, and best practices. Primarily these strategies are based on the Connection Policies identified in this chapter.

1. Create a transportation system with many options – Complete the non-motorized network throughout the community by maintaining existing sidewalks and pathways and installing non-motorized connections where none exist. Enhance the transit system by upgrading transit stops at major destinations or identified primary interchanges with the non-motorized network.

2. Ensure there are connections between all areas of the community – Evaluate the interconnectivity between the various areas of the city to ensure that there are multiple transportation options for all users between those areas. Necessary enhancements will likely be non-motorized improvements especially on bridges, but may include unique approaches like a water taxi.

3. Develop complete streets throughout the city – Adopt a complete streets ordinance. Install contextually appropriate components within all roadways based on surrounding and use and the intended function of the right-of-way. Prioritize major transportation corridors for necessary upgrades.

4. Make major transportation corridors an attractive community future – Maintain existing infrastructure and add elements such as buffer zones with street trees and decorative lighting. Promote property maintenance along major corridors.

5. Update development/design regulations – Ensure that elements that promote accessibility such as pedestrian features and conveniently located entryways are part of development codes.
Chapter 5
Resiliency
Overview

Resiliency theory can be extremely complex and may seem daunting at first. While there are a number of variables at play in a resilient system, the basic definition of resiliency is quite simple:

*Resiliency refers to a system’s ability to absorb a shock and still be able to return more or less to its original state.*

A “system” can be just about anything - the term is used to describe topics from ecology to economics and anything in between. It can also be applied across a variety of scales, from micro to macro.

---

Resiliency Policies

Bay City understands the basic concept of resiliency, and supports building redundancies into infrastructure and other systems.

Diversity is a key component of resiliency. The City must attract and retain a diverse range of residents and businesses in order to thrive.

Green infrastructure involves a wide variety of policymaking decisions and techniques. Bay City must identify ways of encouraging green infrastructure development in the residential, private, and governmental sectors.

Planning for emergency situations cannot address every contingency. A well trained support force is critical for a city to rebound before, during, and after a major weather event.

Alternative energy sources provide redundancy in the energy network, and offer a safety net in the event of an emergency.

Innovative solutions towards job creation can lead to a stronger overall economy. Bay City should look for and promote opportunities for closed-loop systems, sustainable systems, and incubator spaces to encourage a diverse business environment.
The main way a system remains resilient is by building in redundancies, i.e. backup systems. The more diverse a system is, the more adaptable it is and the better able it is to withstand stress. Redundancies ensure that if one component of a system fails, another similar, but not identical, component can take up the slack.

As a simple every day example, a resilient home in Bay City would have a generator on hand in case power is knocked out during a storm. The generator would allow the family to more or less lead a normal life until the power company fixes the problem, without having to worry about spoiled food, etc. An even more resilient home might have solar panels in place, enabling it to handle longer periods without power. Extra batteries for storing power from the solar panels, multiple cans of gas for the generator, and so on all add extra layers of protection for the homeowner. The more levels of redundancies, the better that homeowner is able to withstand the shock of the outage and quickly return to normal life after the storm. Note that these redundancies don’t replace the homeowner’s primary form of electricity, they simply supplement it and fill in during times of emergency.

When resiliency is applied to cities, researchers and planners typically focus on four main drivers: economic, social, environmental, and institutional. These drivers can be further explained as follows: Because systems exist across a variety of scales and involve a variety of different components, it is important to look at that system and its components as they function now, evaluate how they might function at different stages of their life cycles, and how they might operate at both larger and smaller scales.

(Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development, 2016)
Linkages & Modularity

As with all aspects of life, there are links and connections in systems to varying degrees. A healthy, resilient system will have components with at least a certain degree of independence from the others, ensuring that no single shock can derail an entire interconnected system.

Building on the earlier example, if every aspect of the home were directly reliant on electricity to function, the home would not be able to function in the event of a power outage. A resilient home, in addition to having redundant power sources, would likely have some systems that aren’t directly tied to electricity, e.g. gas for heating and cooking, LAN line phones or battery powered cell phones that can operate without direct electrical input, etc.

As another example, in an economically resilient community, both blue- and white-collar jobs would operate across a variety of industries. While having similar (linked) industries operating in close proximity to one another can provide a series of efficiencies that are financially beneficial, having a diverse set of businesses operating in a city ensures that the loss of one business or industry would not devastate the community.

The Adaptive Cycle

All systems, regardless of size, go through a four-stage, closed loop cycle as part of their natural life span. This loop is referred to as the “adaptive cycle”. The four stages are:

1. **RAPID GROWTH**: The system takes advantage of new opportunities and available resources. Rapid growth period takes place over a short time frame at a point where high variability is present.
   
   Examples might include start-up businesses taking advantage of newly opened markets, or weeds growing up in a newly disturbed forest.

2. **CONSERVATION**: Energy, materials, and capital are stored and accumulate as individual systems become established. Individual players within the system become more interconnected and the actions of one player begins to impact the actions of others. Opportunists present in the Rapid Growth phase are replaced by specialists who maximize the output from existing resources. Innovation begins to suffer and growth slowly begins to decline as the system becomes more entrenched and inflexible. This phase typically lasts the longest. The longer the conservation period occurs, the smaller the shock required to disturb the system.

3. **RELEASE**: A disturbance breaks the system, tearing apart the interconnected actors within that system.

   Shocks can take any number of forms. Examples might include a new technology or a market crash disrupting the economy of a community, or a severe storm overwhelming a stormwater system, resulting in a toxic release into the river and long-term damage to the environment. Unlike the conservation phase, the release phase can happen almost instantaneously.

4. **REORGANIZATION**: In the chaos following a release phase, novel thinking is rewarded with new opportunities. Individuals who were unable to grab footholds in previous phases suddenly have the opportunity to grow and flourish. Small changes now can have profound effects.

Adapted from: Resilience Thinking, Sustaining Ecosystems and People in a Changing World, Walker, 2006
The end result of reorganization can vary dramatically; the system could simply repeat the previous cycle, or an entirely new pattern of accumulation and conservation could arise. Complete collapse of the system into a new, degraded state is also a possibility.

A system’s position on the adaptive cycle will greatly influence future development, and should be considered when making policy decisions. It is important to note that a system may not go through every phase of the cycle; for example, a system may experience rapid growth and then revert directly to reorganization.

Systems often have components operating on multiple cycles simultaneously, and these different components can be at different stages of the adaptive cycle at any given time.

As an example, while the overall economy of a resilient city is in the conservation phase, a number of industries with great influence on the economy could be in any of the other phases. The importance of diversity is highlighted in this example; if one of the industries collapsed, the remaining non-related industries could help the economy weather the storm. Encouraging multiple smaller companies to grow within a community instead of relying solely on one large industry or business is an effective way to avoid collapse during a system reorganization.

**What is “Coastal Resiliency”?**

Coastal resiliency was coined to address the impact of climate change on seaside communities around the world. The effects of storm events are heightened by rising sea levels, as storm surges and high tides in historically high sea levels turn already dangerous hurricanes and tropical storms into potentially catastrophic events.

Coastal resiliency as applied to Bay City has a somewhat different meaning. Where rising sea levels are a driving factor in typical coastal communities,
Bay City is potentially faced with falling Great Lake levels. According to the Michigan Environmental Council, climate change may have a significant impact on the state. The Great Lakes could face a significant decrease in volume, with nearby Lake Huron losing up to 20% of its surface area.

Compounding the challenge for Bay City, precipitation is forecasted to increase in coming years, but the majority of the increase will occur in the spring months, with prolonged drought periods possible in summer months. Rain events will be “flasky”, with heavy downpours, and storm events will grow more severe. Flooding, already a primary concern for Bay City, may be exacerbated as spring rains flow off of saturated soils and overrun the banks of the Saginaw River and its tributaries. Frequent, heavy storm events can overwhelm aging sewer systems and heavily industrialized river channels. Stormwater disconnect policies, rain garden and rain barrel incentive programs, and other non-traditional stormwater management techniques such as bioswales and constructed wetlands can help reduce the impact, and require the cooperation of residents, developers, planners, and engineers.

As with any resilient system, resilient coastal communities are designed to be flexible, with planned redundancies spanning a variety of systems which help ease the shock of climate driven events. Interdisciplinary cooperation is crucial. Planners, architects, engineers, and ecologists will need to work together to determine the policy implications of newly formed land area, and determine ways to mitigate the effects of flooding. A few possible examples of coastal resiliency planning could include:

• Ecologists work with city engineers to protect coastlines by utilizing natural systems such as coastal and inland wetlands to mitigate the effects of storm surges.
• Planners work with economists and ecologists to promote floodplain buyout programs, removing structures and residents from the most vulnerable areas and offering new spaces for green stormwater infrastructure.
• Transportation officials work with emergency management and housing officials to ensure that evacuation plans account for residents with different abilities, income levels, and transportation options so that all citizens can be evacuated in an emergency.
Slow Variables

A wide range of variables will affect an individual system. Only a few variables, however, truly drive the development of that system. These “slow variables” are often difficult to identify, and they often appear too large and complex for any one individual to address. Concepts like population migration, climate change, and economic stability are three commonly identified slow variables.

The size of these variables tend to make them difficult to control; change is generally gradual and appears to be impossible to reverse, and addressing the variables will require cooperation across multiple jurisdictions. The general public often feels that their efforts will be inconsequential, and as a result may feel frustrated and resistant to large scale changes. The challenge for city leaders and planners, then, is to show how small scale adjustments, taken in context with overall picture, can have an enormous overall impact.

As is often the case, the most critical slow variables affecting Bay City are closely related. The four most pressing variables and their common impacts on the community are discussed on the following pages.
Migration refers to the movement of people both into and out of a community. Migration can be triggered by a sudden, catastrophic event such as a tornado or by a slowly developing situation such as the introduction of a new industry. Population change is impacted by a number of different variables which in turn affect a number of other variables. Migration operates on local, regional, and national levels. Growth and loss are often perceived as simple indicators of a community’s economic health but it is a highly complex issue deserving of special consideration.

Bay City’s population history reflects how a single variable can dramatically affect a population. The first wave of European settlers to the City were primarily influenced by navigation challenges in the early 1800s; settlers chose to move to the “Lower Saginaw” region after they found that the waters near Saginaw were too shallow to handle large ships. Waves of French, German, Polish, Jewish and Irish immigrants flocked to the City over the years, each driven by a different set of circumstances.

At first blush, population loss would appear to be more worrisome than population growth. Michigan residents know all to well that as a population migrates out of a city, property availability increases, leading to a “buyers’ market” and a drop in overall housing prices. Usage levels and related revenues for infrastructure drop, but the required amount of physical infrastructure and the maintenance requirements remains unchanged.

Municipal services are similarly affected. Emergency service departments are asked to cover wider areas with less officers. School buildings which once bustled with children become obsolete, forcing building closures and requiring some families to transport their children to facilities far from home. Small businesses that were built to serve a certain population threshold are forced to close shop as revenues evaporate. The net result is a decreased quality of life for residents, which encourages many to move on to new locales, perpetuating the cycle until community collapses or is reborn.
Rapid population growth, on the other hand, poses its own set of challenges. As the demand for housing stock grows, the price of housing rises. Left unchecked, housing and property costs rise to a level that pushes out existing residents, discourages new residents from moving to the community, or encourages sprawl as potential residents look for housing alternatives in surrounding communities. New residents place demands on infrastructure and municipals services. The revenue these residents bring to the community in the form of new taxes may not be sufficient to meet the costs for upgrading or installing new infrastructure. Overcrowded schools and overworked municipal service agencies lead to a decreased quality of life, and ultimately to a loss of residents to surrounding communities. While this scenario is less common, it has been seen in boom towns around Silicon Valley and near the oil fields in North Dakota.

The challenge for city planners and leaders is to find the balance point between the two extremes. Careful monitoring of the situation and implementation of strategic redundant systems can help ease the shock of population change, and enable leaders to steer the community towards a sustainable, controlled level of growth.

**TECHNIQUES FOR ADDRESSING THE ISSUE:**

- Develop and offer a variety of housing types and densities: Small, affordable single family homes that are popular as “starter homes”, dense, well apportioned “missing middle” condominiums and townhomes, and larger, traditional houses address different needs for residents as they progress through their adult lives, and enable a municipality to attract and retain residents.
- Implementing rent control policies is an effective form of combating gentrification, and allows lower-income residents to remain in place as a city grows.
- Develop and maintain a variety of utility systems, from non-traditional stormwater abatement systems (e.g. swales, rain gardens, green roofs, etc.) to alternative energy solutions such as wind and solar, to provide a level of redundancy for communities, often at a lower cost than traditional alternatives.
- A public/private model for civil service positions can help ease the financial burden on municipalities and allows for easy scalability as population levels shift.
- Creative use of underutilized existing public facilities (e.g. renting empty schools as startup space) can help to attract new talent to the area while simultaneously providing a source of income for otherwise empty structures.
Environmental variables are wide ranging and are difficult to quantify. The concept of “ecosystem services” was developed to help apply a human value to benefits derived from environmental settings. These services can take a direct form (from provisioning services such as lumber or medicine) or a more indirect form (in the form of cultural services such as recreational and spiritual benefits), while demonstrating the inherent value in the preservation of natural areas.

Concerns about climate change emphasize the importance of ecological preservation. Regardless of whether one views climate change as a man-made phenomenon or a natural cycle, there is little debate that the global climate has grown warmer in the past several decades, and that the trend is likely to continue for the foreseeable future.

Climate scientists predict that Michigan’s climate will be hotter and wetter, with precipitation coming primarily in the form of heavy downpours in the spring months. Winter months will be milder, and summer months will experience longer periods of drought with higher temperatures. Dangerous heat days may increase by five to ten times current levels by the end of the century. Rain will be “flashy”, with the majority of water quickly running off the parched or saturated ground. Aging stormwater systems will likely prove to be inadequate in the face of these storm events, and localized flooding will become increasingly common. Lack of winter ice in the Great Lakes will result in higher than usual evaporation rates, leading to lake level decreases of one to five feet below current levels by the end of the century. New land created by receding lakes will lead to property rights questions. Aquatic “dead zones” will increase in the Great Lakes, affecting water-based industries, anglers, and tourism dollars.

A resilient city will be prepared for the coming changes and will make necessary adjustments to meet the new demands. A number of large and small scale steps can be taken to help support the City's traditional gray infrastructure, reduce or prevent the severity of flooding events, and improve the ecological health of the City and region.

Successful implementation of green infrastructure techniques requires a mix of policies and public education. A United States Environmental Protection Agency (USEPA) case study found that successful communities utilized some or all of the following concepts when developing their green infrastructure policies:

- Stormwater regulation: Developments are required to use green infrastructure to manage stormwater runoff before leaving the site.
- Review and Revision of Local Codes: Updating ordinances removes barriers for green infrastructure development and ensures consistency across applicable codes.
- Demonstration and Pilot Projects: Using public properties to test green infrastructure techniques helps introduce concepts to the general public.
- Capital and Transportation Projects: Communities take advantage of available maintenance and improvement funds to address the largest source of impermeability in the community.
- Education and Outreach: Utilizing signage, mailings, or other forms of communication to inform and encourage residents to implement green infrastructure techniques.
- Stormwater Fees & Discounts: Generating revenue to address combined sewer overflow issues and offering incentives for disconnecting from the municipal stormwater system.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BENEFIT</th>
<th>TYPE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Increase carbon sequestration</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improve air quality</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Additional recreational space</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Efficient land use</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improve human health</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flood protection</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drinking water source protection</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Replenish groundwater</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improve watershed health</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protect or restore wildlife habitat</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduce sewer overflow events</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restore impaired waters</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meet regulatory requirements for receiving waters</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduce hard infrastructure construction costs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maintain aging infrastructure</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase land values</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Encourage economic development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduce energy consumption and costs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase life cycle cost savings</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Establish / expand urban greenways</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provide pedestrian, bicycle, and boat access</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Create attractive streetscapes and rooftops that enhance livability and urban green space</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educate the public about their role in stormwater management</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban heat island mitigation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: USEPA
Development incentives, fee discounts, installation financing, and awards and recognition programs are other tools cities have used to help implement strong infrastructure policies.

Michigan is highly dependent upon tourism dollars and our connection to the environment. Bay City, with its position as the “Gateway to the North,” stands to benefit greatly from eco-tourism dollars. Both the proximity to the Bay and its position along the Saginaw River are assets that could be better capitalized. The City is well positioned to take advantage of the uptick in interest in water trails and kayaking. With improved river access the City could become a recreation destination for these types of activities. As a component of the overall economic picture, preservation and restoration of open spaces makes sound fiscal sense.

Bay City has the opportunity to reimagine its connection with the riverfront. The river is highly channelized throughout most of the downtown area, with steel seawalls blocking access to the water. A number of communities around the globe, including New York, Chicago, and Detroit, are in the process of removing barricades on their shorelines and returning some of the natural functionality of the riverbank in an effort to address flooding issues. A similar restoration of Bay City’s vacant industrial parcels to wetland space would not only provide the City flooding protection, but would also become a tourist attraction and a recreation amenity that could be enjoyed by City residents. As development continues in the downtown core, the City must continue to work with developers, regional authorities, governmental agencies, and private institutions to implement large-scale projects which enhance the community and provide needed infrastructure and ecological benefits.

On a smaller scale, the City can look to utilize vacant or derelict properties in the outlying neighborhoods as stormwater management tools. The City of Detroit, in cooperation with the Detroit Land Bank Authority and an interdisciplinary team from the University of Michigan, repurposed several vacant properties, utilizing the existing basement infrastructure as a stormwater retention basin / rain garden. A survey of neighboring properties indicated the owners felt the new gardens would positively affect the economic value of their homes, make them feel safer in their neighborhood, and compel the residents to walk more often and interact with their neighbors.

The City should undertake a study to identify known problem areas. Frequent flooding areas are usually located in low lying areas and historic wetlands. By identifying and tracking data at a parcel level, the City will be better able to target areas for stormwater infrastructure improvement. The map on this page shows the potential for flooding based on topography and NOAA flood data. “Properties of Interest” are current open space areas that are candidates for the introduction of large-scale stormwater management techniques.

At a policy level, the City can consider implementing stormwater fee policies and offer incentives for stormwater disconnects and construction of rain gardens, rain barrels, or other green infrastructure tools. Public education is a key component, and the city should work with landscape professionals to develop and market programs to educate area residents.

“We need to take advantage of our riverfront to make Bay City a destination for a weekend or longer.”

- MiCommunity Remarks User

New York’s “Dry Line” is designed to provide access to the East River while simultaneously increasing pervious surface and allowing for anticipated flooding events. A similar technique could be used to enhance Bay City’s Riverwalk (top).
In the downtown area, Bay City should work with the Michigan Department of Transportation (MDOT), the DDA, and other authorities to implement street level improvements that encourage walkability, provide identity to the corridor, and provide ecological benefits. Bioswales, planted medians, and permeable pavement with cisterns under sidewalks are proven stormwater management methods which can be used to create a strong sense of place and raise the value of surrounding properties.

Unfortunately, despite the best efforts to prevent flooding, at some point a storm will overwhelm even the most robust of systems and cause damage to people and properties. Resilient cities prepare for these circumstances by having well-trained personnel in key positions, notably police/emergency personnel, hospital staff, and governmental personnel.
A well designed emergency alert system is also critical. With the variety of communication platforms available to residents today, the City has numerous options for reaching citizens in the event of an emergency. Traditional storm sirens, traditional media (television, newspaper, and radio) announcements, social media blasts (Twitter, Facebook), and emergency alerts using mobile phone applications can provide life saving information to residents. The City must also be prepared to reach citizens in the event of a power outage, or those who do not have access to the aforementioned media outlets, by continuing to work with neighborhood leaders to reach the most at-risk members of the community.

Climate change is an example of how a variable can affect systems on multiple scales. While the changes a city makes on its own will only have a minor impact on global climate issues, taken in concert with other efforts, the changes can have a tremendous effect. More importantly, steps taken on a local or regional level can dramatically reduce the intensity of climate change events and its disruptive effects on the overall cycle of a city.

TECHNIQUES FOR ADDRESSING THE ISSUE:

- Developing redundancies in stormwater systems can take a number of different forms and can act to prolong the effective life of traditional stormwater systems. Offering incentives for development of residential rain gardens and implementing stormwater disconnect policies can have a dramatic effect on stormwater input at a significantly lower cost than upgrades to traditional systems.

- Preservation of wetland spaces offers a range of benefits, from stormwater management to habitat preservation and recreation opportunities. This work must be completed on both a local and regional level.

- Creation of new stormwater management spaces on vacant properties provides a creative solution to blighted properties.

- Implementing tree planting policies can help to reduce the heat island effect in urban areas while raising property values.

- Density bonuses for new developments in areas where active transportation is viable, coupled with effective mass transit policies, help to reduce the amount of cars on road and reduce particulate levels in the air.

- Development of policies to address effective use of space created by declining lake levels, and lakefront property rights
Energy policy is one of the most pressing issues affecting people around the globe. The negative impact of coal and oil use on air and water quality is well documented. The United States has made a concerted effort in recent years to reduce its dependence on foreign oil. Advances in oil shale technology and fields discovered in Canada and the upper Midwest have made this goal attainable, but it does not address the central issue, which is reducing the country’s dependence on fossil fuels.

Renewable energy production and storage offer the prospect of further reducing, if not eliminating entirely, our dependence on oil. Investment in renewable sources has soared worldwide from $182 billion in 2008 to almost $286 billion in 2016. Wind and photovoltaic power (solar) have grown exponentially in that time. Even so, renewable energy sources account for only 19% of total energy consumption.

Energy distribution continues to be a major concern, as evidenced by the massive power outage experienced in the northeast in 2003. From 2000 to 2014, monthly average grid outages increased from 2.5 disruptions per month to 21.7 per month, reflecting the age of the current system.

Bay City is uniquely positioned to take advantage of a variety of new energy production techniques such as geothermal, wind, and kinetic systems. Bay City Power and Light’s (BCPL) “Energy Smart” program offers residents and commercial customers alternatives for reducing energy usage. Education programs such as these can be instrumental in reducing overall energy demands which, in turn, lessens infrastructure requirements and reduces the environmental impacts of energy production.

Policymaking which encourages development and use of alternative energy systems in conjunction with traditional sources has the potential to increase the standard of living for residents through increased power stability, improved air and water quality, decreased overall costs, and new job creation opportunities. Incentives to install solar and wind installations, similar to the Windstream Solarmills being installed by BCPL at industrial facilities in the city, can help to reduce dependence on traditional infrastructure and provide needed backup power sources in the event of an outage.

By creating redundancies in the power generation system, both in terms of the form of production and in how that produced energy is stored, Bay City can reduce vulnerabilities for residents and ensure that no single event will completely disrupt the power system.

**TECHNIQUES FOR ADDRESSING THE ISSUE:**

- Promote policies that encourage alternate transportation modes and provide charging stations for electric vehicles.
- Work with Bay City Electric Power and Light (BCELP) to develop renewable power generation capabilities (solar, wind, geothermal, kinetic) on a regional and local level.
- Create local power distribution nodes which can accommodate fluctuating energy demands and reduce ramp-up requirements during peak demand periods.
- Develop policies to encourage green energy sector manufacturing jobs in the region.

Economy and Job Creation are forefront in the minds of Bay City residents. As the world moves to a global economy, Bay City and Michigan have been especially impacted by job losses. The recession of 2008 demonstrated that no economies are immune to the effects of a widespread downturn. Still, some cities weathered the recession better than others.

The best performing cities during the recession all demonstrated diversified economic bases. Cities that were largely reliant on one industry, particularly the housing boom, continue to suffer to this day.

Bay City has the infrastructure and economic conditions in place to attract new businesses and residents to the area. The city’s unique amenities, such as proximity to the Great Lakes and to young, untapped talent, further strengthens the region’s appeal. As the city begins to attract new businesses, it will be important to work towards diversifying the mix of industries taking hold in the area.

Effective utilization and monitoring of existing facilities and infrastructure and the costs of doing business in the area will help to lessen the effects of unwanted peaks and troughs of the business cycle. Helping new businesses take advantage of existing situations and synergies can present new and unexpected business opportunities, and greatly reduce infrastructure requirements for waste management.

For a further discussion of economic policies and platforms in Bay City, see Chapter 8.

TECHNIQUES FOR ADDRESSING THE ISSUE:

- Closed-loop manufacturing systems operate under the assumption that one company’s waste can be another company’s material source. Bay City’s Office of Economic Development should work closely with local and regional businesses to encourage development of zero-waste facilities.

- Bay City can develop an inventory of existing facilities that can be repurposed as business incubators or re-utilized for similar manufacturing activities.

- Highlight sustainable activities within the city and proximity to Lake Huron and nearby state parks to take advantage of eco-tourism dollars.
Resiliency Strategy

The concept of resiliency is highly adaptable and has wide range of implications for Bay City. The City should consider the following strategies on an ongoing basis:

1. Embrace Resiliency - Develop redundancies and alternative systems for all City facilities and departments.

2. Utilize green infrastructure - Green technology can be utilized to reduce infrastructure costs and provide a backup system for traditional stormwater systems, while simultaneously serving as an open space amenity and economic driver for the community.

3. Highlight diversity - Attract new residents and businesses by highlighting the City’s diversity. Focus on the wide variety of opportunities the City offers, from its people to its facilities, infrastructure, and attractions.

4. Be prepared for anything, but expect to be unprepared for everything - Resilience means being able to rebound from an event, implying that some events can not be anticipated. Well trained personnel and a well developed emergency planning system will help the City rebound in the event of an unanticipated emergency.

5. Move beyond the comfortable - Investigate and test out new technologies. Try new methods of attracting visitors and residents. By continually adapting and adjusting, the City will be able to meet whatever challenges the future presents.
Chapter 6
Economic Development
Overview

From the late 1800’s to post WWII, Bay City had a robust economy – Lumbering, milling, and shipbuilding thrived in the early years, eventually yielding to modern manufacturing. With economic growth came population and housing growth.

As was the case with so many Michigan communities, the decline in automotive manufacturing has had devastating effects. Bay City lost over 1,000 manufacturing jobs between 2000 and 2015. A population of nearly 54,000 people in 1960 has declined to around 35,000. The city’s median household income of $36,000 is $10,000 less than the county and region.

Still, Bay City is a community with numerous assets. The river is an economic, cultural and recreational magnet. The city’s social and cultural assets are more diverse than other communities in the region. There is a great inventory of historic building available for adaptive reuse. Affordable property can be leased or purchased to start and grow new business.

Currently, there are a number of initiatives at the local, county and regional level that focus on economic development. As correctly identified in the Bay County Road Map to the Future there are essentially three ways to build a robust economy:

1. Help existing businesses survive and thrive
2. Attract new businesses to the area
3. Support entrepreneurs in the creation of new businesses

Economic Development Policies

Bay City recognizes that a collaborative approach with local, county and regional organizations, business organizations, educational institutions and the private sector, builds on the combined skills of multiple entities and enhances the potential for success. The road map to the future represents such a collaborative approach and deserves the full support of the City.

The essential focus of Bay City’s economic development initiative is to create a positive investment environment where existing and new businesses are encouraged to grow, create jobs, and make positive contributions to the community.

Bay City’s path to achieve these goals is by focusing on:

- Building on its existing assets
- Addressing gaps in resources
- Avoiding duplication of effort
- Adopting a realistic economic development strategy
- Developing a locally based support system
Economic development and workforce development cannot be separated. A positive investment environment is created when residents can successfully compete for employment opportunities and benefit from economic prosperity.

Both business and labor need access to advanced education. The City will partner with Delta College and Saginaw Valley State University in the development of programs which match training of the workforce with the skills needed by business.

A key to the city’s economic development is to strategically invest in placemaking opportunities that capitalize on community assets. Through strategic and targeted placemaking and placed-based investment, Bay City will remain authentic to and capitalize upon its history, people, geography and natural resources.

To support entrepreneurs and small business, city leadership will continue to evaluate the manner in which they do business. The city will continually seek to communicate with the entrepreneurial and small business community to improve processes and better respond to needs.

Collaboration is Key!

The Bay City area is fortunate to have many organizations that focus on bettering the community. To the extent there is collaboration and coordination among all these groups is a significant challenge. An approach which will lead to greater long-term success is one that identifies a hierarchy and division of responsibilities and avoids redundant or conflicting efforts. Collaborative partnerships are particularly important when there are complex and diverse interests.
Where People are Employed

The trends in employment over the past five years have been dynamic. Although the past five years may not be a complete picture of employment trends, there is consistent picture with observations made in the previous Master Plan. In the top five industries of employment (see Table 1), the greatest job losses have come in the manufacturing sector. This is not surprising, given current trends in manufacturing where globalization and automation are impacting the domestic job market. Employment in the health care sector is on the rise, which is also consistent with trends seen elsewhere. All other sectors have remained relatively stable.

The North American Industry Classification System (NAICS) classifies business establishments by the industry or business activity in which they are primarily engaged. The top five business categories in Bay City, employing over 55% of the workforce, are included in Table 2. Most employment is found in government, health care, and the service industry. The shift away from manufacturing to service-related business is consistent with data reported in the previous Master Plan.

Equally revealing is the dearth of technology based businesses in Bay City. As shown in Table 3, these types of businesses represent either a very low or non-existent end of the scale.

Table 1
Bay City Employment Trends by Sector

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Manufacturing</th>
<th>Health Care &amp; Social Services</th>
<th>Accommodations / Food Service</th>
<th>Other Service</th>
<th>Public Administration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>3168</td>
<td>2005</td>
<td>1960</td>
<td>1526</td>
<td>2816</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>3153</td>
<td>1735</td>
<td>1945</td>
<td>1546</td>
<td>2909</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>3014</td>
<td>1698</td>
<td>2003</td>
<td>1545</td>
<td>2834</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>2510</td>
<td>1562</td>
<td>1656</td>
<td>1481</td>
<td>2838</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>2450</td>
<td>2230</td>
<td>1884</td>
<td>1538</td>
<td>2841</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Bay Future, Inc. / Applied Geographic Solutions

Table 2
Bay City Employment by Business Type

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Business Type</th>
<th># of Employees</th>
<th>% of Total Employment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public Administration</td>
<td>2817</td>
<td>14.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Medical/Surgical Hospital</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>10.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food Service/Drinking Establishments</td>
<td>1665</td>
<td>8.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation Equipment</td>
<td>1329</td>
<td>6.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary/Secondary Schools</td>
<td>853</td>
<td>4.39</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Bay Future, Inc. / Applied Geographic Solutions

Table 3
Bay City Technology Based Business

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Business Type</th>
<th># of Employees</th>
<th>% of Total Employment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Management/Scientific/Technical Consulting</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>0.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer Systems Design</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>0.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scientific Research/Development</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data Processing/Hosting</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Software Publishers</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Bay Future, Inc. / Applied Geographic Solutions
In Michigan, the overwhelming majority of businesses (98%) are small businesses. Bay City replicates this trend with 1,675 small businesses, over 95%, with less than 50 employees. Most of these businesses are between 1-4 employees. This is actually a positive characteristic for future job growth. While the focus of the City's economic development policy should not solely rely on growing small businesses, it should be a cornerstone of an economic development strategy as discussed later in this section.

Despite the current upward trend of the auto industry, the path to prosperity no longer rests with the traditional industrial base of Michigan for the following reasons:

- Michigan’s prosperity in the last century was primarily built on good-paying, lower education attainment jobs. Those jobs are gone forever.
- The automobile manufacturing industry is in a state of transition and will be substantially smaller, employing far fewer workers and paying them less, with fewer benefits.
- The decline in automobile manufacturing is part of an irreversible new reality that manufacturing is no longer a sustainable source of high-paid jobs, nor is it a source of future job growth. Manufacturing accounts for less than 9% of the American workforce today. It accounted for 32% of the nation’s jobs in 1953, and 14% in 1998. Manufacturing’s share of American jobs has been declining for a long time.

The most successful economies are those that are concentrated in the knowledge-based sectors – primarily health care, education, information, financial services and insurance, and professional and technical services. Clearly, the changing economy has had an impact on Bay City. Except for health care, Bay City is weak in technology-based sectors.

Why Small Business is Important

- New companies create the majority of net new jobs in the economy;
- Small businesses employ local residents;
- New and small business play a pivotal role in creating a unique sense of place that enhances a community’s quality of life; and
- In a more footloose, global economy, homegrown businesses may have deeper roots than those gained through attraction strategies.

Source: Supporting entrepreneurs and Small Business, National League of Cities.
Where Dollars are Spent

Bay City has been and will continue to be a significant retail center within the Tri-County region. Despite that fact, there is untapped retail potential. The sources for that potential emanate from both within Bay City and from the surrounding region.

Retail sector gap or “leakage” analysis compares existing levels of retail sales within a defined trade area to the potential retail sales based on the number and demographic characteristics of households within the area. Essentially, it is a measure of local spending power and a determination of where those dollars are spent.

Retail leakage means that residents are spending more for products than local businesses capture. Retail sales leakage suggests that there is unmet demand in the trade area and that the community can support additional store space for that type of business.

However, retail leakage does not necessarily translate into opportunity. For example, there could be a strong competitor in a neighboring community that dominates the market for that type of product or store.

A retail surplus means that the community’s trade area is capturing the local market plus attracting non-local shoppers. A retail surplus does not necessarily mean that the community cannot support additional business. Many communities have developed strong clusters of stores that have broad geographic appeal. Examples of these types of retailers include: sporting goods stores, home furnishing stores, restaurants, and other specialty operations that become destination retailers and draw customers from outside the trade area.

Examining the quantitative aspects (Leakage/Surplus) is only part of the evaluation of community’s retail opportunities. Before any conclusions can be drawn about potential business expansion or recruitment opportunities, however, more qualitative considerations must be analyzed in context of other market factors.

In Bay City, there is strong indication that there is a surplus in the market for:
- Furniture and home furnishings stores
- Electronics and appliance stores
- Health and personal care stores
- Sporting goods, hobby, book and music stores
- Food services and drinking establishments

At the same time, there is a market gap or “leakage” in the following types of businesses:
- Motor vehicle and parts dealers
- Building materials, garden equipment and supply stores
- Food and beverage stores
- Gasoline stations
- Clothing and clothing accessory stores
- General merchandise

Conducting a gap analysis is a useful indicator of the following:
- Indicating how well the retail needs of local residents are being met
- Uncovering unmet demands and possible opportunities
- Understanding the strengths and weaknesses of the local retail sector
- Measuring the difference between actual and potential retail sales
Leakage/Surplus Factor by Industry Subsector

Source: ESRI and Info group. Retail Market Place 2016 Release
Recognizing the Changing Economy

The economy has been undergoing a significant transformation from industry and manufacturing to a knowledge economy based on technology and the management of information. Communication technology, globalization, and the availability and manipulation of information have been evolving for many years.

The knowledge economy can be defined as production and service based on knowledge-intensive activities that contribute to an accelerated pace of technical and scientific advance. The key component of a knowledge economy is a greater reliance on intellectual capabilities rather than a physical input or natural resource. The importance of more traditional factors upon which Bay City previously relied, such as transportation networks and proximity to raw materials, is diminished.

### The New vs. Old Economy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OLD ECONOMY</th>
<th>NEW ECONOMY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing focus</td>
<td>Sector diversity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fossil Fuel Development</td>
<td>Communications dependent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attracting companies was first priority</td>
<td>Attracting talented, well-educated people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location was of prime importance</td>
<td>Great places with a high quality of life matter more</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Companies sought cheap place to do business was the key</td>
<td>Being in a place rich in talent and ideas is the key</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A high-quality physical environment was a luxury</td>
<td>Attractive physical and cultural amenities are key</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regions fixed competitive advantage in some resource or skill</td>
<td>Regions prosper if organizations and individuals have the ability to learn and adapt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government-led economic development</td>
<td>Bold partnerships between public and private sector</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The implication for both short and long-term planning in Bay City, as a result of the new economy, include the following:

- Increasing importance of education and relationships with educational institutions. Post-secondary education has become central to the pursuit of a good standard of living. The availability of a knowledge-based talent pool is a key factor in attracting, retaining, and growing an entrepreneurial environment and knowledge-based businesses within a community.

- Increasing importance of community amenities, quality of life, and a sense of place.

- Decreasing demand for conventional office space and industrial/manufacturing space. The demand for conventional space is expected to continue to decline due to improved efficiencies from technology, global changes to the auto industry, decline of manufacturing in general, and the movement of manufacturing jobs to areas of lower labor costs.

- Increasing demand for flexible space that accommodates a variety of uses. In many instances, office, R & D, warehouses, and manufacturing is all under one roof.

- Increasing demand for broadband access as required infrastructure for businesses and residences.

- Increase reliance on regional collaboration. The integration of local economies into a larger economic system creates opportunities to attract new, expanding, or relocating businesses. It also may provide wider markets for local enterprises.

East Michigan Council of Governments

The 8-county East Michigan Council of Government completed a Regional Prosperity Strategy in December of 2014 that points out a number of challenges the region faces:

- Stagnant population growth
- State and regional economic downturn
- State and local tax/budgetary climate
- Access to capital for start-ups and expansions
- Infrastructure maintenance
- Negative perceptions (internal and external)
- Middle-skill workforce gaps
- Lack of a cohesive regional identity/brand

The strategy also recognizes the critical needs that the Region has to cope with the changing economy. The Strategic Plan includes five overarching goals focusing on: entrepreneurship and innovation; talent and workforce development; transportation and infrastructure; and place-making and talent attraction.

1Michigan’s Transition to a Knowledge-Based Economy: Fifth Annual Progress Report, Michigan Future, Inc., October 2012
Great Lakes Bay Regional Alliance

The Great Lakes Bay Regional Alliance mission is to promote economic growth by providing financial assistance to the business community and non-profit sector. While the primary service areas are Midland, Bay, Saginaw and Isabella Counties, the Alliance also does business promotion in Gratiot, Gladwin, Clare and Arenac Counties.

Bay County Road Map to the Future

In a collaborative effort between the Bay Area Community Foundation and the Bay Area Chamber of Commerce, the Road Map to the Future was developed with input for more than 300 community leaders. The Road Map identifies four elements that are a key to the community’s success: a strong sense of place, robust and diverse economy, outstanding talent and the ability to meet residents basic needs.

Central Michigan University Research Corp. Business Incubator

Central Michigan Research Corp has expanded their existing incubator headquartered in Mt. Pleasant with a new facility in Bay City. The business incubator will be instrumental in helping startups and existing business grow and create jobs.

Like the Mt. Pleasant facility, the Bay City incubator will connect entrepreneurs with the tools they need to grow their business services range from assistance with business plan development, commercial assessments, connections to resources for prototype development, crowdfunding platform access and networking opportunities.

Bay Future

Bay Future, Inc. is a public-private organization serving the greater Bay County area dedicated to economic development strategies which promote and secure opportunities for business retention, growth and the attraction of jobs and business.

The Bay Future, Inc. Strategic Plan recognizes the potential which already exists in Bay County and the need to retain, support and expand existing businesses and promote entrepreneurial growth. Critical to the success of the area is the development of a quality workforce and forging strong partnership with the educational system.

Specific initiatives include:

- Retain and expand the existing business base in greater Bay County
- Establish and reinforce the image of Bay County as a “pro-growth” location within the Great Lakes Bay Region
- Increase the inventory of “shovel-ready” sites/ acres in Bay County and targeted available building space/square feet
- Increase the interest (measured by contacts, visitations, etc.) amongst strategic targeted companies in Bay County
- Improve all aspects of the support network for Bay County entrepreneurs
- Establish an Opportunity Fund to be able to incentivize economic development projects in the County.

By 2024, the Road Map to the Future says that the Bay Area will:

- Have a multi-state reputation for its unique and high-quality sense of place.
- Be highly publicized for its vibrant waterfront, recreational opportunities, historic neighborhoods and unique cultural opportunities.
- Have a multi-state reputation for its dynamic and growing business community.
- Be recognized for its support of entrepreneurs.
- Have a multi-state reputation for its dynamic, diverse and well-educated workforce.
- Be highly regarded for the quality of its preschool through college education system, and for the engagement and support it receives from the community.
Bay City

Promotion of economic development within the city is largely divided among these different entities: the city, Downtown Development Authority and Bay Area Chamber of Commerce.

The City of Bay City fills a somewhat additional role of providing assistance to prospective developers and businesses. Such assistance may include site selection, financing and incentives. The city works closely with other economic development partners.

The Downtown Development Authority confines its activities to area within the dedicated Authority boundaries. By its own description, the DDA focuses on “bricks and mortar” projects to achieve the following:

- Improve the convenience and attractiveness of downtown Bay City to encourage additional private investment and development
- Encourage and participate in historic preservation projects
- Manage the downtown public parking system and facilities
- Capture a 2-mill levy from the ad valorem to complete projects

The City also has a Brownfield Redevelopment Authority, which facilitates an essential mechanism to allow the redevelopment of contaminated and blighted sites. The City established its Brownfield Redevelopment Authority (BRA) on November 1, 1999 pursuant to the Brownfield Redevelopment Financing Act, Public Act 381 of 1996, as amended. The Authority and the City Commission are responsible for review and adopting Brownfield Redevelopment Plans to promote the revitalization of properties that are functionally obsolete, blighted, or environmentally distressed throughout the City.

Perhaps there is no better example of the use of the BRA than the redevelopment of the Uptown at Rivers Edge, Foundry Marketplace, and Columbus Grove projects.

The Bay Area Chamber of Commerce is a business organization that supports economic development activity through services to its members as well as being a strong advocate for business growth in the Bay City area. As a partner in the overall economic development of the City and County, the Chamber’s role is to improve the “economic climate, business environment and quality of living throughout the Bay Area”.

Educational Initiatives

Saginaw Valley State University

Involvement of institutions of higher learning are especially critical to the economic success of the region. The Center for Business Resource and Economic Development (CBED), housed within Saginaw Valley State University (SVSU), plays an important role in supporting the economic growth of East Central Michigan. The CBED’s mission is to enhance the economic vitality of the region by providing technical support for existing businesses; personal and professional development opportunities; programs and services for the manufacturing sector; and commercialization of ideas and inventions whether from within SVSU or from business start-ups across the region. The CBED supports the region’s businesses through the following entities:

- Michigan Manufacturing Technology Center – Northeast
  Assisting area manufacturers to achieve sustained profitability through training and support
- Office of Continuing Education and Professional Development
  Providing quality professional development, new career and personal enrichment opportunities
- Independent Testing Laboratory
  Improving existing products and bringing new products to market through quality analytical services and technical support
- Saginaw Valley Research and Development Corporation
  Taking new technology to commercial viability

The Dow Entrepreneurship Institute at SVSU stimulates creation of new business ventures, serves as a resource for research activities aimed at business innovation, and provides internship opportunities with area businesses for student entrepreneurs.

The Dow Entrepreneurship Institute works closely with faculty teaching Entrepreneurship at SVSU to accomplish the goals of the Institute. It assists by supervising and mentoring student projects, developing new opportunities for students such as the creation of business plans for competition or a new start-up, elevator pitch competitions, business concept competitions and serves as an institutional resource to promote and support entrepreneurship initiatives among SVSU students, faculty, and the region.

Delta College

In 2008, Delta College partnered with regional businesses and Great Lakes Bay Michigan Works! to create the Fast Start training program in response to demand from employers. The program is designed to provide an accelerated learning environment that leads to hireable employees for high-demand occupations. The program won an award from the National Association of Workforce Boards thanks to job placement rates as high as 89 percent. Delta College currently offers four Industrial Fast Start programs (advanced lithium ion battery manufacturing, advanced manufacturing, chemical process operator, and solar manufacturing) and two Non-Industrial Fast Start programs (business process services and customer service representative).
Moving Bay City Forward

How is Bay City currently positioned to cope with the changing economy? The input received from residents and business leaders indicates a mixed result.

If Bay City wants to foster an entrepreneurial environment and attract and retain knowledge economy workers and businesses, it will find itself in a national, and even worldwide, competition. The unique features of the community and its quality of life become increasingly important competitive advantages that need to be protected, nurtured, and promoted.

Traditional Model

Economic development strategies that rely on pursuing the “old economy”, frequently referred to as smokestack chasing, will likely be unsuccessful. Strategies which focus on attracting talent and making the City an attractive place to invest will result in long-term, more sustainable growth. This is clearly the direction established by the Road Map to the Future and is one that Bay City should embrace.

Traditional economic development has focused heavily on financial incentives. The theory behind this approach is that business will only be attracted to a place if there is sufficient financial incentive to do so.

Tax abatements have become the single most common tool for local government to attract business. Tax abatements are so prevalent that when one community offers an abatement, a competing community feels compelled to do the same. While such indirect investment can stimulate private investment, the long term benefit is difficult to quantify.

An even more aggressive approach is to directly invest public dollars in private activity through partnering. Direct investment puts government in the position of becoming a partner, in one form or another, in a private enterprise. Specific direct investment activities typically include optioning and/or assembling land, providing low-cost loans, and providing direct grants. While the return on initial investment may be felt sooner, the public partner also assumes a higher degree of risk.

Many have argued that neither indirect nor direct investment work well in creating sustainable business development. Companies that benefit from direct investment often relocate when a “better deal” is offered elsewhere.

Creating an Investment Environment

There has been a shift in the approach to economic development. This shift seeks to better understand investment decisions made by “new entrepreneurs” and to create an improved investment environment through place.

The decision of either an individual or company to invest in a community will be heavily influenced by
how the community is perceived as an environment for investment. Investments are made based upon an assessment of the potential return and relative risk. The perception of a favorable investment environment will heavily influence the decision.

In formulating an economic development strategy that best responds to the shift in the economy, the first and most essential step is for Bay City to view itself as an environment for investment. Why would someone want to invest in Bay City? What assets, services and growth opportunities does Bay City provide? How can the community be transformed into an environment for investment that is attractive and reduces the risk for the investor?

The perception of an investor regarding the quality of place is also influenced by the message communicated by decision-makers. A strong and positive message of who we are and where we are going can be far more important than any type of incentive that can be offered. A placed-based investment strategy signalizes a stronger commitment to the community and doesn’t reflect policy changes based on political or outside influences. This in turn reflects a stable community, and thus reduces risk.

**Traditional Model of Economic Development**

The traditional approach to economic development emphasized stimulating and partnering in the investment environment. This strategy presumes that the only way to foster economic development is through incentives.

**New Model of Economic Development**

Current thinking is shifting towards creating an environment for investment through placemaking and place-based investment. This approach focuses on improving the community as an attractive place to invest time, talent and money.
Investment Through Placemaking

The premise of placemaking as an economic development tool recognizes the inseparable relationship between quality places and investment. In light of the transformation from a manufacturing economy to a knowledge-based economy, the concept of placemaking is logical strategy that centers on improving a community’s appeal, desirability, and overall quality to drive economic prosperity.

The quality of a place plays a much larger role in today’s economic decisions than in recent years. As capital and people are more mobile than ever, the quality of a place matters more. Quality places retain and attract skilled and talented people who in turn retain and create jobs. People choose to live, and ultimately invest, in places that offer community amenities, social and professional networks, resources and opportunities.

While placemaking is not a new concept, placemaking as a strategy for economic development is receiving increased attention and funding from both the public and private sector. No economic or community development strategy should be viewed as a quick-fix to complex social and economic problems. Placemaking can be an effective economic development strategy, especially targeted towards creating an environment for investment.

Placemaking as an economic development strategy involves coordination between local and state government, businesses, residents, and civic institutions in an effort to increase economic opportunity, improve the quality of public amenities, and increase flow of investment into the built environment. Significant development always builds from existing assets and points of strength. Strong communities have competitive assets. As such, communities without identification of assets and strength are not positioned to utilize placemaking a major development strategy at either the regional or neighborhood level. In order to create and rebuild place, we must encourage local investment to reconnect the economy and community.

Placemaking in the sense of place-based community investment considers the concept in a broader sense as a transformative tool that focuses on talent retention and attraction by creating quality communities, providing quality amenities and services, and offering an overall high quality of life.

Place-based investment takes an inclusive approach to community development by targeting performance-based quality of place initiatives that maximize investment and collaboration by local governments, economic development organizations, and local institutions. This approach coordinates and builds on the combined skills and experience of multiple entities including national, state, and local agencies, business community, community residents, and community leaders.

**Placemaking and Investment**

Bay City is the best example of a downtown turnaround in the 8-county region and perhaps the entire State of Michigan. As recently as the 1980’s, most of the storefronts in downtown Bay City were vacant and boarded up. Since then, community leaders from the public and private sector worked to attract investments, businesses, and new facilities to re-invigorate the downtown.

Today, downtown Bay City is a vibrant, walkable district with an increasing number of residents, businesses, and amenities. Some of the most transformative investments in recent years include the DoubleTree Hotel and events center, the renovated City Hall building, and the Uptown Bay City mixed-use development. Uptown Bay City (which includes new rental and condo housing, new office and medical space, a hotel, restaurants, and shops) is a great example of the type of public-private collaboration needed to achieve success in downtown revitalization.

Source: Regional Prosperity Strategy, SEMCOG 2014.
**Cultivating the Garden**

The key to the future success in Bay City is clear – there needs to be better, high paying jobs. Retaining and growing current small businesses and attracting talent and entrepreneurs is the key to sustainable, long-term job growth. The only question that needs to be answered is, how can the City cultivate an economic garden that creates an environment for investment?

The traditional approach to economic development placed a focus on seeking out and attracting the relocation of large companies. While some communities may be successful with this approach, others have discovered significant limitations, including:

- Expense
- The outlay of substantial financial incentives without the sure guarantee of success
- The requirement of a significant amount of time to see a positive return on such investment
- Inefficiently leveraging a community’s existing assets

Can Bay City risk its limited resources on a strategy that is so highly competitive with other communities?

When the full complement of Bay City’s assets are evaluated, a more successful approach would be to focus on retaining and “cultivating” local businesses by investing in and promoting existing community assets and infrastructure. As opposed to the “hunter and gatherer” approach, Bay City should instead focus on cultivating and improving the foundation for existing companies that have growth potential and attracting the entrepreneurial talent who will form new companies. Companies with strong roots in the community ultimately be the key to growing the local economy and creating higher paying jobs.

Economic Gardening is an approach that looks to cultivate entrepreneurial activity, some of which already exists within the community. In a community which already has 1675 small businesses, the potential is clear. What would be the result if, on average, each small business added one job? The 1675 jobs that would be created are three times higher than the City’s largest employers.

---

**Sustaining an Environment of Investment**

*Bay City is perfectly positioned to capitalize on a sound and sustainable approach which emphasizes two interrelated concepts, economic gardening and placemaking.*
**Economic Gardening focuses on three critical themes:**

- **Infrastructure** – building, promoting and supporting the development of community assets essential to commerce and overall quality of life. Examples include roads, education, and cultural amenities.

- **Connectivity** – improving the interaction and exchange among business owners and critical resources providers. Examples include industry trade groups, public sector supporters, business associations, and academic institutions.

- **Market Information** – access to competitive intelligence on markets, customers, and competitors comparable to the resources historically available only to large firms.

The case for exploring Bay City’s own economic backyard is bolstered by growing body of national research showing small businesses create the vast majority of new jobs:

- An estimated two-thirds (66%) of new private sector jobs created in the last twenty-five (25) years were by small firms (a small firm is defined as one that employs fewer than five hundred (500) employees).

- Small firms employ about half (50%) of the total private sector work force.

- Small firms that employ from one (1) to eighteen (18) employees create the most net new jobs relative to their share of total employment. (Source: David Birch, MIT).

The driving forces behind Economic Gardening include innovating and adapting community assets, efficiently providing the necessary service and infrastructure, and promoting the best logical choices for business growth and development. The success of Economic Gardening methods is entirely dependent on a positive and close relationship between city government and business owners. Open and consistent communication between the local business community and local government is necessary in order to fully understand the needs of the business community and what assets are being provided by the local government.

Growing small businesses seems a natural approach for Bay City. With 95% of its business employing less than 50 workers, there is already a strong base of small business.

**Tying it All Together**

Place-based investment and placemaking initiatives are not mutually exclusive and must be done with cohesion. Growing local businesses without providing a sense of place may be a futile effort. Conversely, creating a place without providing efforts and resources to improve local businesses will not significantly increase economic growth. Placemaking recognizes the connection between public and private investment whereby community assets directly influence development, social change, and wealth creation.

Through the adoption of economic development strategy which focuses on creating an environment for investment, economic gardening, placemaking and place-based investment, Bay City has opportunities to grow the local economy.
The Economics of Place

The Michigan Municipal League released a study entitled Creating 21st Century Communities: Making the Economic Case for Place. MML found a significant relationship between eight aspects of placemaking and economic growth.

Key findings relevant to Bay City include the following:

- Physical design and walkability is positively correlated with property values, income, educational attainment, employment, and new business starts.
- Mixed use, walkable downtown developments generate ten times as much tax revenue per acre, save almost 40 percent on up front infrastructure costs, and result in about 10 percent lower costs for service delivery than sprawl development.¹
- Multimodal transportation systems that accommodate walkers, bikers, bus and rail passengers, and drivers facilitate economic prosperity and growth.
- Policies and investments that support environmental sustainability positively affect community image and attractiveness, and can increase property values, incomes, and employment levels.
- Arts and cultural amenities improve a community’s competitive edge, contribute to a sense of place, and attract visitors, talent, and businesses.
- Entrepreneurial activity, measured through venture capital investment, is positively related to incomes as well as the percentage of adults who are college graduates. It is also positively related to density, biking to work, and employment in the arts, thus reinforcing the relationship between the eight assets.
- Growth-oriented entrepreneurial startups, particularly high-tech companies, are generally responsible for most small business new job creation.
- There is generally more venture capital investment in communities with greater diversity and a welcoming culture.
- Improving school quality and test scores is related to increased home values of as much as 3 percent.²
- Investments in technology, such as high-speed internet infrastructure, accelerate business development by supporting innovation and entrepreneurialism, expanding existing businesses, and creating e-commerce opportunities.

Economic Development Strategy

The strategies related to economic development have been derived from the planning process including public input, the evaluation of economic landscape in the city, and best practices. Primarily these strategies are based on the economic development policies identified in this chapter. Currently, Bay City lacks an overall economic development strategy. Moving forward, the essential elements of a strategy should include:

1. **Develop an Environment for Investment** - An entrepreneurial ecosystem starts with creating an environment where people want to do business and the creative environment flourishes. Local innovators and risk takers should be supported through peer-to-peer mentoring, formation of capital and assistance with permitting.

2. **Remove Obstacle for Investment** - Self-examination never hurts anyone, and the city is no different. What you think runs smoothly may not, and an internal evaluation may reveal unnecessary regulations, policies, and processes.

3. **Invest in Human Capital** - The success of Bay City will be dependent upon innovation and education. This will require strengthening partnerships with Saginaw Valley State University, Delta College and Bay Future.

   The second part of this strategy is to capitalize upon the strong social fabric which exists in Bay City. Bay City will thrive through long-term and committed engagement of its residents seeking their buy-in to a long-term vision.

4. **Invest in an Authentic Sense of Place** - Bay City has so many attractive and multi-dimensional assets that it would be a mistake to be lured into creating phony or contrived place-making, but should instead concentrate in building upon and enhancing existing elements that are already viewed as assets.

5. **Commitment of Leadership** - Local leadership has to do more than talk the talk. Bay City’s ability to create an environment for investment will be directly tied to the ability of leadership to understand local entrepreneurs and small businesses. First, leadership must be committed to creating an environment that promotes and nurtures small business and entrepreneurship. Second, leadership must be willing to open lines of communication with business, accept constructive criticism and celebrate accomplishment.
Chapter 7
Recreation & Entertainment
Overview

Recreation & Entertainment encompasses a wide variety of activities and can have very different meanings for different people. A night out for a recent college graduate is undoubtedly going to be very different experience than a night out with a recently retired couple or with a middle-aged family of four. Age, education, and cultural backgrounds all dramatically impact an individual’s entertainment preferences, resulting in a diverse set of ideas as to what constitutes a quality entertainment experience. Yet despite these different preferences, there is a clear consensus that recreation and entertainment are critical components that directly impact the quality of life of a city’s residents.

Recreation & Entertainment Policies

A diverse range of recreation and entertainment options is an important community asset.

Frequently, a visitor’s first impression of Bay City is its festivals. It is critical that Bay City continue to host and promote festivals and events throughout the year.

Recreation and entertainment opportunities help to attract and retain residents and visitors who, in turn, help bolster the local economy.

Clean, safe, and functional parks encourage use and promote a sense of ownership among users.

A compact and walkable dining, entertainment, and cultural district helps establish a sense of identity for the City and attracts visitors throughout the year.

Unprogrammed “passive-use” open spaces provide a number of health and ecological benefits.

A robust trail system provides non-motorized connections between local and regional amenities, and helps to develop the health and wellbeing of users.

A variety of active-use facilities helps to promote physical fitness and contributes to the general health and wellbeing of residents.
This chapter focuses on four basic areas that cover the most common recreation activities in Bay City. These activities are not hard and fast; there is certainly some overlap between the groups. With that caveat in mind, the four groups are defined as follows:

**Active Sports Participation:**
This group includes any activities that require the participant to be actively involved in the activity at hand. The activities may be individual or team related, and could occur in public or private facilities. There is often, but not always, some level of competition involved. Very simply, any activities defined as a “sport” would fall in this group, including running, hunting, team sports, and anything in between.

**Passive Recreation** rarely has a competitive. Passive activities are self-generated, requiring no administration, and are generally unscheduled. They are more solitary in nature, usually involving individuals or small groups. Many passive recreation activities require access to large natural areas and as a result is more likely to occur on public property. Some common passive recreation activities include biking, picnicking, bird watching, hiking, running, kayaking, photography, going to a dog park, community gardening, or playground play.

**Cultural Activities** usually involve a defined architectural institution, are generally passive in nature; typically, the participant is a spectator. The watched activity could be live or recorded. Participation in cultural activities may be solitary in nature, or could involve thousands of participants. Cultural facilities are often public, but can be privately owned. The most common cultural activities would include attending a theater or sporting event, or visiting a museum or art gallery. City wide festivals and fairs would fall under this category as well, even though they could involve a variety of activities of both a passive and active nature.

**Shopping and dining** refers to events that are not part of a typical day-to-day routine. Shopping in this sense is done for the sheer pleasure of the activity, as opposed to the necessity of shopping for items like groceries. Quite frequently shopping and dining facilities are clustered into designated districts in urban areas. Shopping / dining districts, cultural centers, and business districts are often found in a similar area, providing space for various uses throughout the day and week. The suburban equivalent would be a mall or commercial strip. By its nature, shopping and dining is a private enterprise.
Resiliency, Recreation & Entertainment

One of the key concepts of resiliency is the use of redundancy or variety to reduce the impact of a major event. This concept is applicable to entertainment, both in terms of a city’s population base and entertainment options. A resilient city will have facilities which appeal to a people from range of different age, socioeconomic, and ethnic backgrounds. As tempting as it may be to focus efforts on attracting college educated Millennials, accommodating a variety of individuals will better ensure the long term health of a city and allow it to grow at a sustainable rate.

Entertainment districts, while certainly providing glamour and an immediate splash to a downtown area, tend to appeal to a fairly narrow group of individuals. Cultural districts can have a broader appeal, but only if planners actively work to provide facilities which aim at different user groups. Active use parks are an absolute requirement for younger families and adults, but may be less important for older generations. Passive use green spaces are attractive to a variety of users, but may not meet the physical demands of energetic young children or physically active adults. Event programming, by its very nature, will appeal to different groups of people depending on the type of event.

While recreation represents an expense for a community, the economic benefits offset the initial cost. This is especially true if recreation facilities can be adapted to double as other forms of infrastructure, for example, using parks or open space for stormwater retention. Fortunately for Bay City residents, the region offers a variety of entertainment opportunities for its residents.
**Bay City Recreation Amenities**

Bay City offers a wide variety of both public and private entertainment options. The list below is not meant to be all-inclusive, but instead highlights a few of the opportunities available for residents and visitors:

### Active Sport Facilities:
- Local Parks & Trails
  - Bay County Civic Arena
  - Bay City Rowing Center
  - Bay County Fairgrounds
  - Bay County Riverwalk
  - Carroll Park
  - Coryell Field
  - Defoe Park & Infinity Skate Park
  - Discovery Preserve
  - Hewitt Park
  - Maplewood Park
  - Michigan Sugar Trails
  - Ramsey Park
  - Roosevelt Park
  - Sovereign Field
  - Trombley Park
  - Veterans Memorial Park
- Regional Parks & Trails
  - Crow Island State Game Area
  - Iron Belle Trail
  - Quanicassee Wildlife Area
  - Tobico Marsh Nature Area
- Private Facilities
  - Bay Area Soccer Assoc.
  - Bay City Dance Studio
  - Cosens MMA
  - Washington Lanes
  - many more...

### Passive Use Facilities
- Local Parks & Preserves
  - Bigelow Park
  - Birney Park
  - Breaker Cove
  - Discovery Preserve
  - Golson Nature Area
  - Nate Doan Park
  - Wenonah Park
- Regional Parks & Trails
  - Crow Island State Game Area
  - Iron Belle Trail
  - Quanicassee Wildlife Area
  - Tobico Marsh Nature Area

### Cultural Facilities & Activities
- Movies
  - Goodrich Bay City
- Theaters
  - State Theater
- Professional Sports
  - Great Lakes Loons Baseball (Midland)
  - Tri-City Icehawks
- Museums
  - Saginaw Valley Naval Ship Museum
  - Historical Museum of Bay County
  - Delta College Planetarium
  - Trombley House
- Festivals / Events
  - see page 6 for list
- Libraries
  - Alice & Jack Wirt Public Library
  - Sage Branch Library

### Shopping & Dining
- Shops
  - BC Antiques Center
  - Electric Kitsch
  - Retro Attics
  - Downtown Antiques Market
  - Mid Michigan Music
  - Bay City Motor Co.
- Restaurants
  - Old City Hall
  - American Kitchen
  - Riverfront Grille
- Art Galleries
  - Studio 23 / The Arts Center
  - Ward Studio / Painterly Pottery
  - and many more...
Events, Fairs & Festivals

In addition to providing entertainment and social engagement opportunities for community members, the City’s portfolio of community events provides an informal advertisement to attract residents and entrepreneurs to the community. Some people are attracted to a community with a vibrant entertainment environment, knowing that there are opportunities to engage in a variety of activities throughout the year. However, maybe more importantly, these community events bring people into the City who might not have otherwise visited. Many of the Open House participants mentioned concerts and festivals as “things they love about Bay City.” In addition to providing a boost for local shops and restaurants by attracting additional customers to the area, events give potential residents and business owners the opportunity to experience Bay City’s unique downtown at its best.

The City should continue to support community events. Maintaining positive and functional relationships between the City Government and the DDA has proven to be successful. The City should continue to foster this relationship. The City has done a good job providing an excellent venue for such festivals in the form of the beautifully maintained Wenonah Park along the riverside adjacent to downtown. The connection with downtown along Central Avenue which includes well-maintained sidewalks and other pedestrian facilities should be expanded to other adjacent connector streets like 5th, 6th and 7th streets.

Events must be coupled with connections between the downtown and other areas of the city. As described in the connections chapter, the enhancement of safe and convenient pedestrian and bike facilities would promote the ability of locals to walk or bike downtown to events, helping to alleviate traffic congestion and parking issues at some of the busiest times.

| BAY CITY CALENDAR OF FESTIVALS & EVENTS: |
| March: |
| • St. Patrick’s Day Parade-Center Avenue |
| • St. Patrick’s Day Race-East side streets |
| April: |
| • Easter Egg Hunt-Wenonah Park |
| • Community Cleanup & Compost Giveaway |
| May: |
| • Michigan Walleye Tour Fishing Contest |
| June: |
| • Riverside Art Festival-Wenonah Park |
| • Bay Area Arts Council, events throughout summer at band shell |
| • River Roar-Wenonah and Veterans Park |
| • Hydroplane Races |
| • James Clements Airport Dawn Patrol |
| July: |
| • 4th of July Fireworks Festival-Riverfront |
| • 4th of July parade-Washington Avenue |
| • “EE Cool” Car Show/Wenonah Downtown |
| • Corvette Show-downtown |
| August: |
| • Tall Ships Celebration-riverfront |
| September: |
| • Blooperball Tournament- Defoe Park |
| • Birney Park Car Show-Birney Park |
| • River of Time-Veterans Park/Kantzler Arboretum |
| October: |
| • Homes Tour-city wide |
| November/December |
| • Santa’s Arrival/Wenonah Park |

“We have the best summer festivities! But what happens in the winter? Promote some winter functions for the family!”

-Open House Participant
Cultural, Shopping & Dining

Bay City’s primary cultural amenities are clustered in the central business district, roughly defined as First Street to the north, Columbus Avenue to the south, Madison Avenue to the east, and the Saginaw River to the west. While a few major cultural attractions are situated outside of this district, most are within easy walking distance of each other. Winonah Park provides venue space for festivals and acts as a connection between the downtown area and the river. This combines with downtown recreation facilities to form the core of an entertainment district that supports area restaurants and shopping. The Midland Street urban area provides an additional enclave of shops and restaurants.

Recreation facilities in general benefit from connectivity and proximity. Cultural facilities such as museums, theaters, large sports venues, and other major gathering venues are best centrally located, affording visitors the opportunity to easily travel from one location to other nearby complementary facilities. Restaurants, hotels, shopping, and other entertainment venues can certainly operate independently, but a sense of excitement is created when these facilities are clustered cultural and/or business districts.

Bay City’s primary shopping and dining district tends to cater to older patrons and families, while a second dining area, located west of the river on Midland Street, attracts younger customers and typically remains open later in the evening.
Park Facilities

While shops, theaters, and other cultural amenities benefit from close proximity to one another, parks, nature centers, and open space facilities should be more dispersed around the community. Parks should be easily accessible from home; the National Recreation and Park Association (NRPA) recommends that park facilities in some form be available within a ¼ mile radius of any residence. The space could take any number of forms, from micro-parks and “tot lots” to large regional sports complexes.

Connection between park facilities can be enhanced by continued development of sidewalks, trails, and dedicated bike lanes.

Bay City is very well served by its current configuration of recreation amenities. As the downtown area in particular is developed, it will be important to focus on walkability and complementary services to further enhance the downtown core. Strategic placement and development of passive- and active-use park facilities with an emphasis on diversity of programming and natural area preservation will help to further the City’s goal of resiliency.
Active-Use Park and Sport Facilities

Bay City residents have access to a wide variety of publicly owned active sport resources. Through a combination of state, county, city, and school facilities, residents have the opportunity to participate in a number of different sports and activities.

The primary active use venue in the City is Veteran’s Memorial Park, containing tennis and volleyball courts, softball fields, and fitness equipment. Defoe Park on the City’s north side also includes baseball and softball fields, but it is the adjacent Infinity Skate Park that sets this particular facility apart. The Bay County Civic Arena is home to two ice rinks, providing a space for hockey, figure skating, and speed skating.

In addition to public facilities, the Bay County region is home to a number of private facilities offering training or league play for a wide variety of sports.

Passive-Use Park Facilities

Passive-use park facilities are abundant in Bay City and the surrounding region. These facilities serve a variety of functions, from natural area preservation to providing gathering points for large events.

The two largest passive-use parks in Bay City are Veteran’s Memorial Park and Wenonah Park. The two parks host concerts, festivals, and other events throughout the year. Golson Nature Center, in contrast, contains a 26-acre nature area with trails and boardwalks, and is popular with birding enthusiasts.

On a regional level, the Bay City State Recreation Area contains over 2,000 acres of wetlands and wooded areas and is home to Tobico Marsh, one of the largest remaining freshwater coastal wetlands on the Great Lakes. The park is a popular destination throughout the year, offering facilities for skiing, hiking, camping, swimming, and picnicking.
Trails: According to the Michigan Trails and Greenways Alliance (MTGA), Michigan has more than 3,000 miles of multi-use trails, with more rail-trail systems than any other state in the country. These trails can accommodate a variety of uses and provide an excellent physical activity resource for a range of users.

The Bay City area is very well served by the Bay County Riverwalk and Rail Trail, a 17.5 mile path that travels from the Bay City State Recreation Area south into a loop connecting much of downtown Bay City. The trail traverses a variety of different habitats along the way, from the natural areas to the north to the parks, recreation, and entertainment areas in the City. It offers residents a safe non-motorized alternative for accessing the City’s many recreational opportunities and improves connections between neighborhoods and City amenities.

The Bay County Riverwalk and Rail Trail is an important piece of two larger trail systems. The Great Lakes Bay Regional Alliance (GLBRA) was formed in 2008 to facilitate linking of existing trails across Bay, Midland, and Saginaw counties. When completed, the Great Lakes Bay Regional Trail will be a 100-mile loop connecting the Pere-Marquette and Saginaw Valley Rail Trails with the Bay County Riverwalk and Rail Trail. The Bay City to Saginaw link, which travels south along the Saginaw River through Frankenlust and Zilwaukee Townships, was officially opened in October of 2016.

One of the most ambitious trail projects in the country is the development of the Iron Belle Trail network. The Iron Belle Trail will utilize existing
path and trail facilities across the state to create a 1,300 mile loop from Belle Isle in Detroit up to Ironwood in the far western corner of the Upper Peninsula. The Great Lakes Bay Regional Trail and the Bay County Riverwalk will be part of that system, with the trail running north along Lake Huron before finally turning inland at Oscoda.

The local trail system is an important way to connect residents and visitors to nearby recreation facilities. A prime example of a local opportunity is the creation of a better connection between the Bay City State Recreation Area (BCSRA) and downtown Bay City. The current connection by non-motorized modes of transportation is currently inconvenient for bicyclists and pedestrians. The route does not provide a direct link between downtown Bay City and the BCSRA and may prevent visitors to the BCSRA from taking bike trips to downtown Bay City or vice versa. Providing signage and infrastructure along Henry Street and State Park Drive would help highlight a direct link between the two destinations for bicyclists and pedestrians alike.

In addition to traditional surface trail systems, Michigan boasts over 3,000 miles of water trails. Although there is not an official state-designated water trails program, the Michigan Great Lakes Water Trail Working Group (MGLWTWG) has created a database of water trails in the state. The MGLWTWG, a coalition of volunteers

“There are a number of excellent kayaking trails and in moments from downtown you can be paddling along a historic natural river corridor or a challenging open water setting on the bay.”

- MiCommunityRemarks user
from the Michigan Sea Grant, Land Information Access Association, DEQ, DNR, and US National Park Service, among others, has designated the Saginaw River from Zilwaukee north up to Saginaw Bay, and virtually the entirety of Michigan’s Great Lake shoreline as a “blueway”. The “Saginaw Bay Blueway” spans 18.1 miles along the Saginaw River from Zilwaukee to the DNR boat launch near the mouth of the river. “Tip of the Thumb Heritage Water Trail” is a 140 mile stretch with access at 44 different points along the trail. Bay City is well positioned to attract paddlers, especially with the development of the kayak launch at the Bay City Rowing Club.

The National Recreation and Parks Association estimates that local and regional park activities boosted the national GDP by over $68 billion in 2013, and supported over 1 million jobs. Fairs, festivals, and other major events pump billions into the economy every year, showcasing the host cities and creating a cash influx that spreads well beyond the boundaries of the event itself. Entertainment and shopping districts bring in outside visitors and encourage locals to spend in the city but more importantly, makes living in a downtown center more attractive for some residents.

The Importance of Recreation

During periods of economic stress, one of the first items to be cut from city budgets is funding for recreation and entertainment facilities and programs. This isn’t surprising; it can be difficult to justify “discretionary” spending when it is difficult to acquire funding for basic services. Even in good times, quantifying the benefits of entertainment and recreation amenities is difficult. We all know we like a strong system of parks and a variety of entertainment options, but why? Fortunately, numerous studies help to shed light on why these types of facilities are important to a city.
Economy & Business: As far back as the mid-1800s, recreation advocates have evaluated the installation and maintenance costs associated with park development against the long term value of the park to the city. Frederick Law Olmsted, a prominent planner and father of American landscape architecture, noted that the $13 million spent on developing New York City’s Central Park led to a $209 million dollar increase in property value over 17 years. A 1978 study in Boulder, Colorado found that property values decreased by $10.20 for every foot a development was away from a greenbelt. The resulting increase in tax revenue was enough to recover the initial installation investment in three years. A 2007 study in San Francisco found that homes within 500 feet of a green space were valued at over $125,000 more than similar properties 500 further away.

Beyond simple property values, parks and entertainment centers are crucial in helping to attract and retain both businesses and talent. “Quality of life” surveys routinely favor communities with strong recreation and entertainment options. Study after study note the importance of recreation opportunities to Millennials; In a survey conducted in Madison, Wisconsin, Millennials ranked access to parks and hiking trails as the most important factor behind only a strong job market and inexpensive housing. Recreation facilities and entertainment districts are viewed as important social resources, providing opportunities to gather and meet new and old friends.

Recreation opportunities are important for attracting new businesses to the area as well. The effect on the economy is cyclical; young workers create energy and excitement, which encourages businesses to establish or expand, bringing in more talent who want access
to recreation space. These thriving cultural and recreational centers attract consumers who then patronize other nearby businesses. The end result is a series of new economic opportunities and jobs in both the directly in the cultural districts and in other industries.

Interestingly, many of the same qualities that are attractive to Millennials are attractive to Baby Boomers and empty nesters. 70% of disposable income in the United States is controlled by Baby Boomers, and Boomers outspend younger adults 2:1 on a per-capita basis. Providing facilities that encourage Boomers to spend their retirement years in their home town, also known as “aging in place”, will be critical to the long term success of the City.

**Ecology & Health:** The ecological and health-related benefits of a recreation system can be significant. While residents intuitively know that green spaces offer health benefits, it is often difficult for them to verbalize what those benefits are. The possibility that recreation facilities can measurably impact obesity rates, reduce the risk of chronic health issues such as heart disease, diabetes, cancer, and osteoporosis, and provide a number of ecological benefits, should not be underestimated.

Recreation facilities offer residents an opportunity to be physically active. According to the Center for Disease Control, more than 2/3 of Americans are overweight, while more than 1/3 are obese. Experts attribute the high obesity rate to increased calorie consumption and a lack of opportunities to be physically active.

Though it is not a perfect correlation, states which have more opportunities for outdoor activities tend to have lower obesity rates. Centralized shopping and entertainment districts provide a similar service by encouraging active transportation between venues, as opposed to driving from one location to the next as might be the case in a more suburban setting.

The impact of green spaces on mental health and well-being has been the focus of a number of studies in recent years. Researchers have determined that the percentage of green space inside a one to three mile radius has a significant effect on perceived overall health. Access to natural areas relieves stress, reduces depression, and increases life expectancy. It can help to alleviate symptoms of mental conditions ranging from ADD to Alzheimer’s, has been shown to increase...

**OBESITY RATES IN THE UNITED STATES**

![Image Source: Michigan DNR](image-source-michigan-dnr)

Source: US Center for Disease Control
work performance and satisfaction, and improves learning and memory. There is a direct correlation between available park space and reduced crime and other negative behaviors, such as drug use and violence. The result can be a measurable increase in the overall quality of life of residents.

Parks and open spaces also support environmental sustainability initiatives by providing space for trees and other vegetation. Plants sequester carbon dioxide, a common greenhouse gas and contributing climate change component. Different species of plants can clean a number of other gases and pollutants that are known to cause respiratory problems and damage to buildings. Roughly 1 in 12 Americans suffer with asthma, and that number is growing by 15% each year. The estimated cost of asthma in terms of hospital visits, medication, and other related expenses is $54 billion annually. An analysis conducted by American Forests found that in the city of Atlanta, trees remove 19 million pounds of pollutants each year, a service valued at over $47 million. Park facilities, street trees, and vegetation in other public spaces have the potential to reduce the severity and frequency of asthma attacks in Bay City.

Tree canopies and green spaces are also known to reduce the heat island effect, a condition where dark, impermeable surfaces are heated by the sun during the day, and slowly release the heat back into the air over night. The effect can be dramatic; urban areas can experience temperatures as much as 22°F higher than the surrounding rural countryside. This, in turn, can lead to increased energy consumption, elevated levels of air pollutants, degraded water quality, and a number of other health issues including respiratory problems, heat stroke, and even death. The CDC estimates that more than 8,000 premature deaths occurred between 1979 and 2003 due to excessive heat exposure, a number higher than deaths resulting

THE HEAT ISLAND EFFECT

![Heat Island Effect Diagram](Image Source: Pinterest)
from hurricanes, lightning, tornadoes, floods, and earthquakes combined.

In addition to reflecting heat, trees “breathe” via transpiration, a process where moisture is released through the leaves into the air, providing an immediate cooling effect. The added benefit of shade further cools the area immediately beneath the canopy.

A robust tree canopy can help to mitigate stormwater runoff. Trees intercept and slow rain water, allowing it to infiltrate into the groundwater system rather than simply rushing directly into nearby water bodies. The city of Portland, Oregon, offers residents stormwater rebates for planting trees, noting that a large, mature tree can intercept almost 600 gallons of water per year. Stormwater infiltration prevents salt, mercury, and other pollutants from flowing directly into sensitive waterways.

Parks and preserves present a unique opportunity for development of “green infrastructure” in Bay City. Green infrastructure refers to a number of different technologies that use vegetation, soil, and water to manage surface water, reduce stormwater runoff, and enhance urban environments. By incorporating green infrastructure, Bay City can reduce traditional “gray” infrastructure costs by $120 million and reduce wastewater treatment costs by $661,000 per year.

Joe Taylor Park in Grand Rapids provides a much needed recreation space for the previously underserved Baxter-Green neighborhood. The park features a playground, splash pad, picnic shelter, and restrooms. Joe Taylor incorporates a number of green infrastructure features which helps to treat stormwater runoff from the surrounding neighborhood. An underground stormwater treatment facility, pervious pavement parking lot, and native plant gardens are able to retain and treat stormwater from over 40-acres of urban land. Water from the splash pad is recycled and used for irrigating the parks trees, grass, and shrubs.
treatments which utilize natural processes to retain and control stormwater flow. Specially designed swales, rain gardens, green roofs, constructed wetlands, and similar technologies use natural processes to retain stormwater and reduce peak flow rates. By allowing water to infiltrate into the groundwater system, rather than flow unchecked into waterways, the facilities remove pollutants and prevent waterways from overheating. Reduced flow rates translate into reduced stormwater infrastructure requirements which, in turn, can lead to significantly reduced infrastructure costs.

Green infrastructure can be encouraged and supported by a variety of stormwater regulations, codes, and incentive programs which are discussed in detail in Chapter 6. Bay City’s parks present an opportunity to create demonstration projects which can help to educate City residents about rain gardens, swales, and other infrastructure improvements they can make on their own properties. Additionally, park spaces allow for treatments that are not typically feasible on a small scale, such as the introduction of constructed wetlands. These large-scale treatments provide benefits on multiple levels beyond stormwater management, including passive recreation opportunities for residents, and creation of habitat space.

Because of the City’s position at the mouth of the Saginaw River, Bay City must work with Bay County, state agencies, and upstream communities to help preserve wetlands and open spaces upstream. Retention and control of stormwater flow before it reaches Bay City and Saginaw could prevent millions of dollars in floodwater damage.

The 19-acre Railroad Park in Birmingham, Alabama has brought $185 million in development to the area. In addition to its stormwater management capacity, the park receives 50,000 visitors annually, and provides habitat for numerous species of birds and wildlife.

Historic Fourth Ward Park in Atlanta, Georgia, is situated in an industrial area prone to flooding. The park features a 5-acre storage pond installed in place of a $40 million underground tunnel. The pond is designed to handle a 500-year flood.
Recreation Partnerships: In addition to City and County operations, a number of not-for-profit collaboratives are working to provide green infrastructure and outdoor recreation opportunities for residents in the Saginaw Bay watershed region. This collaborative model creates unique partnerships, bringing together experts from government, the academic world, private businesses, and financial sources who might not otherwise have an interest in recreation and entertainment. These forms of partnerships help to remove some of the financial pressure from municipal entities, while still providing recreation to Bay City residents at little to no cost.

The Outdoor Urban Recreation (OUR) project is an example of one of these collaborations. OUR brings together the Saginaw Basin Land Conservancy (SBLC), with non-profit organizations, municipalities, recreational clubs, businesses, and other foundations. The group is dedicated to re-purposing existing facilities to provide outdoor recreational experiences for area residents. OUR manages four different recreational facilities in Bay City, providing a mix of active and passive recreation opportunities. By bringing together public and private organizations, OUR is able to fund projects that might not be available in typical city parks.

The Saginaw Bay Watershed Initiative Network (WIN) is another collaborative group working in the Bay City area. WIN is a community-based initiatives emphasizing the support of local projects which have...
a direct impact on environmental issues. WIN has developed the following five task groups:

Agriculture / Pollution Prevention: Develops projects specifically dedicated to agricultural production and preventing waterway pollution.

Wildlife Stewardship: Improving and protecting important habitats, education, and provision of access to significant wildlife-related sites.

Water Resources: Addresses water quality issues and other similar concerns.

Land Use: Develops projects to address land use in the watershed.

Communication: Improving communication among WIN members, providing sustainability training, and communicating WIN’s activities to the public.

WIN has provided grant funding for a number of initiatives from trail development to land preservation. Some of the reports and studies they have supported are directly applicable to the Bay City area, including the Saginaw Bay Green Infrastructure and the Kawkawlin River Impervious Surface case studies.

Other reports, such as the Low Impact Development in a Combined Sewer Overflow District study, was created for Saginaw, but has direct applicability for Bay City.

Bay City must identify the collaboratives that are effectively furthering City recreation initiatives, foster their growth, and provide support as needed.
Recreation & Entertainment Strategy

The strategy related to recreation and entertainment has been derived from the planning process including public input, the evaluation of planning and land use issues in the city, and best practices.

1. Provide a diverse array of recreation and entertainment options - A variety of entertainment sources helps attract and retain residents, and bolsters the local economy.

2. Utilize parks and open spaces as green infrastructure - Preserving open spaces can be one of the most cost-effective forms of stormwater management, while simultaneously providing passive recreation opportunities for residents. Bay City should continue to look for dual-use opportunities for their existing park facilities, and investigate opportunities for acquisition of new properties that provide access to the riverfront.

3. Provide a comprehensive trail network - Non-motorized trails reduce the necessity for motorized transportation, which boosts the health and well-being of residents through physical fitness and reducing toxic exhaust emissions. Trails also act as a tourism draw; the rapidly developing Iron Belle Trail could draw thousands of visitors to Bay City each year. Further development of a blue water trail system can help position Bay City as the water destination of eastern Michigan.

4. Create a diverse set of cultural opportunities - Festivals and events draw thousands of visitors to Bay City every year, providing a large boost to the local economy. A vibrant music and theater scene combined with a diverse group of museums, art galleries, and other cultural facilities, provides a year-round influx of visitors, further helping local businesses. Bay City must continue to find ways to enhance and diversify their cultural attractions.

5. Maintain the development of a vibrant and secure downtown dining and shopping district - Shopping and dining complements other cultural activities, bringing life and excitement into the downtown core, while providing an identity for the City.
Chapter 8
Infrastructure
Overview

Community Infrastructure includes the basic physical systems and facilities necessary for a community to function and thrive. These are fundamental public and private systems vital to a community’s development and prosperity. Community Infrastructure includes, but is not limited to: roads, bridges, stormwater drains and sewers, sidewalks, streetlights, traffic signals, community centers, libraries, fire stations, pools, arenas, parks, trails, playground equipment, buses and bus shelters.

Many of the strategies presented in this plan are focused on changing perceptions about the City, both internally and externally. This is an important concept with regards to infrastructure planning as well. The quality of the community’s facilities directly reflects the quality of life that the community can provide. The City must communicate to its residents, as well as outsiders that the City has quality, well maintained infrastructure. Additionally, residents want to know that their tax dollars are being used effectively and efficiently.

The primary goal in infrastructure planning must be to create systems that support the health, safety, and welfare of the community’s residents. A second priority must be given to high impact projects. These projects should either be high profile projects in areas that are highly visible which help to promote the City as a quality investment environment or projects that create or expand facilities that have been identified as important in promoting the quality of life in the community, such as the expansion of a functional non-motorized network, transit facilities, the park system or other public spaces.

Infrastructure Policies

Bay City’s infrastructure systems must support the health, safety, and welfare of the community.

The quality of Bay City’s facilities directly reflects the quality of life that the community can provide.

Public investment in capital facilities can attract private investment.

The Master Plan is the basis for direction in the development of a Capital Improvement Plan: A CIP must be developed with a clear understanding of community objectives regarding growth and land use.

Project coordination across departments is critical to ensuring projects consider all priorities and maximizing public investment.

Asset management can lead to an efficient and cost effective maintenance program based on risk and an overall reduction in the cost of capital.

Expenditures for major capital improvements must be budgeted responsibly and efficiently.

A clear plan for infrastructure development is the primary determinant for when, where, and how intense development in the City can be.
Bay City’s infrastructure was developed to support a much larger population. The general size and form of Bay City as it exists today was the result of growth and development that occurred to a great extent up until the 70s. At a maximum population of nearly 55,000 in the 1960’s the City was developing as if it would continue to grow to a population of 70,000 or more.

In anticipation of continued growth, the physical infrastructure was planned and built to accommodate the growing city. Instead, the population has decreased substantially. This means that the cost to maintain the City’s infrastructure per capita is higher that it could or should be. Couple this with decreasing property values and the City finds itself in a position of having to maintain its infrastructure on a much smaller budget than it should. Bay City has made a commitment to showing residents that the City is being fiscally responsible with their tax dollars.

This means that the City must be extremely diligent and judicious with its budget. In fact, the City, especially in recent years, has made great strides to be more fiscally responsible. A number of major efforts have been initiated that are saving the City millions of dollars. For example, the merger of fire and public safety is an effort that has taken place over the last three years which has proven to be extremely more efficient in the use of personnel. Additionally, multiple departments including the Roads and Utilities Departments have been merged into the Public Works Department.

The Public Works Department is comprised of seven departments which carry out day-to-day operations. The departments include: Street, Sanitation, Fleet, Bridges, Water Distribution, Sewer, and Engineering Services. Their stated purpose is to maintain the City and improve the quality of life for the citizens of Bay City. While much of what both the Public Works Department and the Public Safety Department do is day to day service or infrastructure maintenance, these departments are often involved in major capital outlays for new facilities, new equipment, or infrastructure improvement projects. In order to ensure that expenditures for major capital are budgeted for responsibly and efficiently such projects should be part of a Capital Improvement Plan.

“A civilization’s rise and fall is linked to its ability to feed and shelter its people and defend itself. These capabilities depend on infrastructure - the underlying, often hidden foundation of a society’s wealth and quality of life. A society that neglects its infrastructure loses the ability to transport people and food, provide clean air and water, control disease, and conduct commerce.”

*United States National Science Foundation, 1995*
Capital Improvement Plan

A Capital Improvement Plan (CIP) identifies all new major public facilities to be built, substantially remodeled, or purchased in a community within the foreseeable future. “Capital improvements” (also called “public improvements”) are all major physical facility projects and equipment purchases over and above annual operating expenses. A CIP establishes a schedule, or program, for each capital improvement project according to its priority in the community.

Public investment in capital facilities has a significant impact on the size, location, and timing of future development projects in the community. For this reason, the capital improvements plan for all existing and future community infrastructure must be developed with a clear understanding of community objectives regarding growth and land use as outlined in this Master Plan.

The development of a CIP is a requirement of the Planning Enabling Act. The stated purpose is to further the desirable future development of the community under the Master Plan. Based on the act, the CIP is the responsibility of the Planning Commission.

After the adoption of a Master Plan, the Planning Commission is to annually prepare a capital improvements program of public structures and improvements. In the case of Bay City, the Planning Commission is exempted from this requirement because the City has invoked the option to have the City Commission delegate the preparation of the capital improvements program to the City Administrator. Capital improvement programming is done through the development of the annual budget, subject to final approval by the City Commission.

The capital improvements program is supposed to show those public structures and improvements in the general order of their priority that in the City’s judgment will be needed or desirable, and can be undertaken within the ensuing 6-year period. A CIP is supposed to be updated every year.

Because the CIP is to be based upon the requirements of the local unit of government for all types of public structures and improvements, each agency or department with authority for public structures or improvements must upon request furnish the Planning Commission with lists, plans, and estimates of time and cost of those public structures and improvements.

This should all be filtered through multiple entities including the Planning Commission to help prioritize projects based on which will most effectively promote the goals of the City. Additionally, seeking input from various departments when developing projects for inclusion in the CIP will ensure that projects include all appropriate elements.

With the City budget as the baseline, policy makers can prioritize projects, focusing on the most visible and attractive project that will maintain or attract residents and investors, starting with particular high profile areas such as the downtown, entryway corridors, premiere residential neighborhoods, or other community assets like the riverfront.

When deciding on a project policy makers should ask themselves, “will this project support or advance the City’s major goals of improving community identity, stimulating the economic environment, stabilizing the housing market, or making the City more resilient.
Asset Management

An asset management system is a tool used to catalog all municipal assets. Typically assets management focuses on utility structures, but could include much more depending on how robust the program is. There are a number of programs that have been developed to facilitate asset management, most of which can be custom designed for individual community needs. These programs are GIS based and are predominantly marketed towards utility departments because they can easily generate work orders and electronically keep records of maintenance and repair. However, with a GIS based system, these asset management tools can catalog many layers of information including anything from water lines and hydrants to trees in parks or on streets. With these tools, the City can inventory the asset, maintain a record of it age, maintenance, and even predict when maintenance or replacement could be optimized in order to prepare fiscally for such work.

Bay City should be focused on managing assets in a way in which the investment for each asset can be optimized producing a reduction in capital budgets and operating expenditures, an efficient and cost effective maintenance program based on risk and an overall reduction in the cost of capital. This means that with careful asset management, the City can try to predict when maintenance or replacement would be necessary in order to avoid unexpected costly repairs. Likewise, using predictive tools, based on an asset’s age and maintenance records, maintenance or replacement will not be done prematurely.

Through the use of an asset management system using GIS technology multiple layers of information can be overlaid to determine all infrastructure that exists geographically at any location within the City.
Coordination

Capital improvements should be developed with consideration for all potential improvements. A multidisciplinary approach will create a consistent management-wide effort to guide investments and resource allocation. There must be coordination for all infrastructure improvement projects between all departments who might have interest in the project area.

There are often multiple layers of infrastructure that are, or could be, involved with any project. For example, if the long-term non-motorized transportation plan contains a road cross section that includes bike lanes, sidewalks and a buffer zone, the DDA plan includes on street parking, new parking meters, and new street lights, the road maintenance department should include these elements in engineering design plans for any major road project. Also, if the asset management program indicates that water pipes are due for maintenance or an upgrade within the next two years, it may make fiscal sense to perform the maintenance or perform upgrades with the current project if the roadway is scheduled to be worked on anyway. Alternatively, it may be better to defer the road work in this area for the next fiscal year, if possible, in order to coordinate with the utility maintenance schedule.

Decision Making Structure

In order to perpetuate this strategy, the City must create a procedural structure to produce an annual capital improvement plan. Policy leadership is ultimately the responsibility of the City Commission. The development of the plan should include participation from a variety of groups including department heads and especially the input and endorsement from the Planning Commission.

A steering committee made up of all department heads chaired by the City Manager could oversee the initial development of the CIP. Each department could submit requests for capital improvements related to their work. All proposals should then be evaluated by the steering committee to ensure that all critical components of any particular project are considered or included. The committees should have cross departmental representation. Input from other departments is important as each may be focused on different components which may be critical for particular projects.

After refinement at the committee level the proposed plan should be provided to the Planning Commission for evaluation and comment based on the policies and strategies articulated in the Master Plan. Ultimately the plan should be presented to the City Commission for final approval and inclusion in the annual budget.
Prioritization

With limited resources priority must be given to highly visible, high profile, projects that will make the City more attractive as an investment environment to existing resident business owners, and those the City would like to attract. The goal is to be able to retain and attract stable households who are educated and skilled in order to stabilize the housing market, as well as inform entrepreneurs, business owners, and developers that investing in this community is sound investment.

The City must maintain and provide the infrastructure that supports public health safety and welfare. Public safety is important to everyone. The City must convey the merits of the public safety infrastructure to the community, as well as safe and efficient utility systems. These components may be less visual, but no less important to convey. This can be done through various communication techniques such as the website and promotional materials, but will ultimately come from changed perceptions and word of mouth.

While the City can't neglect critical systems that are in need of maintenance, in some cases deferment can be a better option when trying to create an attractive investment environment. If certain projects are expected to garner more return on investment in terms of making the City more attractive. The strategic implementation plan in this Master Plan should be used to provide direction to the CIP.

Ultimately, with budget constraints, priorities will have to be made. The premise of this strategy is that every decision that is to be made must come from the basis of improving the City's image, and improving the investment environment by conveying strong quality community infrastructure and the long term commitment of the community to continue to invest. This strategy relies on focusing investment in certain areas and ensuring that projects include elements that enhance the sense of place. The areas of focus selected for prioritization included existing strong neighborhoods or tipping point neighborhoods that are located adjacent to gateway corridors and adjacent to assets such as the historic downtown, the Midland Street area, as well as those urban core areas themselves.

In an attempt to ensure new development in the downtown is consistent with the existing character and the historic massing of the downtown, we are proposing a new zoning tool for the urban areas that focuses on form and design. There are many opportunity sites downtown, but they must be developed in the most appropriate way. A form that is consistent with the existing urban form will stand the test of time and will add to the attractiveness of the City. Community investment in the kind of infrastructure and street design will be an important way to attract private investment and make these sites more marketable.

With limited resources and the desire to have impact project in highly visible areas it means that investment must be focused in certain areas in the near term to ensure that projects are complete. This can be done with a long term focus on the vibrancy and vitality of the whole community because the CIP will be evaluated every year, and the Master Plan must be revisited every five years. The City can focus on incremental and attainable goals.
Infrastructure Strategies

Strategies related to infrastructure have been derived from the planning process including public input, the evaluation of infrastructure need, planning, and land use issues in the City, and best practices. Primarily, these strategies are based on the infrastructure policies identified in this chapter.

1. Develop a Capital Improvement Planning Structure – Create procedures by which a capital improvements plan will be developed for inclusion in the annual budget. The process should include input from department head under the oversight of the City Manager, with a review and recondition from the Planning Commission, and ultimate approval from the City Commission.

2. Invest strategically in target areas – Discretionary capital investment in infrastructure should be targeted to priority areas that will have the most impact on retention and attraction of residents, businesses, and private developers. This should include areas in or around the urban core, as well as primary gateway corridors into the community.

3. Infrastructure project must support community policies - When making decisions about capital improvements, policy makers must evaluate individual proposals for their impact and ability to further community goals. Each project should promote internal and external perceptions of the community. Each investment must enhance the investment environment in the City.

4. Develop an asset management system - Utilizing a geographic based information system the City can develop a tool to inventory all community assets including community infrastructure such as roads, sidewalks, utilities, tree, etc. in order to efficiently and effectively manage the maintenance of each asset.

5. Project coordination – Ensure that when infrastructure projects are being developed, whether major new projects or regularly secluded maintenance or upgrades, all potential infrastructure initiative within the project scope are considered. Project timing and funding should be coordinated with other improvements in order to maximize the expenditure of public dollars.
Six Forms of Green Infrastructure

**Constructed Wetlands** mimic natural wetlands by using vegetation to retain and “soak up” stormwater. While they require a significant capital investment and take up a large area, they also have the potential to treat the greatest volume of stormwater while simultaneously providing habitat and a passive recreation opportunity.

**Rain Gardens & Bioswales** operate much like wetlands, but usually at a smaller scale. Bioswales are essentially vegetated ditches, while rain gardens are low depressions designed to drain within 24 hours. Both capture rainwater from impervious surfaces and allow it to infiltrate into the ground. Use of native plants ensures habitat for insects and a variety of other animals.

**Green roofs** would be unusual in a park project, but could be included as part of a facility building or other structures. Green roofs intercept and slow rain before it reaches the ground, reducing peak flow rates and reducing loads on traditional “gray” storm sewer systems.

**Permeable Pavement** is available in a variety of forms, from traditional brick to permeable asphalt and concrete. Permeable pavement allows water to run through pores in the joints or in the material itself, reducing or eliminating the need for costly piping. Permeable paving can be problematic in northern climates, and does require periodic vacuuming to ensure the pores remain clear.

**Cisterns** are usually installed under permeable pavers and are designed to retain the first flush of a rain event. Stormwater is channeled into chambers and slowly infiltrates into the ground. Cisterns can be expensive, but are useful where space is limited. **Rain Barrels** are small scale, above ground solutions that can temporarily retain roof runoff. One advantage of rain barrels is that the saved water can be used later for irrigation.

**Trees and mass plantings** are probably the most cost effective forms of and provide the widest array of benefits. Trees and vegetation slow and store rainwater, provide habitat, reduce heat islands, clean the air, and provide numerous opportunities for recreation. Larger native plants, as opposed to turf grass, provide significantly greater overall benefits.
Implementation Matrix
# Physical Projects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project / Action</th>
<th>Details/Location</th>
<th>Responsibility</th>
<th>Timeline</th>
<th>Supports</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Install “connector” cross section along Thomas and Jenny Streets</td>
<td>From Euclid to Veteran Memorial Bridge. Reduce the number of lanes to two. Add bike lanes. Install street trees where missing. Install decorative lighting. Upgrade crosswalks.</td>
<td>PWD</td>
<td>Years 1-2</td>
<td><img src="icon1" alt="icon" /> ![icon2] ![icon3]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Install “Urban Mixed” cross section along Washington Avenue.</td>
<td>Phase 1 From Columbus Ave. to Central Ave. Reduce the number of lanes to two with a center turn lane/vegetated median. Add bike lanes. Expand pedestrian realm to include wider sidewalks and landscape buffers. Include parking lane.</td>
<td>PWD</td>
<td>Years 1-2</td>
<td><img src="icon1" alt="icon" /> ![icon2] ![icon3]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upgrade infrastructure during road construction projects.</td>
<td>Upgrade utilities where required. Install green street stormwater facilities. Add or upgrade pedestrian and biking amenities.</td>
<td>PWD</td>
<td>Years 1-2</td>
<td><img src="icon1" alt="icon" /> ![icon2] ![icon3]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Complete active transportation network.</td>
<td>Complete gaps in the sidewalk and trail network. Provide enhanced bus stops at strategic locations. Insure the pedestrian/biking network is complete by insuring that destinations are accessible and have amenities such as bike parking facilities.</td>
<td>PWD</td>
<td>Years 1-2</td>
<td><img src="icon1" alt="icon" /> ![icon2] ![icon3]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continue the removal of abandon/condemned housing.</td>
<td>Prioritize target areas as identified in housing chapter and housing study. Explore opportunities to increase funding for the removal project.</td>
<td>Community Development/ Code Enforcement</td>
<td>Years 1-5</td>
<td><img src="icon1" alt="icon" /> ![icon2] ![icon3] ![icon4]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maintain vacant property.</td>
<td>Where housing has been removed, maintain vacant lots in good condition through the land bank. Convert vacant properties to neighborhood parks. Convert vacant properties to stormwater facilities.</td>
<td>Land Bank/ Community Development/ Code Enforcement</td>
<td>Years 1-5</td>
<td><img src="icon1" alt="icon" /> ![icon2] ![icon3] ![icon4]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Install stormwater facilities on vacant land.</td>
<td>On public lands with open space available, especially along the river, install stormwater facilities such as detention or retention ponds. Install constructed wetlands, bio swales, rain gardens and other innovative stormwater systems.</td>
<td>PWD</td>
<td>Years 1-5</td>
<td><img src="icon1" alt="icon" /> ![icon2] ![icon3] ![icon4]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extend a new road with the “connector” cross section across the vacant lot south of McKinley.</td>
<td>Extend the drive which goes through the parking lot north of E. Main Street to connect uptown to 9th street or beyond to McKinley if possible, based on the corridor plan on page 14.</td>
<td>PWD</td>
<td>Years 1-5 or if development occurs</td>
<td><img src="icon1" alt="icon" /> ![icon2] ![icon3] ![icon4]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Regulatory Projects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project / Action</th>
<th>Details/Location</th>
<th>Responsibility</th>
<th>Timeline</th>
<th>Supports</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Update Article V in the Zoning Ordinance.</td>
<td>Create Mixed Density Overlay district regulations. Such district should dictate scale and design as well as density and proximity for multi-unit buildings within the single family neighborhood. Update the Zoning Map to remove R-2 district and convert zoned properties to R-1. Include the overlay in areas consistent with Future land use map.</td>
<td>Community development/Planning Commission/City Commission</td>
<td>Year 1</td>
<td>![Icon](V THIS.png) ![Icon](V THIS.png) ![Icon](V THIS.png)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Update Article VIII in the Zoning Ordinance to include a form based code.</td>
<td>Create a form based code to regulate development in the Urban core areas and older mixed use corridors. Such regulations should dictate building scale, location, and design in order to be consistent with existing character or vision for such locations. Update the zoning map.</td>
<td>Community development/Planning Commission/City Commission</td>
<td>Year 1</td>
<td>![Icon](V THIS.png) ![Icon](V THIS.png) ![Icon](V THIS.png)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blight / Property maintenance enforcement</td>
<td>Aggressively promote property maintenance in priority target areas as identified in housing chapter and housing study. Efforts should include educational outreach through organizations such as CDC, direct engagement through code enforcement officer, and support through partner organizations or potential innovative techniques such as a revolving loan program.</td>
<td>Community development/Code enforcement</td>
<td>Years 1-5</td>
<td>![Icon](V THIS.png) ![Icon](V THIS.png) ![Icon](V THIS.png) ![Icon](V THIS.png)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Require developers to install non-motorized facilities.</td>
<td>Update development requirements to explicitly require developers to install non-motorized facilities within the influence of their development according to the master plan or any subsequent transportation plans.</td>
<td>Community development/Planning Commission</td>
<td>Years 1-5</td>
<td>![Icon](V THIS.png) ![Icon](V THIS.png) ![Icon](V THIS.png) ![Icon](V THIS.png)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Require development with river frontage to maintain open space.</td>
<td>Update development regulations to require the preservation of land along the river for stormwater facilities and the maintenance of creation of public access along the river.</td>
<td>Community development/Planning Commission</td>
<td>Years 1-5</td>
<td>![Icon](V THIS.png) ![Icon](V THIS.png) ![Icon](V THIS.png) ![Icon](V THIS.png)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Organizational Projects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project / Action</th>
<th>Details/Location</th>
<th>Responsibility</th>
<th>Timeline</th>
<th>Supports</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Community Partner Assessment</td>
<td>Identify the city’s community partners. Evaluate who is engaged in various initiatives to determine where they align with goals and strategies identified in the master plan.</td>
<td>Community Development</td>
<td>First 6 months</td>
<td><img src="" alt="flag" /> <img src="" alt="apples" /> <img src="" alt="water" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop an Economic Development Strategy</td>
<td>Focus on the development of an investment environment though public investment in placemaking and community assets. Employ the cooperation of all community partners engaged in the promotion of the city, as well as attraction and retention of businesses. Investments should be prioritized through capital improvements planning. Focus on priority target areas.</td>
<td>Community Development/Economic Development/Community Partners</td>
<td>Year 1</td>
<td><img src="" alt="flag" /> <img src="" alt="apples" /> <img src="" alt="water" /> <img src="" alt="house" /> <img src="" alt="mask" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop a Marketing and Banding Campaign</td>
<td>Identify the community assets to be used to promote various aspects of the city. Develop messaging language and visual components to be used. Identify multiple techniques to communicate the message locally, regionally, and state wide.</td>
<td>Community Development/Economic Development/Community Partners</td>
<td>First 6 months</td>
<td><img src="" alt="flag" /> <img src="" alt="apples" /> <img src="" alt="water" /> <img src="" alt="house" /> <img src="" alt="mask" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop a Communications Plan</td>
<td>Develop protocol for spreading the community’s message to ensure that messaging is consistent throughout all City departments, commissions, committees, and community partners. Designate a communications liaison to manage communication internally and externally.</td>
<td>City Manager</td>
<td>First 6 months</td>
<td><img src="" alt="flag" /> <img src="" alt="apples" /> <img src="" alt="water" /> <img src="" alt="mask" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refine the budget/CIP development process</td>
<td>Create a Capital Improving Plan development process that includes input from all departments overseen by the city manager with guidance from the Planning Commission based on direction from the Master Plan.</td>
<td>City Manager</td>
<td>Year 1</td>
<td><img src="" alt="man" /> <img src="" alt="flag" /> <img src="" alt="apples" /> <img src="" alt="water" /> <img src="" alt="house" /> <img src="" alt="mask" /> <img src="" alt="city" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix A
Community Profile
Introduction

An important prerequisite to preparing an update to the Bay City Master Plan is to develop a common understanding of the current state of the community as well as future trends. Information and data gathered through the planning process is critical to anticipate needs and prospective development. The Community Profile is intended to synthesize and communicate conditions and tendencies, as well as the dynamic economic, social, and environmental forces brought on by various forms of growth and change.

To create an indepth analysis of Bay City’s demographics, the Community Profile has retrieved information from the 2010 Census, 2010-2014 American Community Survey (ACS), and relevant studies by the City and County. The Community Profile provides an inventory of existing conditions including population and household demographics, housing, local economy, land use, and transportation. A mutual understand of the community leads to a clearer vision for Bay City.
Population

Over the last several decades, the population has steadily decreased, with its peak in 1960 at almost 54,000. In 2010, the population was almost 35,000, dropping 500 people more in 2014 according to the 2014 5-year ACS. In the 1960s, Bay City was a booming industrial town. With a decrease in industrial and production jobs, population has followed with employees looking for work elsewhere. The last few decades have shown losing about 2,000 people every 10 years.

Source: Census and 2014 ACS 5-Year Estimate
As the county seat and largest municipality in Bay County, Bay City has been a center of commerce, industry, government and culture. In addition, Bay City is home to two colleges, Delta College and Saginaw Valley State University. To accommodate the wide variety of residents, there is a mix of housing options available.

While the majority of housing is owner-occupied, renters make up a third of the occupied housing units, contributing to the multi-family units. Most of the multi-family units are only 2-9 units. Single family attached homes and large 10-50+ multi-family units are relatively rare. A large percentage of owner-occupied housing explains that the majority of housing units are single family detached.
About one in every ten of the available housing units is currently vacant. The City has a larger percentage of vacancy in comparison to Bay County which is 9% (2014 ACS). The vacancy rate in 2000 was half what it was in 2014 (2000 Census).

With only 8% of houses costing $100,000 or more, Bay City offers an affordable housing market. The median house value in the City is $68,800, which is considerably lower than the median cost in Bay County of $93,300. Rent is also $100 cheaper for City residents at $551 compared to the County’s $650.
The largest population of people in Bay City are between 25 and 34 years old. From 2000 to 2010, the largest decrease in population was between 25 and 44 years old. However, this population may have gotten older since there is an increase of 1.6% in the next age group of 45 to 54 year olds. The 55 to 59 age group gained the greatest increase from 2000 to 2010 at 2.1%. Although the 65 and over population decreased between 2000-2010, that trend will reverse in future years. While in 2010 this age cohort comprised 12.2% of the City’s population, by 2021 the over 65 population will increase to over 15%.

The median age of residents in Bay City has increased, but only slightly at 0.6 years from 2000-2010. As the older population ages, the median age follows. This trend continues to increase and by 2021 the median age will be 37.1 years of age.
Race

The population of Bay City is generally white, but there is a growing population of hispanics as the population has increased over 20%. Black and white populations both decreased over the last decade and a half by 5.5% and 9.6%, respectively.

Race, 2000 to 2014, Bay City

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race</th>
<th>2000</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>Change</th>
<th>% Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Non-Hispanic White</td>
<td>32,333</td>
<td>29,226</td>
<td>-3,107</td>
<td>-9.60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Hispanic Black</td>
<td>972</td>
<td>919</td>
<td>-53</td>
<td>-5.50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic</td>
<td>2,473</td>
<td>3,020</td>
<td>547</td>
<td>22.10%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: 2014 ACS 5-Year Estimate
The fields of sales, service, and management are the largest employers for Bay City. As a center for commerce for Bay County, these sectors are understandably the largest groups. The employment distribution changed in the last couple decades, due to a decrease in production and construction. This paradigm shift in industry is also associated with the population drops. With this recent change in jobs, Bay City must rely on other industries. An increase in service and natural resources within the last decade suggests that other industries are taking over for production and construction.

Over the last fifteen years, Bay City has had a drop in household income due to population decrease. However, the data suggests that there has been an increase in households making $75,000 or more and decreases in households making less than $25,000.

Median household income is about $36,000, almost $10,000 less than the County average of about $45,000. This is up from $30,000 in 2000, however, with inflation, the number is actually a decrease, not an increase.
Household Income, 2000 to 2014, Bay City

Source: Census and 2014 ACS 5-Year Estimate

Median Household Income, 2000 to 2014, Bay City

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Median household income</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>$30,425</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>$35,561</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>$36,179</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Census and 2014 ACS 5-Year Estimate
Education

The education of the population 25 years and older includes a majority of high school graduates. Less than half have more than a high school diploma. From 2000 to 2014, there has been a decrease in individuals with an education of less than high school. Associates degree and bachelors degree or more has gone up significantly between 2000 to 2014.

### Educational Obtainment, 2000 to 2014, Bay City

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Educational Obtainment</th>
<th>2000</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>Change</th>
<th>% Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Less than High School</td>
<td>4,063</td>
<td>3,152</td>
<td>-1,451</td>
<td>-31.50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High School Graduate</td>
<td>9,019</td>
<td>8,195</td>
<td>-824</td>
<td>-9.10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some College</td>
<td>5,522</td>
<td>5,501</td>
<td>-21</td>
<td>-0.40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associates Degree</td>
<td>1,784</td>
<td>2,147</td>
<td>363</td>
<td>20.30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor's Degree or More</td>
<td>3,065</td>
<td>3,675</td>
<td>610</td>
<td>19.90%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: 2014 ACS 5-year estimates, population of 25 years old and older*
Appendix B
MiCommunityRemarks Comments
MiCOMMUNITY REMARKS
City of Bay City
Bay County

Carlisle/Wortman Associates
Source: ESRI, Bay County
1-11-17
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Housing and Neighborhoods</td>
<td>I would like to see more housing downtown.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Economic Development</td>
<td>another waterfront property that can have connection to the park and the Railtrail.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Recreation and Entertainment</td>
<td>This open space is critical to our community, and should not be under consideration for development. Bay City is rare in that it has significant public open space on both sides of the River, something many communities cannot claim. Once it is gone it is gone! The current master plan states under &quot;Goals, Objectives, and Strategies&quot;; that public spaces should be maintained in their optimal physical condition for their intended uses. It further states to protect open space and recreation areas from conversion to other uses. Lastly it adds maximize recreation and open space use along the riverfront. To construct a pavilion or any building on the open green space in Wenona Park would not be in the best interests of the majority of the residents of the community.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Recreation and Entertainment</td>
<td>Constructing a pavilion in Wenonah Park is a bad idea. This park is a beautiful span of green space and trees with a good view of the river. We have so little green space as it is in our downtown district. We need to preserve our green spaces in parks; not cover them up with big structures. There is already a big structure in the park the amphitheater. This pavilion will certainly be a hindrance to viewing the fireworks and other events on the water. It will interfere with the view of the river for folks enjoying a stroll downtown and in the park including condo owners and Double Tree's customers. The DDA board members, city staff officials and other community advocates created a beautiful and useful long-term plan for the park about 10 years ago. A lot of sound planning, expertise advice and solicited public opinion went into this plan. The plan is still viable today. All needs were considered. It was also a costly plan documented by experts. The pavilion idea will put a big hole into the DDA's park's master plan. I suspect that the recent pavilion planners did not take the thoroughly thought out DDA's long-term master plan into account. With a pavilion long term maintenance will be necessary. Perhaps vandalism issues will ensue. Both are costly. Parking will certainly be an issue and especially problematic for the Double Tree operators. There must be other locations in the City that could benefit by restoration and a new pavilion. There are better and existing locations for an outdoor ice rink. Let's not ruin our prime property in the Wenonah Park.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Recreation and Entertainment</td>
<td>The River walk is in need of major maintenance projects. Much of the pathway is in poor shape needing resurfacing; the bridge to the middle ground needs repairs and painting; the pier on the pavilion the pier needs repair and painting; many trees along the water front are overgrown with roots causing damage to the pathway; many benches and other amenities need help. The Riverwalk committee is aware of these issues. However, local support and funding is needed to accomplish all these projects.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Recreation and Entertainment</td>
<td>The County recently led an effort to map the Saginaw Bay Blueways Trail showing public access entry points for kayaking and various water routes, including the Saginaw River through Bay City and along the Saginaw Bay. There are a number of excellent kayaking trails and in moments from downtown you can be paddling along a historic natural river corridor or a challenging open water setting on the bay. Also there is, or will be soon, a virtual historic maritime narrative (Bay County Historical Society) that can be downloaded identifying historic battle scenes and various points of interest along the Saginaw River and Bay. The Blueways Trail could be included in the Master Plan as a recreational feature along with expanded recognition of the river and the bay for sailing, boating opportunities, water based recreation. The water quality in the river and bay have substantially improved through construction of wastewater treatment basins to treat during large storm events and draws visitors to our marinas and shoreline. The river is sampled weekly from May to September to ensure it meets the state's Recreational water quality standards.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Recreation and Entertainment</td>
<td>The proposed Pavilion in Wenonah Park is a project that will help bring more vitality to the downtown area not just in the short warmer weather months but also the winter months! I have discussed the project in length with the developers and discussed the pros and cons and the pros far outweigh the cons of this project. I am in full support of this and when they start crowdfunding for this I am going to jump on board with it and get others to as well.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Category</td>
<td>Comment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Recreation and Entertainment</td>
<td>I've been in Bay City since 1974 and watched the city slowly dwindle down to its current state. My High School classmates left because we lacked vision and jobs. We have an opportunity in front of us right now with the proposed pavilion. The project has funding, detailed plans, and visionaries who will make this a first-class project. Every time I ride my bike by this proposed location, there is NO one there, yet people portray that we need this 50x100 ft section of grass to for those to use. I have yet to encounter anyone sitting there playing frisbee with their child or dog or even walking on the grass. It's not used period. The footprint of the pavilion is smaller than a swimming pool. We are not living in NYC where the only grass is in Central Park. We are in Bay County which is surrounded by open fields and green space everywhere. There are 97 acres of grass already in the park systems of Bay County. We don't need more grass to mow. What we do need are people with vision who want to improve Bay City and develop it. I support the proposed Pavilion 100 and I would ask those who are opposed to please stop being so set in your ways that you refuse to compromise. The team of people who drafted the original plans have demonstrated they can compromise. They scaled back the initial plans based on feedback. I support the project and the leaders with vision like this who are trying to advance the city.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Recreation and Entertainment</td>
<td>I've been in Bay City since 1974 and watched the city slowly dwindle down to its current state. My High School classmates left because we lacked vision and jobs. We have an opportunity in front of us right now with the proposed pavilion. The project has funding, detailed plans, and visionaries who will make this a first-class landmark. Every time I ride my bike by this proposed location, there is NO one there yet people portray that we need this 50x100 ft section of grass to for those to use. I have yet to observe anyone sitting there on a blanket playing Frisbee with their child or dog or even walking on the grass. The grassy area is not used by anyone other than the tents that go there for Tall Ships for 4 days every three years. The footprint of the pavilion is smaller than a swimming pool. We are not living in NYC where the only grass is in Central Park. We are in Bay County which is surrounded by open fields and green space everywhere. There are 97 acres of grass already in the park systems of Bay County so why do we need more grass to mow? What we do need are people with vision who want to improve Bay City and develop it. I support the proposed Pavilion 100 and I would ask those who are opposed to please stop being so set in your ways that you refuse to compromise. The team of people who drafted the original plans have demonstrated they can adjust. They scaled back the initial plans based on feedback. I support the project and the leaders with vision like this who are trying to advance the city.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Housing and Neighborhoods</td>
<td>The Bay City downtown area is undergoing a historic revitalization but there still remains a real shortage of new high quality affordable housing opportunities designed and operated to exclusively serve seniors residents 55 and older. There are many retirees or those still working middle income seniors who desire to live in the downtown center with walkable proximity to the services and amenities readily available and yet to come in Bay City's renewing downtown district. Many of these middle income seniors earn too high of income to qualify for public housing assistance yet cannot afford higher end market rate rents. A new non-subsidized rental development targeted for middle income or lower income seniors would attract this underserved segment of the population which will bring more customers to the commercial interests of the downtown economy. There is great momentum now in the market demographics and local communities towards creating walkable environmentally sustainable communities. People who live downtown tend to buy locally especially if these outlets are within walking distance. A viable community is not complete unless it provides decent affordable housing opportunities to all sectors of the population. Downtowns cannot flourish without increasing the number of full-time residents living near commercial businesses, public parks, museums, restaurants, churches, government offices, and other community services that all need customers to succeed. The new Bay City Master Plan should encourage and support non-subsidized affordable housing, economic jobs creation, and workforce developments in the City. This approach would pave a pathway for continued growth and rejuvenation in the community. Ideally the new Bay City Master Plan will design an approach to help the City develop private and public strategies to encourage economic growth and social equity in the downtown and all areas of the City so that all segments of the community will have the opportunity to live in a revitalized urban setting enjoying all of the wonderful assets that can be and will be found in Bay City.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Category</td>
<td>Comment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Community Identity</td>
<td>Put up signage to celebrate our cultural diversity in neighborhoods that have become a melting pot of American tradition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Housing and Neighborhoods</td>
<td>Get rid of the blighted properties save our home values</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Environmental Resiliency</td>
<td>Better rain run-off control in the SouthEnd Too many flooded basements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Community Identity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Recreation and Entertainment</td>
<td>Give Sovereign Field to Northeast Little League  They manage and run this today and with the changes to City Park usage by Little Leagues it is ridiculous to not turn this over as it has been Little League park from the beginning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Economic Development</td>
<td>The gravel lot should be turned into a paved parking lot to offer more parking during the busy times</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Community Identity</td>
<td>What is the stench that you smell at WS Saginaw and Euclid that you smell coming into Bay City</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Housing and Neighborhoods</td>
<td>Please don’t allow any more low income housing It has left houses empty which turn to blight</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Recreation and Entertainment</td>
<td>A child’s playplaceswingset would be great in this area  I think the park would be more utilized if there was something for the kids to do near the downtown district and it would give the adults more reason to come downtown if they do have a family  There are only so many stores a little child can take - give them an avenue to expend some energy and maybe more people would be drawn to the area  It’d also give the kids something to do during all of the festivals and events that take place near Wenonah Park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Community Identity</td>
<td>Continued efforts geared at cleaning the river and beaches are warranted  As a city I think our identity is strongly tied to the waterways rivers and bay  While progress has been made in some areas tourism could continue to grow if we are able to better clean up the beaches and rivers to be known as the water destination on the east side of the state  Added tourism warrants additional businesses bringing new job opportunities  Making these areas more desirable will drive residents to take advantage of them as well  Population could also increase as employees in neighboring cities may choose to reside here</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Housing and Neighborhoods</td>
<td>The many vacant second-floor spaces downtown are an unused available resource for housing that would if filled put many more people on downtown streets Can an incentive program such as a tax abatement for improvements be promoted to help make the necessary renovation work financially possible for property owners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Category</td>
<td>Comment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Recreation and Entertainment</td>
<td>I am not against the proposed pavilion project only the proposed location within Wenonah Park. The result of hundreds of man hours and thousands of dollars after the most recent Master Plan Review was that a multi-use structure would be a wonderful addition to the Bay City park system - in Veterans Memorial Park. I agree. The winter activities would be a wonderful complement to the existing sledding activities and bring new life purpose to the existing warming house structure. For those who are inclined to nostalgia, Veterans Memorial Park is also the historic location of ice skating within the riverfront park system - NOT Wenonah Park as some have suggested. As for summertime uses of the structure and event rentals, weddings, parties, etc., the Veterans Memorial Park site offers significantly more opportunity for parking and other event-related requirements. The open space within Wenonah Park offers individuals the opportunity to get out of the hustle and bustle of our city. Yes, we have hustle and bustle. Hot sidewalks and sore legs after hours of exploring downtown just like larger metropolitan areas to enjoy the riverfront views - unobstructed. Wenonah Park has but a percentage of the green space Veterans Memorial Park offers. Will people continue to leave the community if the proposed structure is built in Veterans Memorial Park? I think we can all agree that the location of this structure will not be a determining factor in the long term population of our city. The open greenspace is flexible space to allow for a variety of events not just Tall Ships Celebration every three years. Do you remember when the Art Festival was held in Wenonah Park? Vendors were in individual tents spaces according to their own needs. The fireworks festival organizers have used the space in a variety of ways to offer unobstructed viewing of the show and offer vending opportunities. The space has been used in a variety of ways for a variety of events over the years. I appreciate the flexibility that is offered. We cannot ever anticipate every event opportunity and build a structure that will suit the needs of every future event. Open space offers flexibility for future special events. Wenonah Park does not have to be all things to all people. Bay City is blessed with a wonderful collection of parks each with their own personality and purpose. The Master parks plan must balance each strength, weakness, and feature of the parks system as a whole and not try to incorporate each and every feature into each and every park. Build the pavilion. Build according to its original plan - in its larger size. Just build it where the space allows in a space that is currently underutilized in a space that offers an area for parking and more buffer room for noise and privacy in a place sporting enthusiasts associate with athletic opportunities in Bay City in a place that historically offered ice skating opportunities in a place that currently does not offer a beautiful area to hold special events in a place that currently does not offer permanent public restrooms. Build it in Veteran’s Memorial Park.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Recreation and Entertainment</td>
<td>I’m not sure recreation or entertainment is the correct category. I have lived in Bay City for 45 years. I am very impressed with the City and its future. I believe that one day our city will be a destination for many people. But first, we have to address some important issues. We should strive to create a reputation for the city as being friendly to pedestrians and bikers. With all the work being done on the roads, I see nothing done to create bike lanes for people to bike to shop and work. Shoppers who are walking should have paths across the street where cars are required to stop for them. The downtown should become an area friendly to people and not so much for cars.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Recreation and Entertainment</td>
<td>Keep the green space in the park and not a pavilion. Possibly use the grant for a farmer’s market.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Community Identity</td>
<td>As others have already posted, I favor rehabilitation of the band shell and other park facilities as outlined in the previous 3-phase plan. I do not support the placement of a pavilion PLUS its support buildings in Wenonah Park. It is important to preserve and protect the natural green spaces already there keeping them open and unencumbered with permanent commercial facilities - like the proposed pavilion.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Category</td>
<td>Comment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Recreation and Entertainment</td>
<td>I feel the City should provide the requisite easement across their property from the south property line of the Breaker Cove condominiums and extend the RiverWalk along the east side of the Saginaw River south to the Lafayette Street bridge such that there will be a complete loop for walkers and runners from Vet's Bridge to the Lafayette Street bridge. This would help to get the runners form the DOW Family Y off the streets and onto a safe trail route. I also feel a pet friendly drinking fountain should be installed near the current walkway behind Breaker Cove near where the yard hydrant is currently located.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Recreation and Entertainment</td>
<td>Liberty Harbor Marina needs better Wi-Fi so you can actually use the internet to log into work, upgraded hot water in the showers and a washer/dryer for the renters to use.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Community Identity</td>
<td>Liberty Harbor needs a bubbling system similar to what Wheelers has so that debris doesn't pile up on the rocks and near boats.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Community Identity</td>
<td>Leave souvenir park to northeast Little League. The kids and community Coe together to maintain it and it keeps our children doing what they love.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Community Identity</td>
<td>Leave souvenir park to northeast Little League. The kids and community Coe together to maintain it and it keeps our children doing what they love.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Community Identity</td>
<td>Leave souvenir park to northeast Little League. The kids and community Coe together to maintain it and it keeps our children doing what they love.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Community Identity</td>
<td>I believe the city of Bay City should give Sovieron field to northeast Little League. They have maintained the field for many many years. The volunteers work hard to give the youth from the area a safe clean and happy place to play.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Economic Development</td>
<td>The building at 311 Third St formerly SemplinersMW Tux warehouse is a designated Facility with tight use restrictions due to soil contamination. This presents a great opportunity for brownfield and other public funding sources. The building has great character and a flexible structural program. We would love to see it put back into productive use in a way that captures the energy reflected on Third Street across Washington. Many funding sources require the City's Master Plan to specifically discuss these projects in the application process so it should be considered for a target example or other call out. Attached image courtesy of The Bay City Motor Company.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Housing and Neighborhoods</td>
<td>The urban desert left behind when Van Poppelen Brothers closed presents a great opportunity for a new neighborhood of quality homes. Given the proximity to downtown and the existing fabric and demographics of the surrounding neighborhoods the development would ideally be medium density attached two-three story townhouses of classic character quality materials modern floor plans attached garages and front porches. Considering the cost of construction and the economic situation this site's brownfield industrial history may present a great opportunity to seek public funding to put it back into productive use. It will be interesting to see if the housing study supports this as a feasible plan.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Community Identity</td>
<td>Where is the Bay City Chamber of Commerce Offices? And why do I have to ask? Lots of opportunity to pick a visible unused storefront and lead development through presence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Category</td>
<td>Comment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Community Identity</td>
<td>Posting pedestrian alerts downtown to alert visitors of the riverwalk signs are a cheap way to make visitors feel connected. More historical markers with a true guided experience. Tours of historical churches, the museum, and city hall complex. The old library. Bay City used to be the 3rd most important city in Michigan. It's the disavoid home of Madonna. Lots of interesting facts to make visitors feel their trip here was valuable. Experience. And people need to know how to find the lake shore. Its the reason Bay City is here. It's a nice cheap day trip for people with kids and though locals think directions are unnecessary I had an Asian group stop me last year asking what there is to see in Bay City and they had no idea they were so close to one of the world's greatest lakes. A not to be missed tourist experience. Get co funding from the state tourist board.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>Housing and Neighborhoods</td>
<td>Why is this where medium density zoning is at? Shouldn’t it be near downtown where the rents could actually justify building up.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>Economic Development</td>
<td>This street is way too wide and is surrounded by dead pavement despite sitting in the middle of town. Why isn’t there more activity here? Why does the environment around city hall say if you’re not in a car you’re out of place? Very uncomfortable place with roads too wide and fast for a pitance of traffic.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>Community Identity</td>
<td>Bay County. Your buildings and parking lots destroy the value of this part of downtown.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>Connections</td>
<td>Ditch the median lane and put in bike lanes. Southwest Bay City needs love.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>Economic Development</td>
<td>Do we really need that much parking lot. It’s all dead. Almost untaxable space in the most valuable part of town.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>Economic Development</td>
<td>Curious to know how the tax revenue of this bank compares to the block east of it. I think we need more of Midland St not drive thru if we want Bay City to have money.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>General Comment</td>
<td>My opinion regarding Pavilion that is proposed for Wenona Park. The DDA, City Staff and other volunteers created a beautiful and most useful long term plan for the park about 10 years ago. A lot of sound planning, expertise advice and opinions went into this plan. The plan should still be viable today. All needs were considered. It was also a costly plan documented by experts. The pavilion will put a big hole into that plan and probably did not take the long term plan into account. Long term maintenance cost will be necessary. Perhaps vandalism issues will ensue. This big structure will be a hindrance to viewing the fireworks. We need to preserve our green spaces. Parking will be an issue as will interference with the Double Tree’s operation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>General Comment</td>
<td>The Pavilion proposed will block the view of the river. The park is beautiful the way it is.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>General Comment</td>
<td>I am a community volunteer that loves Bay City. Improving bicycle safety and community bike-friendliness should be in the Master Plan. I would like Bay City to adopt Complete Streets to help make our community safer and friendly for non-motorized transportation. When any road work is planned, time should be taken to consider how to safely incorporate Complete Streets. This may be as simple as painting a white stripe on the road and marking a section for bicyclists. Complete Streets plays a vital part for livable communities by designing and constructing roadways to provide appropriate access to all legal users, whether walking, driving, bicycling, or taking public transportation. I suggest looking at what Midland has accomplished since they adopted Complete Streets. Thank you for allowing the opportunity to comment!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Category</td>
<td>Comment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>General Comment</td>
<td>Streets completed with bike lanes would be a major asset to our community. Bike lanes provide a safe and easy access to the Rail Trail and to other destinations. Bike friendly communities will assist in attracting vibrant people to Bay City and contribute to the well being of our citizens. Bike lanes should become an interracial part of our main corridors and certainly be included in all road and street upgrade projects.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>General Comment</td>
<td>Is it possible to view next week’s public meeting on the master planning via the local community television outlet? If so, please publish instructions on how to turn in. If not TV, could web or conference call access be provided for those unable to physically attend due to distance and/or other accessibility difficulty?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>General Comment</td>
<td>Will draft copies of the consultant’s plan be available before next week’s public meeting? If not, is there a scheduled date for availability of draft documents?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td>General Comment</td>
<td>There is a Public Input Open House being scheduled for May 25th in the lower level of City Hall. Because of the open house format, there will be no real meaningful way to capture the event on video. One of the best ways to provide input into the Master Plan for those who cannot attend the open house will be to add comments to this map.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>General Comment</td>
<td>We need to take advantage of our riverfront to make Bay City a destination for a weekend or longer. A pavilion will not bring visitors to town. Please give up on building the pavilion on the East side of the river and build it on the West side if you feel you must have one. We need to think about getting the campers from State Park (usually at capacity) to visit our downtown area (or is it uptown now). Think about a semi-permanent ‘craft lane’; or ‘arts in the park’; possibly including antique booths and a couple kids’ booths (toys, face painting, quick crafts, etc.) and maybe a small carnival ride or two that runs all summer along the eastern shore of the river. These booths can easily be packed away for other events (tall ships, river roar) when needed but however they can run daily during the summer for us and our visitors. Make some rules for the booths and their wares so that it works with the desired plan (not a 2nd flea market). We could even have a limited number of licensed food vendors set up long the river. Take a nice lunch break along the river or go up the street a block or two to one of our many restaurants. I think the Wenona Princess and other tour boats would also be available for our guests in town. I’m pretty sure even our employees from Dow Corning (who have many global visitors every week), Chemical Bank and other businesses on the riverfront would use the park and its services, then they will promote it to their friends and families as well. This is only one idea but we have to use what we got here, which is a beautiful waterfront that we need to utilize to its full potential.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
<td>General Comment</td>
<td>I am a downtown business owner, and as many businesses have been surprising up not only for Tall Ships celebration but because they are wanting to be involved in improving the image of downtown. It has really begun to draw more and more people in. As the Vets Bridge is basically the gateway for downtown, and with Double Tree, the current renovating of the Palms Hotel, and also now the beautiful Uptown Development, it has begun to feel very welcoming. Has there been any talk if FP Horak will be doing anything with there building and parking lot? I have heard several comments of the eye sore and/or lack of upkeep on the building. You can see the mint green paint coming through since the grey is peeling. Fully understandable that it is a privately held company so there maybe no enforcement that could happen but just wasn’t sure if anyone has heard any comment from them. Also, the Pavilion idea is a great concept and a year around attraction that I really think will improve the visual space in the park. The green space that would be utilized by this great addition is very minimal, and wouldn’t impact the green space of the park.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Category</td>
<td>Comment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
<td>General Comment</td>
<td>With all the new housing and offices being developed downtown/uptown, I was investigating the possibility of turning one of our large vacant warehouses into self-serve storage. However, the Zoning Ordinance only allows the use by right in M-2 (Heavy Industrial) and by Special Use permit in M-1 (Light Industrial). The intensity of the use certainly seems like it would be consistent with C-3 and there are empty buildings suitable for it in the C-3 district. Modern designs of climate-controlled self-storage facilities are more like retail/service businesses than manufacturing ones. See the UrbanStorage link below. Having that available downtown would make the city center more functional, and walkable, for downtown residents. A zoning ordinance amendment should definitely be considered to allow self-serve storage in areas other than the manufacturing districts.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix C
Open House Results
STATION 1: COMMUNITY IDENTITY

People

• Friendly. Passionate. Authentic.
• Organizations and volunteer groups. Everywhere I go I see friends. Friendly and fun. Lots of opportunity to be active.
• Friendly, open, easy to approach.
• The mix of generations. Friendly and caring.
• Everyone in Bay City is so friendly I would not live anywhere else!!

Places

• Downtown. Uptown. Midland Street. All the great restaurants and taverns. Events all year long. State theater.
• Johnson Street. Business – including Coonan’s hair studio. Architecture and history of the community. Nearby family and house to rehab.
• Downtown locally owned unique shops and restaurants. Festivals, events year round.
• Rail trails. Saginaw bay. Great restaurants.
• Theater, music: have been very important for our family. Appreciate several performance venues. Wenonah park, state theater, high school venues. Love architecture and history.

Things

• Maintain open lawn areas at Wenonah Park. Traverse City would never tolerate construction in an open space West Bay of a pavilion, garage for maintenance equipment, concession stand, skate rental facility, warming house, lavatories, ect. Wenonah Park is Bay City’s open space.
## STATION 2: HOUSING & NEIGHBORHOODS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Multiple Family Residential</th>
<th>VOTES: 20</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Single Family Detached Residential</td>
<td>VOTES: 11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed Use</td>
<td>VOTES: 15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single Family Attached Residential</td>
<td>VOTES: 19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## STATION 3: CONNECTIONS

Identify areas on the map where you believe there is a missing connection or missing transportation facility

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Comment Number</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>No sidewalks here At Handy Middle School And none on the Bangor side either</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>All sidewalks need to be handicap accessible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Main roads should have share the road lanes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>More safe connections to the rail trail by bike and foot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Downtown and Midland Street district needs to be bike friendly share the roads</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Add stairways updown off southwest side of Vets Bridges and northeast side</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>It is so hard to bike to State Park because of all the driveways and unfinished sections of sidewalk on Wilder</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Need better connection to Bay City State Recreation Area - bike trails benches City beautiful theme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Getting across Wilder is treacherous here but the trail in Bangor Township is fabulous</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Major entry way into City from Essexville and Water Street is deplorable Highly trafficked thoroughfare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>There's a scary section of the railroad behind Landaal Fix it</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Water trolley at 3rd Street connections Midland Street bards with the East Side</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>This is a scary spot on the trail under the bridge Needs lighting and surveillance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>To make City more pedestrian friendly make foot bridge next to Liberty bridge to facilitate this</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Connect new with old</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Connect downtown and uptown via street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Alley never taken care of Pot holes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Restore stop light to intersection at Center and Washington</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Clean up and light the walk areas under the bridges for safe foot and bike traffic x2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Bike lanes safer streets slower traffic throughout the City</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>The traffic light at 3rd and Lincoln is no longer necessary Convert it to a 4-way stop like at Lincoln and McKinley where it works so well</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>M-15 terminates here at M-25Center Ave It should be extended across Trumbull Street across the Independence Bridge Wilder Bridge all the way to I-75 intersection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Traffic light</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>City Barn on Water Street TOTALLY ruins my daily bridge runs Move it</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Put a light at Evergreen and Middle Grounds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment Number</td>
<td>Comment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>East side Riverwalk should be extended from South boundary of Breakers Cove condo to Lafayette Street which provides access to Middle Grounds. This of course anticipates removal of City Garage and Electric Co facilities along that section of the East river bank.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Add pedestrian access at Lafayette bridge.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Honestly I can get anywhere in the City on foot or bike today.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>CRASH The sidewalk stops DEAD on Johnson at the Hampton Twp line.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Build a bridge for the trail right here.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Run the trail north on the Middle Ground.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Don't get rid of light at Broadway and Cass. Needed for pedestrian crossing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Connect the new Saginaw-Bay City trail via Hotchkiss over the west channel.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
MiCOMMUNITY REMARKS
OPEN HOUSE CONNECTIONS
City of Bay City
Bay County

Carlisle/Wortman Associates
Source: ESRI, Bay County
6-21-17
STATION 4: ENVIRONMENTAL RESILIENCY

Emergency response system

- Alert systems
- Personnel training (i.e. police, hospital staff, governmental staff, etc.)
- General training for residents
- VOTES: 13

Identify and mitigate (if possible) risk areas

- Homes/properties in floodplains/floodways
- Known infrastructure deficiencies
- Existing problem areas (natural and manmade)
- VOTES: 3

Traditional stormwater infrastructure

- Separate wastewater and stormwater systems
- Create additional stormwater retention facilities
- VOTES: 16

Green infrastructure

- Provide incentives for businesses/homeowners to use rain barrels, rain gardens, green roofs, etc.
- Prepare educational materials
- Strategically purchase vacant properties for conversion to green infrastructure
- VOTES: 44.
Create emergency preparedness educational material

- What kind of items should be included
- Flood/general insurance information
- Evacuation routes and preparation
- Emergency supply requirements
- Emergency alert notification
- Risk data for various emergency types (tornadoes, floods, heat events, blizzards, etc.)

- VOTES: 8.

Protect open space

- Maintain existing parks and natural areas within the city
- Support regional preservation efforts

- VOTES: 50.

Additional Comments:

- Better signage and increased PI on the need to pick up after dogs.
- Please add pavilion to Veterans Park instead of Wenonah Park. More space there. Leaves green space at Wenonah. Combine the sledding and ice skating like use to add locker rooms to rink too. Keep it free other than specific events.
1. The decision to locate or expand a business in Bay City is an investment decision based upon an assessment of the potential return or reward.

Do you believe that Bay City presents itself as an inviting investment environment?

- No – Not at all. No incentives. Any attempt to better the area meets a ridiculous amount of opposition. Community is not properly informed about policy and few incentives.
- No – Too much incentive/focus on manufacturing. Need to grow entrepreneur.
- No – Not enough investment in public infrastructure. No cohesive effort ie: supporting businesses among way too many government units. Civil servants who don’t understand or don’t care about the negative consequences of their actions. Antiquated zoning laws, regulations.
- No – Aging infrastructure, especially roads, sidewalks, street lighting. High property taxes. No/low inventory of nice quality middle class housing, including rentals.
- No – To be attractive the investor has to be able to see a profit potential. It is not only hard to find potential, it is harder to find the profits to warrant the investment. If you can’t see a clear way to profits, why invest? Very very few profitable investment opportunities here.
- Yes – East to work with. A lot of opportunities.
- Yes – While not perfect, the quality of the City, the diversity of things to do are amazing.
- Yes – Traffic flow, traffic count.
- Yes – Bay City has a viable downtown including growing residential presence and attractive riverfront – low crime environment.
- Yes – because we have a great work force here.
- Yes – Bay City’s growing development shows a willingness of local government to work with business owners.
2. A workforce that has the skill training and education needed for particular industry can be attractive to industries including everything from manufacturing to information based companies.

Do you believe Bay City has an attractive workforce to industry that might want to locate here?

- No – Many of our residents are under educated. Many cannot pass a drug test. Many are disabled or elderly.
- No – The education system needs to prepare our youth for the jobs of tomorrow!
- No – No sense of progress. Status quo – stay the same.
- No – Lack of workforce and communication
- No – Low public school ratings are a deterrent.
- No – Aging population is low-tech and antiquated, youth are leaving for bigger cities with more jobs.
- No – Bay City has tons of unemployment factory workers knowledgeable in heavy metal manufacturing. Those jobs have left. They are also older and probably untrainable. They are ones with talent more away, especially if they got a college degree since the jobs they know how to do are not here for them.
- No – Not yet, but new initiatives are beginning to address that.
- Yes – Bay City has diversified population from skilled trades to professional disciplines. Also education and training institutions including Delta community college and SVSU.
- Yes – With much room to improve. Our authenticity and hard work ethic fits a wide variety of businesses.
- Yes – With local colleges and universities along with apprentice programs in the local unions we have an up and coming work force as well as seasoned workers.
- Yes – With SVSU and Delta. We have a great workforce.
- Yes – Great education here and training.
3. Highly skilled workers with higher education often tend to make decisions about where to locate not based solely on where jobs might be, but more and more based on the quality of life in a community. Do you believe that Bay City offers or can offer the kinds of amenities the highly sought after workforce desires?

- No – Bay City has a lot to offer and is a safe community but the housing stock is very poor and does not attract people here.
- No – The housing inventory lacks high quality options for middle-upper income home owners and no good rental options.
- No – Sidewalks, streets, schools, public art.
- No – The amenities are great. The jobs are lacking. The good amenities are the waterfront, the historic homes, the charming downtown, the bar district for kids (west side) and the bar district for adults (east side). Uptown is attractive and adding another layer of class to the city.
- Yes – The attractive living conditions to keep them. In Indiana they had a major brain drain. So only the unskilled were left. Low pay and low living conditions. Keep and improve parks, businesses, programs for kids/teens, and such. Build a paradise on Earth and they will come.
- Yes – Seek more universities to establish a presence and/or sat. campus here.
- Yes – Reasonably priced quality residential facilities: apartments, condominiums, single family homes. High quality and extensive park system and recreational facilities, attractive accessible riverfront.
- Yes – Green space, recreation, land and water, fun events, community is small enough that you run into people you know and big enough to offer lots of activities.
- Yes – Our downtown and uptown restaurants, walking a bike trails, state park and water activities. And gyms!
- Yes – Out variety of events and venues are already attracting people who work in the entire great lakes region.
- Yes – Family friendly activities, entertainment.
- Yes – We are seeing it in the young entrepreneurs starting businesses in Downtown in particular. They love the small town feel and the options of recreation and entertainment and the river, the bay.
- Yes – Bay City has a wide variety of historical, architectural, cultural offerings that appeal to many without the traffic woes that plague larger communities.
- Yes – Uptown and downtown have good energy. Riverwalk and rail-trail and parks are a huge asset.
- Yes – Walk ability, neighborhood safety, historic – varied neighborhoods.
4. Existing buildings in the downtown and older commercial districts within the City have a form that includes multiple stories, a mixture of uses and convey a certain character. There are 88 vacant parcels within the cities commercial and business districts. These areas represent development potential for the City.

When vacant parcels in the Downtown area become developed would you (1) like to see buildings that mimic the form of the existing buildings in the area in terms of height size and architectural style or (2) do you think the City should allow for single story buildings that look and function more like buildings in the suburban areas of town.

- 1 – Building in the downtown area and the Midland street district should mimic what is currently there to preserve the brand of the area.
- 1 – Would like to keep with the current architecture, keeps the downtown consistent, looks better.
- 1 – City and downtown should follow form based code.
- 1 – Yes, identity is important unfortunately, the City does not realize that their strict regulations does not promote growth.
- 1 – We must continue to celebrate our heritage. How we look and work.
- 1 – The density of occupants creates the potential for a 24-7 synergy between businesses and residents that can benefit both.
- 1 – Bay City has a rich architectural history. It is part of our culture and should be respected, preserved, and protected. When filler buildings are constructed they detract from the whole.
- 1 – Offer incentives to improve and renovate existing buildings. Renovate existing count market.
- 1 – Save our downtown building where we can.
- 1 – Build replacement buildings that look similar to the older established classier styles. One story suburban stuff has no business being allowed in the vacant lots. Block that from happening.
- 1 – Dynamic cities have diversified architecture representing successive eras of the community’s development. The Phoenix building (over 100 years old) and the modernistic Delta Planetarium both have their place. Bay City is not Frankenmuth where a specific architecture style is mandated.
- 1 – Keep the downtown as our identity. No more cement block buildings painted yellow as an example.
- 1 – Those buildings define who and what we are.
- 1 – Keep the look. It is a bit of the city’s past and it is tourist bait. Back in Indiana, the only tourists we got were the few people interested in older buildings. It grabs the interest and holds it.
- 2 – Stay with residential on top and commercial on bottom.
- 2 – If the single story is already in place it should stay however if it is new build it should be similar to the original landscape of the area.
5. Do you have other comments such as what economic barriers you feel face the City of Bay City or anything else related to economic development?

- With reduced state financial challenges we and other communities see the importance of work together but not easy here.
- Make downtown a priority!
- Current zoning and building codes are at odds with or frustrate creative and desirable reinvestment in historic structures.
- Infrastructure investments are highly overdue (especially streets, sidewalks, lighting). Preservation and restoration of historic structures large and small need to be encouraged to preserve the character of Bay City.
- Business districts to work together improve preserve county market.
- Massive lack of entrepreneurs and lack of any support system of significance, even though the small efforts here are touted as being heroic. Local banks are very reluctant to lend to start-ups and joining ventures, preforming to ship their money to outside markets where they can make more return in safer environments. School systems (especially teachers) dishonors business and enterprise and focuses on building workers not entrepreneurs.
- The general political establishment is insufficiently supportive of business development persistent union domination of local political bodies is detrimental to private business operation and growth.
What’s in Bay City that you love?

- Downtown and uptown/commercial and residential development resulting in a vibrant city center. River related events.
- State theatre. Free concerts. River and parks. Tall ships.
- Keep the green space in Wenonah parks – no pavilion. Rail trail. Open space parks. Pocket parks and plantings. Trees. Vibrant downtown and clean!
- We have the best summer festivities. But what happens in the winter? Promote some winter functions for family.
- Wenonah park which has become a central gathering space – the park should be kept open and not closed in with structures (pavilion ect.).
- Recreation. Cost of things is low.
What’s missing from Bay City?

- The churches are emptying out. That ought to tell you something.
- Provision needs to be made to dock Bay City boat lines vessels at a downtown Bay City dock at flood.
- More Polish cultural. More to do besides bars at 10pm or later.
- Preserve our architecture.
- We need a fishing pier out in Saginaw Bay. Greater access to the shoreline and more beach! Improve tie in from Bay City to Bay City state park!
- More family friendly activities in downtown Bay City.
- Ice skating pavilion and bathrooms, lockers at Veterans parks to go with sledding. More bike lanes around town. Indoor swimming that is city owned so doesn’t cost too much.
- A clean well maintained swimmable state park!
- More public tennis and basketball courts on west side.
- East side grocery and pharmacy near downtown.
- More public art. Comprehensive plan to lead a “collective” vision. Thai restaurant.
- Access to the river for kayaks/canoes needs a dozen more sites in the City.
- A quality school system is missing. It’s letting us down and few people realize or care. Support for new business enterprises is very very low. Bank lending is not helpful.
- Saginaw Bay. Pier for fish and view of bay.
- Condos on the Saginaw Bay.
- Pavilion. Ice skating. People that walk. Open minds.
- Bike rental. Bike trail from Riverwalk eastside down Columbus to rail trail. Downtown pavilion.
- Piddle ball courts (could dual purpose tennis courts). Rail trail connections to Midland and Saginaw (as planned)
- Grocery store. Drug store. 5+10 Store.
- A united year round farmers market with hours for the working folks.

Where else do you go for fun?

- Traverse. Detroit
- Some place to eat after 10:00pm. So don’t have to go to Saginaw. More festivals
  - Amen! Nothing for those getting off second shift. (To comment about someplace to eat after 10pm)
- Ann Arbor.
Appendix D
Maps
TARGET INVESTMENT FOCUS AREAS
City of Bay City
Bay County

Primary Investment Areas
Secondary Investment Areas
Fringe Investment Areas

Carlisle/Wortman Associates
Source: ESRI, Bay County, SEMCOG
12-6-16
ROAD CLASSIFICATION

City of Bay City
Bay County

Carlisle/Wortman Associates
Source: ESRI, Bay County, SEMCOG
10-4-16
NON-MOTORIZED
City of Bay City
Bay County

Carlisle/Wortman Associates
Source: ESRI, Bay County, SEMCOG 10-10-16

CONTEXT:
Connections, Page 11
Recreation & Entertainment, Page 10
CORRIDOR PLAN
City of Bay City
Bay County

Carlisle/Wortman Associates
Source: ESRI, Bay County, SEMCOG
11-9-16

CONTEXT:
Connections
Page 14
Potential Flood Impact Areas

City of Bay City
Bay County

Carlisle/Wortman Associates
Source: ESRI, Bay County, SEMCOG
12-21-16
TRAIL, RECREATION, & ENTERTAINMENT FACILITIES

City of Bay City
Bay County

Carlisle/Wortman Associates
Source: ESRI, Bay County, SEMCOG
10-18-16

Context:
Recreation & Entertainment
Page 7
REGIONAL RECREATION & TRAIL FACILITIES

City of Bay City
Bay County

Carlisle/Wortman Associates
Source: ESRI, Bay County, SEMCOG
12-13-16

CONTEX T:
Recreation & Entertainment
Page 11